ARCTOS

Acta Philologica Fennica

VOL. LI

VERTAISARVIOITU
KOLLEGIALT GRANSKAD
PEER-REVIEWED
www.tsv.fi/tunnus

HELSINKI 2017

INDEX

VERTAISARVIOITU
KOLLEGIALT GRANSKAD
PEER-REVIEWED
www.tsv.fi/tunnus

Arctos 51 (2017) 63–88

PALLASNE EXURERE CLASSEM: MINERVA IN THE *AENEID*

Lee Fratantuono

The goddess Minerva is a key figure in the theology of Virgil's *Aeneid*, though there has been relatively little written to explicate all of the scenes in the epic in which she plays a part or receives a reference.[1] The present study seeks to provide a commentary on every mention of Pallas Athena/Minerva in Virgil's poetic corpus, with the intention of illustrating how the goddess plays a crucial role in the unfolding drama of the transition from a Trojan to an Italian identity for the future Rome, and in particular how the Volscian heroine Camilla serves as a mortal incarnation of the Minerva who was a patroness of battles and the military arts. Lastly, we shall consider the possibility that the goddess may be of crucial importance for an understanding of the final episodes of the epic, in particular Aeneas' decision to slay the Rutulian Turnus. We shall see that this key figure in the Capitoline Triad was of great significance to Virgil in his poetic conception of the founding of Rome and its Augustan reinvention and rebirth.

There are three references to Pallas Athena/Minerva in the *Eclogues* and *Georgics*, one in the former work and two in the latter.[2] The references are neat-

[1] The bibliography is perhaps surprisingly brief; cf. especially C. Bailey, *Religion in Virgil*, Oxford 1935, 152–157; E. Henry, *The Vigour of Prophecy: A Study of Vergil's Aeneid*, Carbondale 1989, 90–117; also M. P. Wilhelm, "Minerva in the *Aeneid*", in R. M. Wilhelm and H. Jones, eds., *The Two Worlds of the Poet: New Perspectives on Vergil*, Detroit 1992, 74–81.

[2] For helpful overview of the onomastic problems posed by the goddess (Athena? Pallas? Tritogeneia? Atrytone?), cf. T. Gantz, *Early Greek Myth: A Guide to Literary and Artistic Sources*, Baltimore – London 1993, 84. Ps.-Apollodorus records the stories that the goddess killed a playmate named Pallas, a daughter of Triton (cf. such stories as Penthesilea's accidental slaying of her sister Hippolyta); also that Pallas was a giant (cf. the goddess' association in the *Aeneid* with evocations of the gigantomachy on Aeneas' divine shield). For the earliest citation of the name Pallas without

ly balanced; the first and third refer to Pallas, the second to Minerva.[3] The first of these Virgilian appearances of the goddess comes at *Eclogue* 2,60–62 … *habitarunt di quoque silvas* / *Dardaniusque Paris. Pallas quas condidit arces* / *ipsa colat; nobis placeant ante omnia silvae*.[4] The unrequited lover Corydon reflects on the fact that there are gods in the forest, and indeed also the Trojan Paris: let Pallas Athena, he argues, hold the citadel (i.e., of Athens) that she founded.[5] The passage is richly evocative of the problem of the public *versus* the private, and of the matter of the building of cities and establishment of new political entities.[6] Troy lore is also prominent in the passing allusion to the goddess; Pallas Athena was one of the goddesses who participated in the celebrated Judgment of Paris – and the Trojan prince is here named as one of those who dwell in sylvan haunts. Pallas is a goddess of the urban sphere, of the world of city and civilization; Paris and the unspecified gods of the forest are set up in contrast to the goddess of wisdom, craft, and battle. Corydon offers something of a dismissal of the goddess of city culture and Athenian urbanization; the contrast between Trojan and Greek imagery is also marked. The first mention of the goddess in the works of Virgil implicitly highlights the goddess in opposition to Paris' Troy.

Minerva takes her place, too, in the miniature catalogue of deities to whom Virgil makes his invocation at the start of the second *Georgic*: … *oleaeque Minerva* / *inventrix* (1,18–19).[7] Here the goddess is identified as the inventor of the olive; the reference both to her and, later, to her gift is quite fleeting.[8] Here Minerva is celebrated for another civilizing function – the bestowal

---

Athena, cf. the *Homeric Hymn to Demeter*, 424.

[3] For the names of the goddess, cf. J.-L. Girard, "Minerva", in *EV* III, 532–534: "V. menziona questa dea sia con il nome proprio…sia con appellativi che provano un'identificazione con l'omologa greca Atena…una volta V. usa l'aggettivo *Palladius*" (532).

[4] All quotations from Virgil are taken from R.A.B. Mynors, *P. Vergili Maronis Opera*, Oxford 1969 (corrected reprint, 1972).

[5] "La dea Pallade Atena, collegata al culto cittadino (in particolare di Atene)…il suo simulacro, il Palladio, gioca un ruolo fondamentale nella leggenda di Enea nel Lazio e, quindi, della fondazione di Roma…" (A. Cucchiarelli, *Publio Virgilio Marone: Le Bucoliche*, Roma 2012, 197).

[6] On *condidit arces*, W. Clausen comments: "V.'s variation of *urbem condere*" (*Virgil: Eclogues*, Oxford 1994, *ad loc*.).

[7] "Minerva: Die attische Athene. In Rom war sie mit Iupiter und Iuno Mitgleid der Kapitolinischen Trias…" (M. Erren, *P. Vergilius Maro: Georgica, Band 2: Kommentar*, Heidelberg 2003, *ad loc*.).

[8] "The inventor of the olive gets three words; her product fares little better (2,420–5n.)" (R. Thomas,

of the gift of the olive and its oil, as the poet prepares to celebrate the rural life of agriculture and the works of the field. Civilization and its boons are the preserve of the goddess of arts and culture.

The same association of the goddess with the olive occurs at *Georgic* 2,180–181 *tenuis ubi argilla et dumosis calculus arvis*, / *Palladia gaudent silva vivacis oleae*, where difficult soil and terrain is said to rejoice in the "Palladian wood of the long-lived olive". The appellation *Palladia silva* of the second georgic harks back to the image from the second eclogue; Pallas/Minerva is a complicated goddess of diverse functions and areas of influence; she is, after all, a sort of forest goddess (at least insofar as the olive is a tree) – but one who is inextricably linked to such civilizing influences as the olive. Not surprisingly, both references to Minerva in the *Georgics* come in connection to the tree that was most especially associated with her rule.

We glean, then, a limited yet richly textured image of Pallas/Minerva from these brief allusions; noteworthy in the Virgilian presentation of Athena in his earlier works is the implicit opposition of the goddess to the Trojan Paris (who, of course, voted against her in the fateful Judgment). That vote alone was enough to doom the Trojans in the estimation of both Juno and Pallas; the victor in the Judgment, too, stands in opposition to the virginal goddess of battle and the traditional household arts of a Roman *univira*.[9]

Indeed, the Judgment of Paris is prominently cited as the first cause of the anger of the goddess Juno near the opening of the epic *Aeneid*, as Virgil considers the reasons for the ill fortune of the Trojans at the hands of the sister and wife of Jupiter (1,26–27). Juno reflects that Pallas was allowed to destroy Ajax, the son of Oileus, because of his guilt and furious madness: … *Pallasne exurere classem* / *Argivum atque ipsos potuit submergere ponto* / *unius ob noxam et furias Aiacis Oilei*? (1,39–41).[10] First there was Juno, and then there was Minerva; the first three deities cited in the *Aeneid* are the members of the Capitoline

Virgil: Georgics, Volume I, Books I–II, Cambridge 1988, *ad loc*.).

[9] The virginity of Athena is attested from an early date; cf. the *Homeric Hymn to Aphrodite* 7 ff., where Athena is linked with Artemis and Hestia in this regard. Athena and Artemis were also associated with the companionship of Persephone before her abduction (*Homeric Hymn to Demeter*, 415 ff.).

[10] "…the violation of Cassandra by the Locrian Ajax, son of Oileus, at Athena's temple was a tradition of the epic cycle, and was the subject of many vase-paintings…" (R. G. Austin, *P. Vergili Maronis Aeneidos Liber Primus*, Oxford 1971, *ad* 41).

Triad.[11] And Minerva was able to execute her wish for vengeance against a sacrilegious Greek who dared to violate and defile her sacred precinct.[12] The Palladian killing of the Lesser Ajax is the first violent act of murder and slaughter in the long course of Virgil's epic; in some sense the end of the poem will bring something of a reminiscence of this divine act of vengeance.

The first appearance of Pallas/Minerva in the *Aeneid* stands in striking contrast to the depiction of the goddess in the *Eclogues* and *Georgics*. Here we find an image of vengeance and violent destruction; Juno describes in vivid detail how Pallas used Jovian lightning to strike and impale Ajax on a rock (1,42–45).[13] Juno is a patroness of the Greeks, a goddess consumed with anger at the Trojans; Pallas is depicted as having slain a Greek hero who had assaulted and violated a Trojan girl in a temple precinct.[14]

Virgil thus accords a prominent place to the battle goddess near the start of his epic; she is intimately associated with Jupiter, whose lightning weapon she wields – and, implicitly, with Juno[15] (who cites her as an *exemplum* of a Jovian goddess who is capable of seeking revenge for wrongs and slights).[16] Pallas' killing of Ajax was part of her general attack on the Greek fleet; again, the goddess favored the Greeks in their assault on Troy, but the desecration of

---

[11] Juno appears first at 1,15; Pallas at 39; Jupiter is referenced at 42. Of course if the controversial "ille ego" lines were genuine, then Mars is the first god mentioned in the epic.

[12] "Elle se remémore alors, pour augmenter sa confusion, la vengeance tirée par Pallas d'Ajax, fils d'Oïlée et cette fois la peint ses couleurs les plus propres à la rendre blessante par le contraste… Pallas, quel privilège!" (A. Cartault, *L'Art de Virgile dans l'Enéide*, Paris 1926, 97).

[13] On the Virgilian adaptation of Homeric lore, etc., see G. Highet, *The Speeches in Vergil's Aeneid*, Princeton 1972, 266–267.

[14] For the evidence of Proclus' *testimonia* for the story, see M. L. West, *Greek Epic Fragments*, Cambridge, Massachusetts 2003, 146–147, 154–155; Ajax apparently tried to seize not only the girl, but also a sacred image of the goddess – for which the Greeks sought to stone him (recognizing as they did the sacrilege). Ajax was saved from death by seeking refuge at the altar of Athena; only later (while *en route* home) would the goddess see to his punishment.

[15] Cf. here V. Panoussi, *Vergil's Aeneid and Greek Tragedy: Ritual, Empire, and Intertext*, Cambridge 2009, 109–112.

[16] And, too, the actions of the Lesser Ajax were so outrageous that not even the Greeks sought to excuse their fellow warrior; in Athena's destruction of the hero we see something of a military style punishment for malefaction.

her temple instigated extreme measures of retaliation and revenge.[17] One might question the legitimacy of the extent of her rage and anger in terms of its consequences for Greeks other than the culpable Ajax – but Virgil will return again and again to the violent image of how Ajax violated the goddess' sacred precinct and Cassandra.

The goddess also figures in the illustrations on the walls of Dido's temple to Juno in Carthage; the subject of the pictures there is nothing less than the events surrounding the eventual fall of Troy.[18] The women of Troy are depicted as bringing offerings to the goddess Pallas;[19] she, for her part, ignores their plight and petition: 1,479–482 *interea ad templum non aequae Palladis ibant* / *crinibus Iliades passis peplumque ferebant* / *suppliciter, tristes et tunsae pectora palmis*; / *diva solo fixos oculos aversa tenebat*.[20] Here the goddess is portrayed as unwilling to aid the Trojan cause, despite the heartfelt prayer of the women and the presentation of the *peplos*;[21] she stands aloof from their entreaties, and she would appear to be indifferent to their sufferings.[22] The description *non*

---

[17] For the wrecking of the Greek fleet, cf. the Homeric citations collected by S. Casali in his entry on "Ajax" (*VE* I, 46): *Odyssey* 1,326–327; 3,130–198; 3,254–312; 4,351–586).

[18] She is, in fact, the only goddess (or god, for that matter) cited as being among the illustrations; the catalogue of picture descriptions closes with the Amazon Penthesilea, who has affinities to the Volscian Camilla who closes the catalogue of Italian heroes at the end of Book 7 (and who also has Minervan associations); cf. W. P. Basson, *Pivotal Catalogues in the Aeneid*, Amsterdam 1975, 152–155. The image of the women in supplication will be repeated, then, later in the poem (as the *Iliad* and world of the epic cycle is reborn in Italy); the outcome of the invocation to the goddess there will be rather different.

[19] On the Penthesilean prefigurement of Camilla, see especially K. W. Gransden, *Virgil's Iliad: An Essay on Epic Narrative*, Cambridge 1984, 183–184.

[20] For the Homeric intertext, see especially B. Graziosi and J. Haubold, eds., *Homer, Iliad Book VI*, Cambridge 2010, *ad* 286–311. The averted gaze of the goddess is recalled at 6,465–471, as Dido is depicted in the underworld as virtually ignoring Aeneas' entreaties; see further M. C. J. Putnam, *Virgil's Aeneid: Interpretation and Influence*, Chapel Hill 1995, 213–214.

[21] A rare reference to the sacred garment in Latin poetry; cf. Plautus, *Mercator* 67 (with Enk's commentary notes *ad loc*.). Austin (above n. 10) observes that in Homer, the *peplos* described as part of the Trojan supplication of the goddess was woven by Phoenician women, and that Virgil may thus have special purpose in having the present image adorn Dido's temple to Juno.

[22] On the connection of the images on the temple walls to the later travails of the war in Italy, see J. D. Reed, *Virgil's Gaze: Nation and Poetry in the Aeneid*, Princeton 2007, 47.

aequae is especially interesting; Pallas is presented as unfair to the Trojans and as being unfavorably disposed toward them.

From the start, then, the goddess is presented as both capable of violence and averse to the Trojan cause; soon enough she is associated with the final destruction of Priam's city.

Indeed, Pallas is the first immortal cited by the Trojan hero Aeneas in his long retelling of the events surrounding the fall of Troy and the journey of the Trojan exiles from Pergamum to North Africa. The reference this time is equestrian; the infamous Wooden Horse of the Greeks was crafted by the divine art of the goddess: 2,15–16 *instar montis equum divina Palladis arte / aedificant*.[23] The equivocation of Pallas and Minerva is made soon thereafter: 2,31 *pars stupet innuptae donum exitiale Minervae*, where emphasis is placed on the goddess' virginal status, and the fatal nature of her equine trick.[24] The notion of the Minervan gift is repeated at 2,198 *nam si vestra manus violasset dona Minervae*, the protasis of the contrafactual warning given by Sinon to the Trojans about the Wooden Horse. Pallas is introduced in Book 2 and in Aeneas' narrative as a goddess associated with horses, in this case the most important horse in Trojan history; in the second to last book of the epic, the horse will take on central importance in the great narrative of the cavalry battle before the walls of the Latin capital.

The signal role of Pallas in supporting the Greek cause is cited also at the start of Sinon's speech to the Trojans: 2,162–163 *omnis spes Danaum et coepti fiducia belli / Palladis auxiliis semper stetit*.[25] Sinon's address is of course replete with mendacious elements that are designed to trick the Trojans; he pro-

---

[23] For the Homeric, Euripidean, and Quintan references to the part played by Pallas Athena in the drama of the horse, see R. G. Austin, *P. Vergili Maronis Aeneidos Liber Secundus*, Oxford 1964, *ad loc*. "Spicca la complicità di Atena: *divina Palladis arte*. Virgilio conosce bene la versione omerica…" (G. Scafoglio, *Noctes Vergilianae: Ricerche di filologia e critica letteraria sull'Eneide*, Spudasmata Band 135, Zürich – New York 2010, 81).

[24] On the genitive *innuptae … Minervae* see especially N. Horsfall, *Virgil, Aeneid 2, A Commentary*, Leiden – Boston 2008, *ad loc*. The question of whether it is to be taken subjectively or objectively does not alter the meaning in any appreciable way, since the two possibilities are not mutually exclusive; the horse was crafted by the divine art of the goddess, and it may well have been offered as an alleged gift for the goddess in expiation of the violation of her temple.

[25] "Though venerated by the Trojans in Hom., Athena was no good friend to them…" (Horsfall, above n. 24, *ad loc*.).

ceeds at once to describe the theft of the Palladium by Odysseus and Diomedes – and Odysseus is referred to as the *scelerum … inventor*, the "inventor of crimes" – language that recalls the description of Minerva as the inventor of the olive. The Palladium was an image of the war goddess, the preservation and salvation of which was inextricably associated with the safety of the city.[26] Sinon relates how the theft of the Palladium incurred the wrath of the goddess against the Greeks; soon "Tritonia" gives clear enough signs of her anger by means of dire portents (2,171 *nec dubiis ea signa dedit Tritonia monstris*).[27]

"Tritonia" introduces a third appellation for the goddess after Pallas and Minerva; she is now perhaps linked to the sea god Triton and the powers of the deep.[28] The etymology of the name remains in dispute and of uncertain derivation;[29] the dire nature of the goddess' portentous signs is not in doubt. Flames and perspiration alike are emitted by the statue; three times the goddess herself is said to have flashed forth in terrible epiphany.[30] The story is an elaborately constructed ruse, a verbal game to match the craftsmanship of the horse; the seer Calchas is said to have declared that the equine "gift" should be set up as a means of expiation for the sacrilege of the stolen Palladium (2,183–184 *hanc pro Palladio moniti, pro numine laeso* / *effigiem statuere, nefas quae triste pararet*).[31]

---

[26] See both Austin (above n. 23) and Horsfall (above n. 24) *ad loc*. for the history and citations of the image; the Diomedes who is referenced in the second book of the epic will reappear in the second to last.

[27] For parallels between the goddess of the Palladium scene and other passages in the epic, cf. M. C. J. Putnam, *Virgil's Epic Designs: Ekphrasis in the Aeneid*, New Haven, Connecticut 1998, 46–48. For the possible connection between the horse and the gifts brought to Dido by the disguised Cupid in Book 1, see S. Frangoulidis, "Duplicity and Gift-Offerings in Vergil's *Aeneid* 1 and 2", *Vergilius* 38 (1992) 26–37.

[28] "An impressive epic fossil" (N. Horsfall, *Virgil, Aeneid 11, A Commentary*, Leiden – Boston 2003, *ad* 11,483). The name may connect to a Neptunian genealogy for the goddess.

[29] Cf. J. J. O'Hara, *True Names: Vergil and the Alexandrian Tradition of Etymological Wordplay*, Ann Arbor 1996, 29, 32; M. L. West, *Hesiod Theogony*, Oxford 1966, *ad* 895.

[30] The name Tritonia may be taken in reference to the celebrated Lake Tritonis in North Africa, a locus that was significant in Argonautic lore.

[31] "In Sinon's current story, the TH is presented as being talismanic, like the Palladium…this version does not necessarily represent correctly the Greek leaders' intentions, but we see repeatedly that Sinon beguiles the Trojans with nuggets of familiar, accepted, 'correct' myth…" (Horsfall, above n. 24, *ad* 2,183). Austin (above n. 23) correctly observes that the Sinon story is replete with

All three names of the goddess converge in an image of portentous ruin for Troy; she is central to the equine ruin of the city of Troy. In *pro numine laeso* there is a strong echo of the *numine laeso* of 1,8, where the offended divine power of Juno was prominently highlighted at the commencement of the epic; again, there is a clear enough association between Minerva and Juno – with a shade, too, of Jovian support for the workings of fate and destiny.[32] Athena was certainly associated with Greek discomfiture on account of the Ajacian violation of her temple and the rape of Cassandra – but the goddess is also a more or less implacable foe of Troy, and she will take on a key role in the ruin of that city. Odysseus is a preeminent trickster figure; here the goddess who was his traditional patron and protector is associated with the ruse of the horse that will secure the destruction of Priam's realm.

One Trojan cannot be fooled by Sinon and his lies: the Neptunian priest Laocoön. He is soon enough killed together with his sons by twin serpents that come from Tenedos; once the terrible act of herpetological horror is past, the snakes seek refuge at the citadel and feet of the dread goddess: 2,225–227 *at gemini lapsu delubra ad summa dracones* / *effugiunt saevaeque petunt Tritonidis arcem*, / *sub pedibusque deae clipeique sub orbe teguntur*. Here the Tritonian goddess is explicitly identified as "savage";[33] certainly there is a reference to the goddess' anger at the Trojans and her general support of the Greek cause (perhaps, though not explicitly so, in anger with respect to the *iudicium Paridis*); there is also the fact that the death of Laocoön and his sons is of a piece with the death of the Locrian Ajax – while the goddess is not a murderer in quite the dramatic fashion of Book 1, she at the very least shelters the serpentine killers at her feet and beneath her shield.[34] From the goddess who was *non aequa* we have

"rigmarole"; individual details do not accord completely with either logic or reason – but the tale convinces the Trojans nonetheless, and that is all that matters. The demonstrative *hanc* at 2,183 is the first reference to the horse in Sinon's speech, and is likely deictic (see further Horsfall here).

[32] At least in Pallas' slaying of the Lesser Ajax; at the climax of the epic, Jupiter and Juno will be reconciled.

[33] "Not a standard epithet", as Horsfall (above n. 24) notes *ad loc*.

[34] "The doom of Laocoön is the doom of all Troy, and as the snakes, seeking the protection of Minerva, make their way up onto the citadel we remember not only that this is the location on which the horse will soon be placed, but that it was from here that Laocoön rushed in his futile attempt to reveal the plot" (M. C. J. Putnam, *The Poetry of the Aeneid: Four Studies in Imaginative Unity and Design*, Cambridge, Massachusetts 1966, 19).

moved to a picture of savagery and rage; Laocoön attacked the horse that Pallas' divine art had constructed, and he will pay for his folly. Is Tritonia especially savage because she fears the discovery of the equine trick?[35] We might also note that there are two sons of Laocoön (2,213–214 … *et primum parva duorum* / *corpora natorum serpens amplexus uterque*); twin serpents for the two children. The death of the doublet children underscores the profundity of the ruin of the city; we may also be reminded of the preeminent Roman doublet, Romulus and Remus.

In the aftermath of the death of Laocoön, the decision is made that the horse should be received as an expiatory offering for the goddess; the death of Neptune's priest is taken as proof of the reliability and truth of Sinon's story. The goddess' role in the drama is underscored by a powerful half-line: 2,232–233 *ducendum ad sedes simulacrum orandaque divae* / *numina conclamant*.[36] Once again the notion of divine power (*numina*) and the offense thereof is raised; whatever anger the goddess feels toward Troy will now be expiated only by the ruin of the city. In Book 1 the goddess was cited as an image of divine retribution for the invasion of her temple precinct and the assault on Cassandra; now she is associated closely with the punishment of the one who would dare to raise a weapon against the horse that had been crafted by her art.

Soon enough Troy is under its final assault, then, and Virgil reminds us of the reason for Minerva's assault on the Lesser Ajax. Aeneas was a witness to the abduction of Cassandra from the temple of the goddess (2,403–406 *ecce trahebatur passis Priameia virgo* / *crinibus a templo Cassandra adytisque Minervae*, / *ad caelum tendens ardentia lumina frustra*, / *lumina, nam teneras arcebant vincula palmas*). Virgil returns here to the Minervan story from Book 1; a battle is described between the Trojans and the Greeks, with Ajax as the "fiercest" of all (2,414 … *acerrimus Aiax*) as he defends his war prize.[37] Coroebus soon falls at the very altar of the goddess (2,425–426 *Penelei dextra divae armipotentis*

---

[35] For subtle consideration of the range of possible meaning of the adjective, see P. Knox, "Savagery in the *Aeneid* and Virgil's Ancient Commentators", in *CJ* 92.3 (1997) 225–233.

[36] For the tragic associations, cf. A. König, *Die Aeneis und die griechische Tragödie*, Berlin 1970, 32–33.

[37] We move, then, from the locus where the snakes sought refuge, to the snatching of Cassandra from the temple – and soon enough to the implicitly serpentine Gorgon imagery of the goddess as she participates in the destruction of the city.

ad aram / *procumbit*); the son of the Phrygian king Mygdon was the would-be suitor of Cassandra who devised the idea that the Trojans could wear Greek uniforms in a feat of trickery (2,386–393).[38] What had been a prominent allusion near the opening of the epic now comes alive as a terrible scene from Troy's last night in the speech of Aeneas to Dido's court; the horror of the episode is accentuated by Coroebus' valiant (though foolhardy) final stand at the altar of the goddess. Aeneas brings to life the Junonian allusion from her rant at the start of the epic.

In a sense we have come full circle to the first mention of the immortal; the destruction of Troy, however, represents the full extent of the goddess' power and wrath. Venus displays to her son the revelation of the divine action at play in the ruin of Troy; Neptune and Juno are there – and Pallas is resplendent with both a storm cloud and the Gorgon emblem of her battle shield (2,615–616 *iam summas arces Tritonia, respice, Pallas* / *insedit, nimbo effulgens et Gorgone saeva*). The image of savagery returns, and in a similar context; the Gorgon was associated with snakes, after all, and here the snaky-haired avatar of the goddess is wielded against the doomed city.[39] Jupiter has his place, here, too – though *sine nomine* – Venus notes that her "very father" (2,617 *ipse pater*) is providing strength to the Danaans in their attack on the city. Jupiter, after all, does not fight against the destiny of Troy – a destiny that demands its destruction on this last night. In the context of such divine cooperation with fate, Aeneas would do well to exercise his ability to make a quick departure from the city. Sinon's lies and tricks have worked their magic, and the goddess and her Gorgon are in full control.[40]

---

[38] On the trickery of Coroebus and the Trojans in the wake of the Laocoön/Wooden Horse episode, see E. Dekel, *Virgil's Homeric Lens*, New York – London 2012, 92–93; for detailed analysis of the episode, cf. S. Monda, "The Coroebus Episode in Virgil's *Aeneid*", *HSCPh* 106 (2011) 199–208. In Book 2, the trickery and deceit of the Trojans comes after the far more significant, indeed deadly ruse of the Greeks; in Book 11, the Trojans will plan a surprise attack that Turnus attempts to meet with the trick of an ambush that fails after the death of Camilla drives Turnus to abandon his intention (thus saving Aeneas, who is unaware of the great harm he managed to avoid).

[39] Three immortals cooperate by name in the vision of Troy's ruin; cf. the imagery of divine triads, and also one possible etymology of *Tritonia* (i.e., with numerical reference); cf. further M. Paschalis, *Virgil's Aeneid: Semantic Relations and Proper Names*, Oxford 1997, 74.

[40] Gorgon imagery appears in the *Aeneid* in connection to the fall of Troy and on shield of Aeneas in the depiction of Actium; there is also 6,289 *Gorgones Harpyiaeque et forma tricorporis umbrae*

In Book 1, then, the goddess was referenced in terms of her behavior in the matter of the Greek returns from Troy; in Book 2, she enjoys the bulk of her appearances in the epic as part of Aeneas' narrative of the end of Priam's realm.

Pallas/Minerva is of signal importance, then, in the ruin of one city – and appropriately enough, she returns to Virgil's epic at the first arrival in Italy, as the Trojan exiles under Aeneas reach Hesperia at long last: 3,531–532 *iam propior, templumque apparet in arce Minervae*; / *vela legunt socii et proras ad litora torquent*.[41] On one level this is a simple economy of exchange; one city is lost and another will be born. But the whole atmosphere is soon overcome with a spirit of gloom and battle; this is the locus of the celebrated omen of the four snow-white horses that are interpreted (correctly, we might note) by Anchises as portending war in Italy (3,537–538).[42] Appropriately enough, the Trojans venerate and reverence the battle goddess before they make their departure (3, 543–544 … *tum numina sancta precamur* / *Palladis armisonae, quae prima accepit ovantis*). Aeneas and his men pay homage to the goddess in her capacity as a divine warrior; the poet also makes clear that Pallas/Minerva was the first goddess to receive the Trojans in Italy.[43] There is a curious mixture here of rejoicing and harbingers of ill fortune; the goddess is once again explicitly associated with horses and equine doom; the Trojan horse that brought destruction to the city of

(of the monsters at the doorway of Dis).

[41] On the disputed localization of the landing at *Castrum Minervae*, see N. Horsfall, *Virgil, Aeneid 3, A Commentary*, Leiden – Boston 2006, *ad* 531–536; cf. A. G. McKay, *Vergil's Italy*, Greenwich, Connecticut 1970, 258–259.

[42] For the color adjective *nivalis* of the horses see R. Edgeworth, *The Colors of the Aeneid*, New York 1992, 142. It occurs three times in the epic; cf. 7,675 and 12,702, both times of snowy mountains. In the former instance Othrys is the haunt of Centaurs (cf. the equine associations here); "Catillus and Coras are like two centaurs galloping down snowy Othrys." In the other occurrence, Aeneas in combat against Turnus is compared to Appenninus lifting up his head. No clear point, then, to the uses of the adjective – though two of the three citations concern horse imagery, and two mountain.

[43] For how this prioritizing of Minerva over Juno is the wrongheaded approach to the liturgical demands enjoined on the Trojans by Helenus in Buthrotum, see J. T. Dyson, *King of the Wood: The Sacrificial Victor in Virgil's Aeneid*, Norman 2001, 44–46. Later in the epic we find that the women of Latinus' capital pray to Pallas as well – and she sends them the Volscian Camilla as the *de facto* answer to their prayers; throughout the *Aeneid*, Minerva is depicted as more sympathetic to the anti-Trojan cause. We shall return later to the significance of the point of the priority of Minerva in Aeneas' prayer; it may prove relevant to a close reading of the final movements of the epic and the relative places of Juno and Minerva in the ultimate disposition of the poem.

Priam has been replaced by the omen of the horses that herald the forthcoming war in central Italy.[44]

From the goddess who was "powerful in arms", then, we move to the goddess who has "sounding arms"; in the first instance, Pallas did not intervene to save Coroebus at her altar, despite her strength in weaponry, while in the second, *armisonae* points ominously to the forthcoming war in Italy.[45] The imagery of twins returns here, too: 3,535–536 … *gemino demittunt bracchia muro* / *turriti scopuli refugitque ab litore templum*, in the description of the locus of the Trojan landing. No twin serpents here to devour Trojans – but an ominous place all the same, a first landing in Italy that portends a war that will constitute the rebirth of the Homeric *Iliad*.

Pallas/Minerva appears twice in Book 5 of the *Aeneid*, in interesting and diverse contexts. First, in the aftermath of the ship race we learn that the prize for last place – the final words of the poet on the regatta – will be Cretan slave girl, Pholoë, together with her twin sons at the breast. And Pholoë is explicitly identified as being familiar with the works of Minerva, that is, the loom and the distaff (5,284–285 *olli serva datur, operum haud ignara Minervae* / *Cressa genus, Pholoë, geminique sub ubere nati*).

On the one hand, we see here the sort of ornamental passage that can easily escape close scrutiny; Book 5 is devoted to the funeral games in memory of Aeneas' father Anchises, and the awarding of prizes is an important element of the drama. On the other hand, we are left at the close of the long narrative of the ship race with a clear enough evocation of nothing less than the twins Romulus and Remus, something of a harbinger of the future foundation of Rome – and

---

44 Cf. here W. Kühn, *Götterszenen bei Vergil*, Heidelberg 1971, 55–58.

45 "We hear surprisingly little in the Aeneid of divinities that have any peculiarly Trojan quality. The goddess of the *arx* at Troy, on the preservation of whose image the safety of the city depended… is like the Pallas we have come to know further west in the Mediterranean basin. It was at the feet of her cult-statue that the serpents took refuge after killing Laocoon and his sons; that she is not actively fighting for Troy on that last night but is in the company of Neptune, Juno and Jupiter, who are aiding the Greeks, is one more evidence that the city is completely doomed" (C. Saunders, *Vergil's Primitive Italy*, New York 1930, 104–105). The present passage constitutes the first "appearance" of the goddess in Italy; she will in some ways be more associated with the Italian cause than the Trojan in the unfolding of the new war in Latium. *Armisonus* occurs only here in Virgil (it may be a coinage); elsewhere only in argentine epic.

as at *Castrum Minervae*, the goddess is associated closely with imagery that is reflective of the eventual settlement of Rome.

The other appearance of the goddess in the penultimate book of the first, Odyssean half of Virgil's epic is also nautical in context. The context is the aftermath of the terrible attempt at the burning of the Trojan fleet that was instigated by Iris at the behest of Juno. Aeneas is in serious discomfiture and self-doubt as to whether or not he should stay in Sicily, or should pursue his Italian destiny. He is counseled by one of his men, a character we have not met before in the poem – an aged man who was taught by none other than Tritonian Pallas: 5,704–707 *tum senior Nautes, unum Tritonia Pallas* / *quem docuit multaque insignem reddidit arte*, / (*haec responsa dabat, vel quae portenderet ira* / *magna deum vel quae fatorum posceret ordo*).[46]

Nautes – whose very name evokes the world of sailing and seamanship – was educated by Tritonian Pallas in the art of prophecy and divinization, it would seem. He was reliable for information both about the course of future events, or what the anger of the gods portends – information he received directly from Pallas. All three names of the goddess now appear in Virgil's fifth *Aeneid*; Nautes' training in the matter of the wrath of the immortals harks back to earlier movements of the epic and the anger of Pallas in the matter of the Lesser Ajax and the events surrounding Troy's last night. Nautes is educated, in short, in nothing less than the substance of the unfolding drama of the epic. The *ira magna deum* points ultimately, after all, to the wrath of Juno and the outcome of her final reconciliation to fate (cf. *quae fatorum posceret ordo*). If the award of the Cretan slave girl Pholoë – a girl not ignorant of the works of Minerva – distantly heralded the future settlement of Rome in Latium, then in Nautes' counsel to Aeneas we see again the association of Minerva with the Roman future.[47] Sig-

[46] We do well to note that at 5,635–640, Iris/Beroe notes how Cassandra's image (*imago*) appeared to her in a dream and noted that this (i.e., Sicily) was the place to establish a new home and to seek Troy. See further on this H. R. Steiner, *Der Traum in der Aeneis*, Bern 1952, 53–53; "fingiert" indeed. The lying Iris (cf. Sinon in Book 2) notes that there are four altars to Neptune that will supply the fire to burn the ships (cf. the omen of the four horses at *Castrum Minervae*). Iris/Beroe is right to want to burn the ships of Troy, as it turns out – she is simply ahead of the game in light of the unfolding destiny of the Trojans who will soon enough be definitively suppressed in the ethnic disposition of the future Rome.

[47] Nautes was also associated with (Varronian) traditions about the return of the Palladium to Aeneas by Diomedes; see further R. Heinze, *Virgils epische Technik*, Leipzig – Berlin 1915 (3rd

nificantly, too, Aeneas will not be entirely persuaded by Nautes' admonitions; it will require a dream visitation from his father's shade to secure his willingness to leave some Trojans behind in Sicily, and to proceed to his destiny in Italy. Any association of the goddess with the world of the sea and the realm of Neptune is strengthened by her connection to Nautes; Anchises will affirm the wisdom of the "sailor's" advice. The management of the scene is subtle and effective; Pallas/Minerva is no reliable friend of the Trojans, and here the admonition of her spokesman – though wise and worthy of credence – does not persuade. All the same, Nautes knows what the order of the fates demands.

War, then, is an inevitable feature of the Trojan/Italian destiny, but so too is the settlement and the expansive power of Rome – and Minerva will join Juno and Jupiter in revered glory as a key element of the Roman pantheon. The references to the goddess in Book 5 point forward to the Roman future (a major theme of the book more generally, juxtaposed as it is between the Trojan past and the new destiny in Italy).

The final appearance of Minerva in the first half of the epic comes relatively near to the end of Book 6, in the great unfolding of the future Roman history that the shade of Anchises reveals to Aeneas in the Parade of Heroes or *Heldenschau*. The future conquests of Lucius Aemilius Paullus in Greece and Macedonia are recalled; the Roman general is viewed as an avenger of the violation of Minerva's temple in Troy: 6,840 *ultus avos Troiae templa et temerata Minervae*.

We return here yet again to the image from the start of the epic; Books 1 and 6 are framed, in a sense, by references to the desecration of the goddess' shrine by the Lesser Ajax in his abduction and rape of Cassandra. The infamy of Ajax's crime will be avenged more than once; the goddess had her vengeance on the mad hero, and the Romans will avenge the temple invasion.[48] Even here, in the midst of the triumph and pageantry of the heroic display of the Roman future, we are reminded of the grim episode of Minerva's temple desecration; the *Heldenschau* transforms the dark reality of Cassandra's abduction into a part of

edition), 103–104.

[48] The adjective *temeratus* occurs only here in Virgil, with reference to the violated temple of the goddess; cf. 11,583–584 *aeternum telorum et virginitatis amorem / intemerata colit*, of Diana's description to Opis of the lifestyle of the adolescent Camilla. In the *temerata templa* there is a strong hint that it is as if the goddess herself has been violated. Camilla herself moves from a Diana-like existence to a Minervan one.

the drama that leads inexorably to Rome. The Minervan allusions in the Odyssean *Aeneid* come to a close on the same note with which they commenced; the violation of a girl will be avenged.

The second half of Virgil's epic is devoted in large part to the narrative of the inevitable war in central Italy, the fierce struggle between Aeneas' Trojans and the Latins. Pallas/Minerva is quietly referenced at 7,154 … *ramis velatos Palladis omnis*, where Aeneas' hundred orators are described as they proceed to the site of King Latinus' palace.[49] This is a brief, indeed fleeting moment of quiet peace and even expectant joy; the hope of the Trojans is that they might find a lasting, permanent home in peace among the inhabitants of Latium. The reference to Pallas Athena is to the goddess in her civilizing capacity, to the image of the peaceful olive and the gifts of culture and the rewards of a better life. For an all too short moment in time, there is a hope of calm and profitable union between Trojans and Latins; the serene atmosphere will prove quite transient.

For all of this changes, needless to say, with the outbreak of war – and the goddess reappears in the epic in a context not dissimilar to the reference to her in the catalogue of future Roman heroes. If Book 6 ended with a vision of the glories that loomed large as part of the Roman destiny, then Book 7 closes with a more immediate problem for Aeneas and his Trojans – a catalogue of the warriors who arrive to do battle against the perceived Trojan invaders. The final, climactic revelation of that catalogue is that of the Volscian heroine Camilla, who is explicitly associated with what we might consider the martial and not the domestics arts of the goddess: 7,805–807 *bellatrix, non illa colo calathisve Minervae* / *femineas adsueta manus, sed proelia virgo* / *dura pati cursuque pedum praevertere ventos*.[50] Peace here gives way to war; the domestics arts of the goddess are eschewed, while the martial are pursued.

---

[49] " … the introduction of the olive was Athena's claim, against Poseidon, to possession of Attica" (N. Horsfall, *Virgil, Aeneid 7, A Commentary*, Leiden – Boston – Köln 2000, *ad loc*.). There was a tradition that Athena was a daughter of Poseidon (cf. Paus. 1,14,6); according to the Suda (s.v. Hippeia Athene) she was the first to use a chariot and thus merited the appellation "Athena of the Horses".

[50] "The pageant ends with the most beautiful of all its figures. Virgil, in describing the hero of these last six books, had already ventured a touch of the supernatural; here he indulges his imagination still further" (W. W. Fowler, *Virgil's "Gathering of the Clans", Being Observations on Aeneid VII.610–817*, Oxford: B.H. Blackwell, 1918, 85).

Camilla is introduced in opposition to the image Virgil employed earlier of the Cretan slave girl; unlike the prize in the regatta, this girl is not accustomed to the household chores and works of the great goddess. This is not to say, however, that Camilla is not Minervan; on the contrary, she is a *bellatrix* and shares in the martial, military associations of Pallas. Like Minerva – and unlike the Cretan slave girl with the two infants, we might conclude – she is also a virgin. For the present, the role of Camilla in the battle narratives of the second part of the epic will be suppressed; Virgil will not reintroduce her to the epic for several books. The horse omen of Book 3 here sees the dawn of its fulfillment, as Camilla leads her cavalry contingent to war (7,804 *agmen agens equitum* …); equestrian war will erupt in Book 11, the book of Camilla.

Camilla's divine associations are multifarious and complex. In *Aeneid* 11 she will be closely associated with the huntress Diana; her virginity links her both to Diana and Minerva.[51] In her capacity as leader of the Volscian contingent she has affinities to the urbanized, social goddess Minerva; she is commander and soldier, a devotee of battle as well as the preservation of virginal honor and renown – but not of the household chores of the goddess.[52] We learn later that her forest connections and adolescent life in the sylvan haunts of Diana has somehow been exchanged for a more public existence as the leader of the Volscian contingent in the Latin War; the poet does not indulge in such concerns as how or why Camilla made the transition.

Camilla was not acclimated to the art and works of the loom and the domestic world of Minerva; the god Vulcan, in contrast, rises up at the very hour when a matron and her servant women are awake for working with wool and the tasks of spinning (8,407 ff.).[53] Vulcan rises early, however, for a very different sort of work from that of the loom; he has agreed to his wife Venus' prayer that

---

[51] The "Lycian quiver" and "pastoral myrtle" introduce other problems, indeed allusions to Apollonian and Venusian lore.

[52] "Camilla steht außerhalb des Bereiches der antiken Frau und verschämt es, der Minerva zu dienen…die in der Aeneis noch zweimal…als Schutzgöttin der Frauenarbeit erscheint." (A. Brill, *Die Gestalt der Camilla bei Vergil*, Heidelberg 1972, 23.

[53] "Although this simile goes back to Homer (*Il*. 12,433–4, and cf. also Apollonius 3,291 ff., 4,1062 ff.) nothing could be more Roman than Virgil's picture of a chaste Roman matron or widow, an *univira* and the anti-type of Dido and Cleopatra in her devotion to home and family. This passage comes at the 'still centre' of the most Augustan book of the *Aeneid*…" (K. W. Gransden, *Virgil, Aeneid Book VIII*, Cambridge 1976, *ad* 408–413).

he might fashion divine arms for Aeneas to use in his forthcoming participation in the Latin war. Vulcan complies with the wishes of the Trojan hero's goddess mother – and he orders his Cyclopic assistants to put aside the work on which they are already busy. Those tasks include the chariot of Mars and, significantly, the aegis of Pallas: 8,435–438 *aegidaque horriferam, turbatae Palladis arma*, / *certatim squamis serpentum auroque polibant* / *conexosque anguis ipsamque in pectore divae* / *Gorgona desecto vertentem lumina collo*.

Appropriately enough, Vulcan commands his servants to cease work (at least for the moment) on a weapon that figured in the description of Pallas' participation in the destruction of Troy.[54] In a short compass of lines, we meet the goddess in both her realms; Vulcan is working on behalf of Venus and Aeneas, and in this capacity he is associated with the domestic arts of Minerva. For now, the terrible Gorgon-head weaponry of the dread battle goddess will be put aside. The contrast between the different bailiwicks of Pallas/Minerva harks back to the same juxtaposition in the description of Camilla, the (for now) absentee heroine of the Italian war. Virgil's careful evocation of both worlds of the goddess serves in part to remind us of how Camilla is an imperfect Minerva, of how the Volscian represents the goddess in her battle mode and not in the civilized works of house and society.

The works of Mars and of Minerva may well be put aside to make room and time for the shield of Aeneas – but both deities are prominently depicted in the artwork of Aeneas' armament, in the dramatic presentation of the Battle of Actium on the shield.[55] Neptune and Minerva are opposed to the gods of Cleopatra's Egypt; Venus is with them: 8,699–700 *contra Neptunum et Venerem contraque Minervam* / *tela tenent* (where the subject is Anubis and the other strange gods of the East).[56] Here we see Minerva once again in her capacity as war goddess, and once again engaged in a struggle that can be characterized as one of western *versus* eastern powers. It is significant that Aeneas is

[54] Cf. 2,615–616.

[55] For the possible modeling of the shield of Aeneas on a Palladian work of the visual arts, see R. Cohon, "Vergil and Phidias: The Shield of Aeneas and of Athena Parthenos", *Vergilius* 37 (1991) 22–30.

[56] For the association of this imagery with the lore of the gigantomachy and the fight to establish the Olympian order, see P. Hardie, *Virgil's Aeneid: Cosmos and Imperium*, Oxford 1986, 98–99.

not aware of the meaning or import of the pictures on the shield;[57] in Dido's temple at Carthage the Trojan hero had taken comfort and solace in the images on display there, though in fact the pictures were illustrations of some of the worst moments in the history of his doomed city. Actium would be the decisive engagement between the forces of the new Caesar and those of Antony and his Egyptian lover Cleopatra; in the immediate context of the *Aeneid*, a more immediate war was pressing on Aeneas.[58]

The appearances of the goddess in Book 8, then, combine the two spheres of her influence; Vulcan crafted the shield at the hour when women see to the works of the loom, and Minerva fought the animal gods of Egypt on the divine shield. The doomed Camilla represents an incomplete Minerva, a girl who will not have a place, as it were, in the domestic sphere of the future Rome; the goddess herself, in contrast, is complete and integral, a defender of the sanctity of both home and country. The goddess who fought for the Greeks against their Trojan adversaries will now defend Rome from the threat of her Eastern enemy.

The Latins eventually send emissaries to Diomedes in southern Italy in the hope that the great Greek warrior and Trojan foe might return from retirement to fight once again against his erstwhile enemy. The mission is unsuccessful; simply stated, Diomedes has had more than enough experience of the negative consequences of fighting Trojans. In the speech he gave to his Latin guests that is reported to Latinus and his court, reference is made to the travails of the Greeks in the matter of the returns from Troy – and, in particular, to the "baleful star of Minerva", the *triste Minervae* / *sidus* (11,259–260).[59] The exact meaning of the *sidus Minervae* has been the source of scholarly debate;[60] it may refer to

---

[57] Hence 8,729–731 *talia per clipeum Volcani, dona parentis*, / *miratur rerumque ignarus imagine gaudet* / *attollens umero famamque et fata nepotum* (the closing verses of the book), where Virgil recalls both the vision of heroes in Elysium *and* the notion of the "gifts" or *dona* of an immortal.

[58] For reflections on the shield and its contemporary resonance, note A. McKay, "*Non enarrabile textum*? The Shield of Aeneas and the Triple Triumph of 29 B.C. (*Aen*. 8,630–728)", in H.-P. Stahl (ed.), *Vergil's Aeneid: Augustan Epic and Political Context*, Swansea 2009, 209–211. If Venus is associated in the epic with irrational passion and frenzy, Minerva (like Diana) stands in marked contrast; the passions of Juno are reconciled in the final settlement of Book 12.

[59] Cf. here M. Alessio, *Studies in Vergil, Aeneid Eleven: An Allegorical Approach*, Laval, Québec 1993, 87–89, with commentary on Diomedes' enumeration and recollection of the woes that befell the Greeks.

[60] See especially Horsfall (above n. 28) *ad loc*.; also L. Fratantuono, *A Commentary on Virgil,*

the constellation Aries and provide a temporal marker for the Greek departure from Troy, with not mutually exclusive indication of the storm and unseasonable weather stirred up by the angry goddess. The baleful, grim star of Minerva oversees the terrible labor of the returns; for the Trojans, Minervan peril awaits in the cavalry drama of *Aeneid* 11.

But in the Minervan narrative of the epic, the most significant allusion is to the specific cause of the anger of the goddess – the violation of Cassandra in the goddess' own temple. We return here yet again to the wrath of Pallas Athena that was so prominently featured near the start of the epic; we return to the question of the abuse of the prophetic Cassandra and the vengeance taken on her behalf by the goddess of wisdom and warfare. And if Camilla is the mortal incarnation of Minerva, then Diomedes will have no part in a war that prominently features the Minervan heroine. Diomedes will have no part in any possible sacrilege or desecration that arises from the last movements of the war in Latium. The *sidus Minervae* had punished the Greeks on account of the violation of Cassandra; Diomedes will play no role in the combat that will see the violation of the Minervan Camilla.

Diomedes was of course involved in the theft of the Palladium; henceforth he will not stain his hands with any further action against the Trojans – he is content with his more or less fortunate escape from harm. The Latin war resumes soon enough after a truce for the burials of the dead on both sides; the Latin queen Amata and her daughter Lavinia are soon enough in the same position as that of the women of Troy – they are supplicants at the shrine of Pallas (11,477 ff.). The final named appearance of the goddess comes as the *Latinae* make their way to the citadel of Pallas (11,477 … *ad templum summasque ad Palladis arces*); there they invoke the Tritonian virgin, and ask her to destroy the Phrygian brigand Aeneas (11,483–485 *armipotens, praeses belli, Tritonia virgo*, / *frange manu telum Phrygii praedonis, et ipsum* / *pronum sterne solo portisque effunde sub altis*). What had been glimpsed in picture is now reality; new women assemble to supplicate a goddess powerful in war. And there is, too, a decidedly racial and ethnic element to the prayer; Aeneas is depicted as if he were a new Phrygian Paris, a new abductor of a young woman from hearth and home. The whole matter would understandably enough be of great significance to Minerva; the loss that she and Juno suffered in the Judgment of Paris is

Aeneid XI, Bruxelles 2009.

exactly what led to the abduction of Helen – and a similar situation might well seem to be unfolding now in the case of Latium and Lavinia. The substance of the prayer of the Latin women is exactly what might be expected to impress the virgin goddess.

This time, however, there is no description of the response of the goddess – though soon thereafter if not at once (11,498 ff.), the Volscian Camilla makes her return to the epic at last – she is nothing less than the response of the goddess to the prayers of her supplicants.[61] Like Minerva, Camilla has equestrian associations; she will manage the cavalry battle that will be waged before the walls of Latinus' city. As in the Palladian instance of the Wooden Horse, trickery and deceit are also afoot; while Camilla oversees the equestrian combat, Turnus will prepare an ambush for Aeneas – who is himself planning to launch a surprise attack on the Latin capital. Lastly, Camilla will be killed *ex insidiis* by the Etruscan Arruns, who will in turn be slain by Diana's nymph Opis – vengeance for the death of the Volscian, and something of a parallel to the divine retribution on the Lesser Ajax for the violation of Cassandra.[62] There is no direct, explicit reference to Camilla as the answer to Minerva's prayer; the goddess makes no recorded reply to the Latin women, but neither is it said that her face was averted to their prayer. And in the end, Camilla will be stopped only after the direct interventions of both Jupiter and Apollo.

Part of the point here is that Minerva is a staunch ally of the Romans (as referenced by her prominent place on the shield of Aeneas), and in an important sense Camilla and the other native Italian warriors are fighting for that Roman future. The goddess is thus not explicitly associated with the Trojan cause; at

---

[61] Cf. too the descriptions of the women of Latinus' capital at 11,45–476 and 11,891–895.

[62] Cf. Diana's words to Opis at 11,591–592 *hac, quicumque sacrum violarit vulnere corpus*, / *Tros Italusque, mihi pariter det sanguine poenas*, where the nymph is urged to take vengeance for Camilla's death on anyone, Trojan or Italian, who violated her sacred body; Camilla and Cassandra are associated by shared first and last letters of names (a favorite Virgilian practice to draw connections between characters), and in the equal opportunity call for vengeance we may be reminded of how Athena – usually a defender of the Greeks – was more than willing to kill the Locrian Ajax for his assault on Cassandra. Ajax and Arruns are rare instances of direct divine murder in the *Aeneid*; certainly gods assist in the death of individual characters (cf. Apollo with Camilla and Numanus Remulus, even Sleep's tossing Palinurus overboard) – but actual killing is reserved for Ajax and Arruns, the violators of Cassandra and Camilla. Laocoön is a close instance of the same, though technically the Palladian snakes kill his sons and him. On the guilt of Arruns cf. G. Williams, *Technique and Ideas in the Aeneid*, New Haven, Connecticut 1983, 175–177.

best her depiction is neutral, though the Camillan parallel draws her more to the side of Turnus' Italian army than Aeneas' Trojan.[63] Vulcan's Cyclopes had put aside work on Minerva's Gorgon aegis when they commenced work on a shield that would feature the goddess at war for the future Augustan Rome; we see in this detail an element of the complex movement from one city to another, especially where the doomed Troy will give rise to a Rome that is not Trojan but Italian. The shield will take priority over the Gorgon emblem that figured in the ruin of Troy – but the illustration of Actium on the shield represents the triumph of Italy and not Troy, indeed of another conquest of the East. Significantly, too, Aeneas will have no place in the struggle against Camilla; there will be no episode of Aeneas in combat against the virgin heroine.

In Book 7, the Palladian olive of the peaceful Trojan embassy to the Latins led to nothing less than the appearance of Camilla in the catalogue of war heroes; in Book 11, the supplication of the goddess by the women of Latium leads to the epiphany of the heroine in battle. Books 7 and 11 are linked by Camilla sequences; in both books the goddess Pallas/Minerva appears in a context of prayer and supplication before the virtual human incarnation of the goddess makes her entrance. In equine sequence we move from the Wooden Horse that spelled doom for Troy, to the portent of the warhorses at *Castrum Minervae* that portended the outbreak of war in Italy; to the cavalry battle of Book 11 that was do disastrous for Troy – until, that is, the cooperative efforts of Jupiter and Apollo saved the day for Aeneas and his Trojans.

Virgil's Camilla has affinities, too, with the poet's Arcadian Pallas, the son of Evander; the parallel between the two doomed, tragic youths is strengthened by the name of the one and the association of the other with the (nearly, at least) homonymous goddess.[64] The onomastic connection between goddess and Arcadian hero serves to underscore the linkage of the goddess to the topography of the future Rome and such locales as Pallanteum and the Palatine; Pallas was the name of one of Evander's ancestors, a shadowy figure of mytho-history who gave his name to the settlement his descendant founded in central Italy. Camilla

---

[63] Cf. too the omen of the horses at *Castrum Minervae*, which both looks back to the baleful role of the horse in the fall of Troy, and forward to the deadly cavalry battle in which the Trojans will be saved from rout only by the assistance and intervention of both Jupiter and Apollo.

[64] Not withstanding declensions, accent and vowel quantities (cf. *Pallas*, *Pallantis*; *Pallas*, *Palladis*/*os*, etc.; accent on penult *versus* ultima).

is the closest mortal figure in Virgil's epic to the goddess Minerva, and it is fitting that she should be associated by name with the mortal hero with whom she shares numerous linkages.[65] By the end of the poem, Aeneas will in a sense be fighting for Pallas, and Turnus for Camilla; both men will have suffered the tragic loss of youthful heroes.

The supplication of the goddess by the women of Latinus' capital constitutes the final direct reference to the goddess in the epic; we must note, however, that the speculation has been raised that Pallas Athena is also relevant to the scene of the Jovian owl-like Dira[66] that is sent both to frighten Turnus and to warn off Juturna from further aid to her brother in *Aeneid* 12 (843 ff.).[67] One wonders, too, whether or not an ancient audience thought of the goddess in the powerful anaphoric address of Aeneas to Turnus at the very end of the epic, … *Pallas te hoc vulnere, Pallas* / *immolat et poenam scelerato ex sanguine sumit* – the final words of the Trojan hero to his Rutulian foe.[68] In neither passage do we find an incontrovertible reference to the goddess Pallas/Minerva; one is left, however, with the fact that aforementioned declensional, metrical considerations aside, she is in some sense the last goddess mentioned in the epic – and there may well be something of a ringing back to the early reference in the epic to how Pallas Athena was able to exercise her wrath against the Lesser Ajax.

Different readers of the epic will have diverse reactions to the significance of the goddess Pallas to the final movements of the epic.[69] Some reflections can be offered, however, in pursuit of a Palladian reading of Virgil's poem. Certainly the goddess is no ally of the Trojans – indeed, she is actively complicit in the ruin of Troy, and Book 2 – the book of the fall of Priam's city – is where

---

[65] Book 11 is in fact framed by Pallas and Camilla; the second book of the poem featured the goddess in frequent references both to the Palladium and the goddess; the second to the last focuses on her quasi-namesake and her mortal avatar.

[66] For the *Dira* as the *Dei Ira*, see M. C. J. Putnam, *The Humanness of Heroes: Studies in the Conclusion of Virgil's Aeneid*, Amsterdam 2011, 152 n. 160 (with reference to the bibliography).

[67] Cf. here S. Spence, "The Polyvalence of Pallas in the *Aeneid*", *Arethusa* 32.2 (1999) 149–163; Panoussi, *op. cit*., 109–112 (with reference to how Juno appropriates the function of Pallas to herself).

[68] Note here the sober observations of R. J. Tarrant, *Virgil, Aeneid XII*, Cambridge 2012.

[69] *Inter alia*, on the possible connection of the Fury imagery of the Dira to the concept of the *Erinys Pallantis*, see C. Renger, *Aeneas und Turnus: Analyse einer Feindschaft*, Frankurt am Main 1985, 96–100.

we find the most references to her work. She is a battle goddess of enormous power and capacity for violence; she is credited directly with the death of Ajax and implicitly associated with the grisly end of Laocoön and his sons.[70]

She is also explicitly associated with the Volscian Camilla, a figure who emerges as nothing less than Turnus' Pallas.[71] Pallas dies as a proxy for Aeneas; Camilla dies in a similar way for Turnus, though her Rutulian commander is himself doomed to join her soon enough in death.[72]

But beyond this basic, Homeric style Patroclan association of tragic youth, there is the drama of the second to the last book of the epic *versus* that of the second. In Book 2, a city was destroyed in part through the efforts of Pallas Athena; in Book 11 – which opens with the requiem for the Arcadian Pallas – Latinus' city is protected by the Minervan Camilla. Trickery and deceit abound in both books; in the one case, an equine ruse ruins a city, while in the other, an equine feint is used by the Trojans to conceal the plan of Aeneas to launch an attack on the Latin capital – an attack that fails, though Turnus' aggrieved reaction to Camilla's death prevents him from capitalizing on his reconnaissance intelligence and plan to ensnare Aeneas in an ambush. In short, Camilla inadvertently saves Aeneas by proving to be the emotional source of Turnus' inability to maintain his battle plan; at the very least, her death and the report thereof drives him to abandon his ambush and race to the defense of the capital.[73] Aeneas has no apparent knowledge of what Turnus planned or of why the plans have changed; he will also have no idea that the destined new home of the Trojans will in fact *not* be Trojan in many crucial elements.

But Turnus is doomed, and the Dira of Book 12 is a powerful reminder of his ultimate fate; Camilla becomes an unwitting instrument of that end.[74] She

---

[70] In contrast, for all her violence Juno is not depicted in nearly so direct a set of violent acts.

[71] Indeed, the shared death line of the two that closes the epic ends the poem on a profoundly Camillan and thus arguably Palladian note.

[72] The direct mortal slayings perpetrated by immortals in the epic come in arguably Minervan contexts; the Lesser Ajax was slain by the goddess, and Arruns was killed by Opis after his assault on a Minervan figure.

[73] The final outcome is the same in any case; Turnus fails to entrap Aeneas, but Aeneas' own plans for the conquest of the city are also foiled. The penultimate book of Virgil's poem does not offer another narrative of a successful sack of a city akin to the fall of Troy; Latinus' city (a prefigurement of Rome) will not be sacked.

[74] And savagery is at the heart of the matter; cf. 11,896; 901; 910 (where first we learn that the

must be destroyed as part of the coming of a new order, it would seem – and her death plays a key role in the ruin of Turnus.[75] In a very real sense the fact that the future Rome will be Italian and not Trojan[76] renders the continued existence (and resistance) of Turnus and Camilla rather otiose; their side has won a great victory, though neither they nor Aeneas is aware of the significant events that have occurred on the divine plane. Both Turnus and Camilla are possessed of serious flaws and have no place, as it were, in the future Rome – except as the sort of protomartyric hero that might be lauded by a Dante. The apparent necessity of their deaths, however, does not negate the fact that they fight for what emerges as the winning cause. The ultimate suppression of Trojan *mores* holds true regardless of how the ending of the epic is interpreted; the problem posed by the death of Turnus does not change the key fact of the future Roman identity.

Indeed, if Rome will be Latin/Italian and not Trojan in *sermo* and *mores*, then Aeneas' killing of Turnus is arguably an act of civil war;[77] Aeneas, of course, is Trojan and Trojan customs will be suppressed (12,836–836 … *commixti corpore tantum* / *subsident Teucri*).[78] Aeneas – overcome with anger and

announcement of the death of Camilla was *saevissimus*, and then that nothing less than the "savage" power of Jupiter demanded the abandonment of the ambush, and that then "savage" Aeneas appeared on the scene.

75 Cf. too the tradition of Athena's killing of her playmate Pallas.

76 Cf. 12,832–842, in the colloquy of Jupiter and Juno regarding the *sermo* and *mores* of the future Rome. At 840 *nec gens ulla tuos aeque celebrabit honores* Jupiter announces how Rome will have nothing less than a special, peculiar relationship of reverence for the goddess. The language is careful; it can be parsed closely to indicate that the Romans will venerate Juno more than any other nation, not so much that Juno will be the greatest of Roman gods (cf. here Tarrant's note *ad loc*.). Ultimately, the Capitoline Triad of Juno, Jupiter, and Minerva occupies the greatest place in the Roman pantheon (with Jupiter Optimus Maximus above all); all three immortals thus take their rightful place in the theology of the *Aeneid*.

77 The matter is of course complicated by the political divisions in Italy that are depicted by Virgil; on the whole matter see especially R. Pogorzelski, "The 'Reassurance of Fratricide' in the *Aeneid*", *AJPh* 130.2 (2009) 261–289. Aeneas and Turnus are part of the same future, and that future might well have more in common with Turnus' Italy than Aeneas' Troy.

78 Parallelism between Pallas' slaying of Ajax and Aeneas' of Turnus is difficult to define precisely; Turnus killed the Arcadian Pallas, and so in a sense his action can be taken as being parallel to Ajax's violation of Cassandra – but in fact Turnus is also associated with his ally Camilla, who has strong Palladian, Minervan affinities. Virgil throughout carefully seeks to navigate the problematic, sometimes conflicting nature of the Troiano-Roman future: Aeneas will be victorious in one sense,

rage in the matter of the death of the Arcadian Pallas – slays Turnus and invokes his young Greek ally as the agent of justifiable homicidal rage, the executor of right revenge and merited punishment.[79] Aeneas is unaware of the totality of the situation in Latium; both he and his divine mother (like their mortal foes) are left uninformed of the terms of the reconciliation of Juno with Jupiter and destiny. It is no surprise, then, that Aeneas invokes "Pallas" as the one responsible for the sacrifice (*immolat*) of the hero whose death will be marked by the same death line as that which described the end of the mortal incarnation of the goddess.[80] Aeneas had reverenced Minerva first among the immortals on arrival in Italy (in disregard of Helenus' advice to prejudice the worship of Juno); at the end of the poem, the Trojan hero would inadvertently call to mind the goddess who had already effectively played her role in the doom of the Rutulian whose cause, in the end, would prove victorious all the same.[81]

Regardless of whether or not we see implicit references to the goddess Pallas Athena/Minerva in the last book of the epic, we may observe from her direct, named appearances and references how the poet effectively transforms the goddess who was inveterately opposed to the Trojans into a patroness of Rome, indeed a divinity who works both for the Roman, Italian future as she functions as a key element in the defense of Aeneas from harm. Camilla was an imperfect Minerva who was not a master of the domestic arts of the goddess. Her prowess and achievements in battle, however, were unparalleled – and the prayer of the

---

after all, and a failure in another.

[79] Cf. further here P. Schenk, *Die Gestalt des Turnus in Vergils Aeneis*, Königstein 1984, 356 ff. (with consideration of the arrangement of events in Book 10 with respect to Pallas' death and the council of the gods, and larger considerations of the narrative structure and thematic economy of the epic).

[80] Camilla's slayer Arruns is killed, just as Ajax Oileus was slain for his violation of Cassandra; Camilla – incomplete Minerva as she is – meets her own end, despite the signal favor shown to her in death by Diana and Opis. There are shades of the gigantomachy, too, in Aeneas' ascription of Turnus' death to "Pallas" – though the name could refer ambiguously both to goddess and giant (a good reminder of the shifting images and associations of the characters in the poem in light of the final disposition of affairs in Latium) – indeed, Turnus' killing of Pallas can remind one of the action of the giant-vanquishing goddess.

[81] The death of Camilla was the catalyst for Turnus' loss of his best opportunity to win the Latin war at one stroke; without being aware of the background and ramifications of the drama of the close of *Aeneid* 11, Aeneas blames "Pallas" for his killing of Turnus – an invocation and ascription of responsibility that is richly allusive on more than one level.

Latin women to the goddess of wisdom and battle would be answered in ways neither they nor their Trojan enemies could begin to imagine.

Ohio Wesleyan University