

Tracking down *Little Big Man* into the Spanish Culture: From Catalogue to Corpus and Beyond

Carmen Camus Camus
University of Cantabria
Department of Philology

Abstract

This paper tracks down the translation of Thomas Berger's *Little Big Man* into Spanish during Franco's dictatorship. The study constitutes a subsegment of TRACE (Translations Censored), a larger research project which studies the incidence of Franco's censorship in the translations of different cultural areas; its methodology contemplates the compilation of a catalogue of censored translations prior to the selection of the textual corpus material. This study, framed under the Descriptive Translation Studies paradigm and using the TRACE methodology, forms part of research investigating the incidence and effects of Franco's censorship in the translations of American Westerns into the Spanish culture under this regime. During Franco's dictatorship publishers had to submit all works to the state censorship board in order to obtain approval for printing and publishing. In this procedure, for each individual work the censorship board opened a file where all the changes and suppressions dictated by the censorship officials were registered. From the annotations made in these files it is now possible to trace and reconstruct the changes that each work experienced in the translation process and those attributable to the state censorship procedure.

Keywords: translation, censorship, ideology, American Western, *Little Big Man*

1 Introduction

Little Big Man (LBM) was translated into Spanish by Ángel Otal Lacambra and published by Caralt in 1968 under the title *Memorias de un rostro pálido*. According to the official file opened for this novel, the only change dictated by the censors was to the initially proposed title *El piel roja blanco* 'the white redskin'. Nevertheless, the macro-textual analysis revealed the suppression of extensive text segments that affected not only isolated words but entire paragraphs and even the loss of two complete chapters in the translation of the book into Spanish. A three-phase textual analysis failed to reveal why so many substantial changes had been introduced in the Spanish version of the text. The analysis of the reception of the work in the sociocultural context yielded no evidence to explain many of the suppressions introduced; nor was it possible to correlate them with pragmatic effects attributed to censorship. Many of the suppressions identified were not consistent with the censorship criteria found in the TRACEniO catalogue (Translations Censored in the Narrative of the West) for the period the book was published. This led us to perform an exhaustive search for importation files under Berger's name at the *Archivo General de la Administración* (Administration's General Archive) (AGA) in Alcalá de Henares, which is where all the censorship files are kept. This search revealed that the source text (ST) for the Spanish translation of LBM was not the English text published by Dial Press in 1964 but an intermediate French translation

Mémoires d'un visage pâle 'memoirs of a paleface' published by Stock in 1965, which is where most of the suppressions had been introduced.

2 Methodological procedure: TRACEniO catalogue

The study builds on the results of earlier research on the overall incidence and effects of Franco's censorship on the translations of American Westerns into Spanish (Camus 2009; Camus 2010). The investigation, in turn, contributes a tessella to the mosaic of TRACE, a research project which, starting from the AGA censorship files opened for each individual work, studies the incidence of Franco's censorship in the translations of different cultural areas and aims at reconstructing the map of what actually got translated in Spain between 1939 and 1985 and whether translation practices today derive from the censorship constraints imposed during that period. The investigations carried out within TRACE are retrospective and diachronic and follow the rationale provided by Descriptive Translation Studies (Toury 1995) as their epistemological background (Merino Álvarez 2005).

The methodological procedure followed in TRACE contemplates the compilation of a catalogue of censorship files or zero-corpus for the genre and period under study prior to the selection of the textual corpus or corpus 2 (Merino Álvarez 2005; Merino Álvarez & Rabadán 2002). Analysis of the data from the catalogue provides a reliable pattern of the regularities observed which, in turn, constitute a faithful guide in the selection of the text, or set of most representative texts for the genre and period under study. It also allows determination of the incidence of censorship overall and in a given period of the dictatorship, and enables adequate selection of complete texts for corpus 1 according to homogeneous criteria: "the first task is obviously to identify one or more relevant and revealing translations to investigate" (Tymoczko 2002: 18). The preliminary analysis of the texts selected for corpus 1 yields information on the reception the text had in the source and target culture. Macrotextual analysis of the selected texts provides information of official censorship and self-censorship affecting large texts segments, together with editorial policies of publishing houses. Close examination of the textual material allows the selection of those passages affected by censorship that in turn constitute Corpus 2: "the second task will be to pick perspicuous passages that will serve to test one's hypotheses" (Tymoczko 2002:18).

For the span of 1939 to 1975, we compiled the TRACEniO catalogue of 727 censorship files of American Western narratives to establish the pattern of how this genre was affected by censorship. The data from the catalogue allowed us to determine three broad periods differentiated by variations in the application of censorship resolutions (Camus 2010). *Little Big Man* met the criteria for inclusion in our Corpus 1, representing the period after the Press and Print Law was passed in 1966. The analysis of *LBM* followed the aforementioned three-step procedure. The preliminary study examined extratextual factors that could help to situate the works in both the original and target cultures. At the macrotextual level we looked for suppressions or additions of chapters or paragraphs as well as closely examining all the peritextual material surrounding the work. The analysis allowed the identification of differences due to editorial policy including

self-censorship as well as those attributable to the censorship board. And at the micro-textual level carried out on bitextual fragments where effects of censorship were evident, the analysis covered formal changes (modification, addition and suppression: total or partial) and their semantic shifts (addition of new information, intensification, commutation or neutralisation, the latter normally correlated with refocalisation, elevation of style or semantic reduction. This helped in the determination of the text norms underlying the translation process as well as the initial norm followed by the translator. When correlating the formal and semantic changes with their effects at the pragmatic level, we used different censorship criteria depending on the level of analysis: for the macrotextual level, we applied the criteria proposed by Abellán (1980: 88): namely, sexual morality, political opinions, use of language and religion. At the microtextual level, we based the interpretation on the pragmatic effects proposed by Gutiérrez Lanza (2000: 420): a) to favour the socio-political or moral postulates of the regime; b) to limit the form of expression; c) to improve the image of the characters; d) to reduce erotic, suggestive or morbid content (use of violence); and e) others or no pragmatic effect.

The initial data used in this investigation consist of the coupled parallel texts for *LBM*: the source text, written by Berger and published by Dial Press in 1964, and the target text *Memorias de un Rostro Pálido*, translated by Ángel Otañal Lacambra and published by Caralt in 1968. *LBM* is a satirical portrayal of American history and the American dream; the bases of the traditional western myth and icons are demythologised, parodied and subverted. The fictionalised story confronts the Indian and the white worlds and cultures, and raises questions about the truth of the whites' official history. The massacre of the Washita was seen as an obvious reference to the Vietnam War. The story is narrated by Jack Crabb, the 111-year-old sole survivor of the Battle of Little Big Horn. Crabb was brought West as a settler, raised as a Cheyenne, tried his hand at gunfighting and medicine shows, scouted for the cavalry, experimented with the hermit life, was married twice, survived Custer's Last Stand, and sat at the foot of an Indian chief named Old Lodge Skins, who instructed him in the Cheyenne view of creation:

Little Big Man is the story of one Jack Crabb who, at the age of 111, tells of his youthful experiences on the American frontier. At the age of ten he is captured by a band of Cheyenne Indians and brought up as one of them. His boyhood is spent in this way but as a young man he returns to the white men and afterwards passes more than once between the white and the Indian worlds.

In this way Jack Crabb finds himself at a staggering number of famous occasions. (The man to whom he tells his story reckons him "either the most neglected hero in the history of this country or a liar of insane proportions".) He meets, and cheats, Wild Bill Hickok, runs foul of Wyatt Earp, fights at the massacre of the Washita and is the only survivor of Custer's last stand. His story is a panorama of Western history at its most turbulent period and through it Thomas Berger brings the whole scene alive in a way that has never been achieved before. This, one is convinced, is how it was. (Berger 1965a)

3 Brief overview of censorship during Franco's dictatorship

The end of Spanish Civil War in 1939 brought with it the onset of censorship and the beginning of a prolonged period where freedom of expression became no more than a remote chimera. Every single word that was read or pronounced in public, every image projected on the screen, and every dialogue or monologue presented on stage, had inevitably to pass through the Francoist censorship filter; no area of knowledge was spared the effects of its intervention. Right from the beginning of the dictatorship, Franco's government set up a strict mechanism whereby even the slightest artistic or literary manifestation occurring on Spanish soil during his rule had to pass through its sieve. The censorial action performed by the censorship system left a trail in its path and spattered any cultural manifestation generated in Spain during this prolonged time-span. The literary field is one of the areas where the action of censorship left its mark, showing clearly visible traces in some cases.

For the purpose of this study, the Franco regime can roughly be divided in three main periods where the evolving "bonds" between the Church and the regime, together with the successive ministerial changes and law promulgations, gave the fetters of censorship a tighter or looser fit for the regime's morality. The celebration in 1952 of the 35th International Eucharistic Congress in Barcelona served the regime as a letter of introduction to the rest of the world after the ostracism that Spain was subjected to by the dominant political governments during the early years of the dictatorship. This religious event also represented the prelude to a prolonged idyll between the Church and the regime that would culminate in matrimony the following year with the signing of the 1953 Concordat agreement, which, besides conferring on the church advantageous concessions and exemptions, resulted in stringent measures in the censorial realm. This period of strong convergence between the policies of the Church and those of the Franco government is known as *nacional catolicismo*. However, the celebration of the Second Vatican Concilium between 1962 and 1965 opened a breach in the previous monolithic union, causing the close bond between Church and government to end in divorce.

During his term of office at the Ministry of Information and Tourism (1962–1969), Fraga Iribarne is considered to have brought a breath of fresh air to the stale political, social and cultural climate, and was responsible for replacing the timeworn 1938 Censorship Law with the promising 1966 Press and Print Law. In theory, the new law officially abolished compulsory censorship, but in practice censorship procedure continued much as before. According to the 1966 Press and Print Law, publishers could avoid going through the censorship system if they had been authorised for the procedure of *Depósito*, or direct Deposit, of their works, but this licence was only granted to those publishing houses that had previously been assigned a registration number, and this was not easily obtained. Under the new Law, publishers not assigned a registration number could venture and present works directly via Deposit, but ran the risk of having the works confiscated if they transgressed the moral norms of the dictatorship. However, in view of the difficulty in obtaining a registration number and the reluctance to risk confiscation of their works, publishers continued to present their books via the alternative

procedure of “Voluntary Censorship”, a euphemism for compulsory censorship. On going through Voluntary Censorship, a request received one of three censorship dictums: “Approved with no changes”, “Approved with changes” and “Banned”. When the dictum was “Approved with changes”, publishers introduced the “recommended” suppressions to avoid the risk of having their works prohibited, and after the prescribed changes had been sanctioned the work was granted the awaited resolution of *Publicable* ‘publishable’.

Throughout the dictatorship, even though the procedure continued much the same, the censorship criteria were modified according to the minister in charge and the pressures of social demands, especially during the last years of the dictatorship. In the TRACEniO catalogue overall, the average percentage of works Banned or Approved with changes for the Fraga Iribarne period (1962–1969) was 9%, with 4.5% for the span 1962–1965 compared with 16.6% for the interval 1966–1969 (Camus 2009). The advent of the 1966 Press and Print Law meant that publishers, lured by the prospects of a more lenient printing permission, were more daring with regard to the themes considered taboo by the dictatorship: that is, sexual morality, religion, use of improper language or political beliefs. In Spain *LBM* was published by the editorial Caralt in 1968, two years after the 1966 Print and Press Law had been passed, an interval that saw not only the introduction of important changes in the censorship procedure but also, as the data have confirmed, a sharp increase in the works banned or approved with changes.

4 Translation and paratranslation: Ideology or editorial profit

4.1 Preliminary analysis

According to the information contained in AGA file 8571/67, on 24th October, 1967, the publishing house Caralt presented a request to the General Director of Information asking for permission, in accordance with the dictates of the Print and Press Law (16/03/1966 BOE 19/03/1966, no. 67, p. 3), to publish the novel entitled *Memorias de un rostro pálido*, written by Thomas Berger in 1964 and translated into Spanish by Ángel Otal Lacambra. Caralt submitted the censorship form for *Memorias de un rostro pálido* following the “Voluntary Censorship” procedure. The information obtained from the censorship file did not reveal the existence of any censorship intervention. In the file, there was no evidence that any suppressions or modifications had been prescribed. The only trace left of a modification having occurred was a change in the proposed title for the target text (TT) from *El piel roja blanco* to *Memorias de un rostro pálido*, although there was no indication whether this was due to the censors’ direct intervention or whether it was introduced at the publisher’s expense. Our analysis of the catalogue of censorship files for American Westerns (TRACEniO) showed that changing the title initially proposed was common practice; sometimes the change was dictated by the board but on other occasions it was made at the request of the publishing house. In his report the censor recommended that the novel be granted permission for publication without the need to introduce any suppressions. This benevolent dictum coincides with the general trend for Fraga Iribarne’s 8-year term in office, in which direct authorisation was granted to 90% of the westerns analysed in the Catalogue.

4.2 Macrotextual analysis

The macrotextual analysis comparing *LBM* with the Spanish target text (Table 1) revealed that there were substantial changes that had not been recorded in the censorship file. The Spanish edition was two chapters shorter following the complete elimination of one chapter, and the fusion of chapters 9 and 10 into one, with substantial reductions overall, and especially to the Preface and chapter 7. The total number of words decreased from 188,828 to 127,512; whereas there would normally be an increase in the number of words due to the translation process.

<i>Little Big Man</i>	Pages	Words	Pages	Words	<i>Memorias de un rostro pálido</i>
Foreword by a Man of Letters	14	5,646	9	3,397	Prefacio de un hombre de letras
1 A Terrible Mistake	19	8,527	20	8,162	I Un lamentable error
2 Boiled Dog	14	6,024	13	5,205	II Perro hervido
3 I Make an Enemy	9	4,005	8	3,287	III Me gano un enemigo
4 Pronghorn Slaughter	6	2,357			
5 My Education as a Human Being	13	5,871	15	5,543	IV Mi educación de “ser humano”
6 A New Game	13	5,433	13	5,063	V Un nuevo nombre
7 We Take on the Cavalry	17	7,683	14	5,464	VI Nos enfrentamos a la caballería
8 Adopted Again	11	4,852	12	4,796	VII Soy adoptado otra vez
9 Sin	14	6,112	16	6,348	VIII Dos novedades: el pecado y la enfermedad
10 Through the Shutter	13	5,592			
11 Hopeless	6	2,198	6	3,218	IX Sin esperanza
12 Going for Gold	13	5,743	15	5,460	X Buscadores de Oro
13 Cheyenne Homecoming	16	6,625	16	5,768	XI Regreso con los Cheyennes
14 We Get Jumped	13	5,814	13	5,203	XII Ataque a la diligencia
15 Union Pacific	17	7,480	18	7,534	XIII Unión Pacífico
16 My Indian Wife	17	7,588	18	7,569	XIV Mi esposa India
17 In the Valley of Washita	19	8,378	19	7,511	XV El valle de Wishita
18 The Big Medicine of Long Hair	21	9,469	24	9,619	XVI La gran magia de los Cabellos Largos
19 To the Pacific and Back	14	5,965	15	6,078	XVII Pacífico viaje de ida y vuelta
20 Wild Bill Hickok	16	6,953	18	7,124	XVIII Wild Bill Hickok
21 My Niece Amelia	16	7,069	18	7,231	XIX Mi sobrina Amelia
22 Bunco and Buffalo	17	7,319	19	7,648	XX Granujas y bisontes
23 Amelia Makes Good	11	4,796	13	5,204	XXI El éxito de Amelia
24 Caroline	12	4,964	13	5,144	XXII Carolina
25 Custer Again	14	5,768	15	5,817	XXIII Volvemos a ver a Custer
26 Trailing the Hostiles	14	6,001	16	6,249	XXIV Sobre la pista de los rebeldes
27 Greasy Grass	19	7,864	21	8,470	XXV Greasy Grass
28 The Last Stand	14	6,676	16	6,492	XXVI La última resistencia
29 Victory	15	6,562	17	6,531	XXVII La victoria
30 The End	7	2,724	7	2,746	XXVIII El final
Editor’s Epilogue	2	770	3	896	Epílogo
Total	440	188,828	441	127,512	

A translation technique translators or publishers frequently resorted to during the Francoist regime was self-censorship. Therefore, in the absence of any annotation in the cen-

sorship file indicating that changes had been dictated by the censorship board, it can be assumed that all changes and shifts in meaning introduced in the Spanish TT were due to the translator's self-censorship. However, a closer inspection of the suppressed material contrasting *LBM* and *Memorias de un rostro pálido* indicated inconsistencies with the censorship regularities found in the TRACEniO catalogue for the period in which the book was published. So the search at the AGA was extended to the section for imported narratives where a check was performed on all entries for import requests under Berger's name from 1961 to 1969. In that section an entry was located for an application presented by Spinelli on 2nd of February, 1966, requesting authorization to import *LBM* under a French translation published by Editions Stock with the title *Mémoires d'un visage pâle*. As this was the first application presented in the AGA, the French edition was located and contrasted with the Spanish TT.

The macrotextual comparison indicated that the Spanish translation of *LBM* showed a closer connection with the French edition than with the English source text (Table 2). The Spanish translation *Memorias de un rostro pálido* is semantically equivalent to the French title *Mémoires d'un visage pâle*, but not to the source text title *Little Big Man*. However, this evident lack of equivalence between the source and target titles was not considered a relevant indicator of more profound changes, since the first title chosen by the Caralt when presenting the book to the censorship board *El piel roja blanco* contained the term "red", which during the dictatorship had acquired a transgressive connotation (*rojo* was the euphemism used by the Franco regime to refer to the losers of the Spanish Civil War), and was, therefore, systematically banned. As well as the exact equivalence in the title, the most outstanding similarity between the French and Spanish editions resides in the number of chapters (Table 2), which had been cut down to twenty eight in both translations, a substantial reduction from the thirty chapters of the source text. It is worth noticing that, despite the decrease in the number of chapters, the number of pages increased in both the French intermediate translation (TT1), from 440 to 450 pages, and the Spanish edition (TT2), although in this case the increase was minimal, from 440 to 441.

	ST	Intermediate TT1	Spanish TT2
Title	<i>Little Big Man</i>	<i>Mémoires d'un visage pâle</i>	<i>Memorias de un rostro pálido</i> (<i>El piel roja blanco</i>)
Author/ Translator	Thomas Berger	France-Marie Watkins	Ángel Otal Lacambra
Year	1964	1965	1968
Publisher	Dial Press	Editions Stock	Luis de Caralt
Pages	440	450	441
Collection	-	-	<i>Gigante</i>
Place	New York	Paris	Barcelona
Chapters	30	28	28

Close examination of the peritextual material in the French edition confirmed that the intermediate French translation of Berger's *LBM*, *Mémoires d'un visage pâle*, was the

true source text for *Memorias de un Rostro Pálido*, with the Spanish commercial name being a direct translation from French title. Thus, most of the macrotextual suppressions and changes were not attributable to Spanish censorship, but to cuts performed in the French edition before the book was imported and translated into Spanish.

Analysis of the textual material not included in the Spanish TT indicated that the suppressions were performed on various grounds. In the preface, many machista references to Mrs Burr were omitted, together with the disrespectful descriptions of the elderly, as exemplified by those directed at Old Jack Crabb and Mr. Fielding's father. Chapter 4, entitled *Pronghorn slaughter*, was eliminated completely. In the source text, this chapter deals mainly with Cheyenne family and social education, but also with their hunting customs. An antelope hunt was recounted in some detail so that this could be the reason for suppressing the whole chapter in the French translation, as in 1965, when the book was published, there was a growing concern about fair treatment to animals in France. Chapters 9 and 10 were fused into one. The suppressions in these chapters were aimed mainly at improving Reverend Pendrake's image by erasing the portrayal of his gluttony and his use of violence for educational purposes; however, also removed from the depiction of this period in Jack's biography is his juvenile infatuation for Mrs Pendrake. Some other parts were probably eliminated to reduce the length of the novel and in this way make the book more attractive for a wider reading public.

The macrotextual suppressions introduced in the French and Spanish translations could be attributed to various reasons. *Mémoires d'un visage pâle* was translated in 1965, when the feminist movement was gaining momentum in France. The improved image of Mrs Burr in the preface, where there was a reduction of 1,249 words, could be ascribed to feminist demands. This is also true of the "filtered" image of Mrs Pendrake, who was pruned of some of her overwhelming femininity.

In France, cruelty to animals was penalised in the civil code after 1959 and so, as mentioned above, the complete suppression of chapter 4, *Pronghorn slaughter*, which was 2,357 words long, could be attributed to concerns about this legislation.

In chapter 7, where the reduction amounted to 2,219 words, the suppressions were mostly aimed at preserving the image of the Army. Those episodes of extreme violence at the hands of the Army and references to genocide were suppressed, as were the different attitudes of Indians and Army to war. Although France is the cradle of human rights, the 1948 Declaration of Human Rights was not ratified until 1974, possibly due to the accusations of torture during the Algerian War (1954–1962), and, as a result, the issues of cruelty and genocide may have been sensitive issues at the time of the publication of the French translation.

In chapters 9 and 10, part of the reduction of 5,356 words is due to the suppressions aimed at improving the portrayal of Reverend Pendrake and thus protecting the interests of the Church.

4.3 Microtextual analysis

The passage selected for microtextual analysis belongs to chapter 17 in the ST and to chapter 15 in the French TT and Spanish TT. In this passage, Jack Crabb, at the behest of his Indian wife, Sunshine, and in accordance with Cheyenne customs, has sex with her three sisters, Wunhai, Digging Bear and Corn Woman. This passage was chosen because it was generously pruned in the French edition and also because the corresponding scene in Arthur Penn's film was suppressed by the official Censorship Board in Spain (Camus forthcoming). In the ST the chosen extract, which runs from page 237 to 239, contains 21 paragraphs, 69 sentences and 1215 words. This passage also underwent substantial macrotextual modification. In the French TT – and as a result in the Spanish TT – the descriptions corresponding to Digging Bear and Corn Woman were omitted, thus removing 9 consecutive paragraphs and leaving 12 paragraphs, 40 sentences and 708 words for the microtextual analysis. Owing to restructuring of the text, to other suppressions of lower rank and to differences in the conventions for presentation of dialogues, the French TT contains 10 paragraphs, 32 sentences and 584 words, and the Spanish TT, 10 paragraphs, 35 sentences and 525 words.

At this point of his story, Jack finds himself back among the Cheyenne, with his Indian wife about to give birth and by chance, he has just discovered that his white wife, Olga, and son, Gus, are living in the Indian camp. As he lies in his tepee beside Sunshine, thoughts of his former white family (example 1) and other preoccupations (Indian customs, as in example 2) and adolescent reminiscences (example 3) beset him, punctuating the narrative in a kind of centrifugal stream of consciousness that reflects the rather unstable state of the 111-year-old narrator's memory.

- (1) I might have determined to be done with the matter of Olga and Gus, but it was far from done with me.
- (2) Her name meant "Burns"; maybe she had singed her finger when a girl or something.
- (3) When I thought of it she recalled for me my old girl friend Nothing before she got married and turned fat and ill-tempered; poor Nothing was another killed at Sand Creek.

The French TT, however, removes these three references through zero translation (total suppression), the editor or translator presumably considering this material as irrelevant to the narration of the episode to hand, or for consistency since the presence of Nothing in the novel was almost completely removed in cuts made in chapter 7. More difficult to explain is the omission of a sequence of four sentences (example 4) which are directly relevant to the situation as they refer to Sunshine's pregnancy and Jack's eternal dilemma over which set of values to accept – those of the Cheyenne or those of white civilisation – especially in relation to sexual matters:

- (4) I patted Sunshine's belly and withdrew my hand. As usual, my trouble lay in deciding whether I was finally white or Indian. If the former, I had ought to go to sleep: Olga's having went savage was her problem, not mine. On the other

hand, I commenced to realize the responsibility I had for Sunshine's sisters: it wasn't enough to support them.

Whatever the reason for these suppressions, they oblige the translator to repair the coherence of the text, usually through the addition of discourse markers or short linking sentences. Thus, the four suppressions in (4) were replaced by a single addition:

(4a) *Je sais pas trop ce qui s'est passé.* [I don't know too well what happened]

(4b) *No sé exactamente cómo sucedió.* [I don't know exactly how it happened]

In this regard, it should be noted that the French TT maintains the colloquial discourse style that characterises Jack's narration. In (5a) the narrative is interrupted, with the reference to Sunshine's imminent childbirth being replaced by the narrator's voice claiming sincerity for what he is about to recount. In the Spanish TT, however, the narrator's voice is neutral through use of the standard Spanish literary register.

(5) Well, now **I reached over for her, completely forgetting her present condition.**

(5a) *Mais là, du diable si je vous mens* [The devil take me if I'm lying]

(5b) *Pero entonces sucedió como digo* [it happened just as I'm telling you]

A second characteristic of the French TT is that it remains close to the ST except for Jack's most vulgar expressions. When Jack locates the source of his physical discomfort in his groin, euphemistically rendered in French as *bas ventre* 'lower abdomen', he goes on to describe it vividly (example 6), but the French TT omits the explanation completely:

(6) I mean it felt as if I was pursing up there, like a dried apple.

Similarly, when Jack crawls out of Wunhai's bed with the intention of returning to his own, the trouble recurs in a different form:

(7) O.K., I climbed out and tucked her in, **experiencing an odd sensation when a cold draft flushed through my loins.** I reckon I shivered, and another sister-in-law of mine who slept nearby sat up and beckoned to me. When I come to her she whispered: "Shall I put more wood upon the fire?"

(7a) *Et je me suis relevé pour retourner à ma peau de bison en claquant des dents. Là-dessus, voilà qu'une autre belle-soeur se redresse et me demande si j'ai froid...* [And I got up to return to my buffalo skin, my teeth chattering. Then, there's another sister-in-law sits up and asks me if I'm cold]

(7b) *Y yo me levanté para volver a mi piel de bisonte, castañeteando los dientes. Fue entonces cuando otra cuñada se incorporó y me preguntó si tenía frío...* [And I got up to return to my buffalo skin, my teeth chattering. It was then that another sister-in-law sat up and asked me if I was cold]

Here, the French TT not only removes the strange sensation and its physical location, but also reduces and modifies the content related to the second sister-in-law, Digging Bear, for it is here that the major text suppression is introduced. Again the greater formality of the Spanish TT is evident.

Although the French TT has greatly reduced the erotic content of the ST, together with some of its crude realism, possibly to avoid overemphasising these aspects of the text after the removal of the other “irrelevant” material, the translator occasionally includes matter that heightens or emphasises the sexual meaning. Thus, Jack’s exclamation concerning Wunhai, the youngest of the sisters: “My oh my!” is expanded to *Bon Dieu de bon Dieu, c’était quelque chose*, ‘Good Lord, she really was something’. This exclamation was suppressed in the Spanish TT, probably because of the religious and sexual overtones. When Jack has fulfilled his duty to his three sisters-in-law, the French TT stresses the fact with the addition of *Parfaitement*. Again, the added emphasis is omitted in the Spanish TT, which reduces it to the neutral *así*:

- (8) These was all my wives, and I was doing my duty towards them.
- (8a) *Elles étaient toutes mes femmes, et j’accomplissais, comme on dit, mon devoir conjugal. Parfaitement.* [They were all my wives, and I was fulfilling, as it were, my marital duty. Perfectly.]
- (8b) *Ellas eran mis mujeres y yo cumplía así con mi deber conyugal.* [They were my wives and I was fulfilling in that way my marital duty]

As we have seen, the Spanish TT follows the French TT fairly closely in terms of content, but adjusts the text by elevating the style to the style expected of literary texts through the standard Spanish register in a neutral rather than a colloquial style. In addition, the Spanish TT tends to remove certain emphases, especially those which include expressions related to religion, such as God or the devil, which might cause offense to the Church.

However, at this microtextual level, subtle changes were also introduced in the Spanish translation with regard to the French text. In this respect, the most appropriate translation techniques are those of commutation and refocalisation. In the description of Wunhai, Jack alludes to the youthful qualities of her physique:

- (9) I reckon she was about eighteen years of age and **very lithe**.
- (9a) *Elle devait avoir dans les dix-huit ans et elle était rudement souple.* [She must have been about eighteen years old and extremely supple].
- (9b) *Debía tener unos dieciocho años y era sumamente frágil.* [She must have been about 18 years old and was extremely frail.]

In the Spanish TT the flexibility of the young Indian is transformed into frailty, thus reducing the eroticism implied both in the ST and the French TT.

In example (10b), the Spanish TT corrects the French TT by switching *Indiennes* ‘Indian women’ back to *indios* ‘Indians’, which reflects the general reference to ‘Indians’

in the ST, but also shows a partial addition (*violenta* ‘violent’), which in fact intensifies the sexual meaning.

- (10) After a time it occurred to me that I was feeling lust in a different form from any I had hitherto knowned, especially while with the **Indians**.
- (10a) *Si bien qu’au bout d’un moment j’ai compris que j’étais pris d’une crise de luxure comme j’en avais jamais eue encore, surtout tant que j’étais avec les **Indiennes**.* [Well, after a time I realised that I was feeling an attack of lust like I had never had before, especially while I was with Indian women].
- (10b) *Al cabo de un instante comprendí que me acometía una **violenta** crisis de lujuria. Nunca me había sucedido desde que estaba con los **indios**.* [After a time I realised that I was being assailed by a violent attack of lust. This had never happened while I had been with the Indians].

It is also significant that the Spanish TT removes the comparison present both in English and French, and by doing so refocuses the perspective of the narrative, separating the Indians and, therefore, viewing them from the outside and judging them by external standards. Similarly, when Jack has fulfilled his duty with his three sisters-in-law, he insists that his actions be judged by Cheyenne standards (example 11).

- (11) I maybe said too much already, for I cannot impress upon you too earnestly that my activities that night were by Cheyenne standards the opposite of **loose morals**.
- (11a) *Ma foi, probable que vous avez déjà deviné le reste, et je m’en vais pas m’éterniser à vous raconter tout ça, parce que vous vous feriez de mauvaises idées, et vous auriez peut-être du mal à comprendre que mes activités de cette nuit-là étaient, selon la morale cheyenne, à l’opposé de **la lubricité**.* [Well, probably you have guessed the rest, and I’m not going to bore you by telling you all that, because you would get the wrong idea, and you might find it difficult to understand that my activities that night were according to Cheyenne morals the opposite of licentiousness.]
- (11b) *Tal vez adivinéis el resto y no voy a entretenerme en contarlo, pues os forjaría malas ideas y resulta difícil comprender que desde el punto de vista cheyenne, lo sucedido era todo lo contrario de **un rapto de lujuria**.* [Perhaps you can guess the rest and I shan’t dwell on it by telling it all, for you might get the wrong idea and it is difficult to understand that from the Cheyenne point of view, what happened was quite the opposite of an attack of lust.]

The French text adds considerable moralising, but also stresses that it is the Cheyenne ethical code that serves as the yardstick. In addition, both the ST and the French TT separate what Jack felt, namely “lust” or *luxure* (example 10), from the moral concept, “loose morals” and *lubricité* ‘licentiousness’ (example 11). In contrast, the Spanish TT refers to the “Cheyenne point of view”, thereby implying a contrasting viewpoint, which is conveyed through the repetition of *lujuria* (lust) in (10b) and (11b); this, as one of the deadly sins, implies a moral condemnation of the behaviour, which is consistent with the precepts propounded by the Franco regime.

The microtextual analysis has shown that the main modifications to the passage took place in the translation of the ST into French. The suppressions and changes introduced in the French TT were due to self-censorship on the part of the translator or the publisher or both in collaboration, since there was no official censorship in France at the time. The suppressions appear to be aimed at reducing material considered superfluous to the episode analysed, possibly under space constraints, but also removed content of a sexual nature, particularly the strongest expressions. This appears to contrast with other uses of improper language in passages not dealing with sex (example 12), which reflect the general tendency of the French text to maintain the colloquial style of the narrative and to retain most of the semantic meaning:

- (12) “All right then, **you blue-arsed, buffalo-balled, piss-drinking skunk**, then I’ll knock your f_____ teeth out,”
- (12a) *Très bien, espèce de fumier de cul de bison buveur de pisse, je m’en vais te faire sauter ton dentier de ...!* [All right, **you piss-drinking buffalo-assed dungheap**, I’m going to blast your ... teeth out.]
- (12b) *¡Muy bien, especie de bisonte, voy a hacer saltar tus dientes de...!* [All right, **you buffalo**, I’m going to blast your ... teeth out.]

Some reduction in the semantic representation is evident in the French translation, in which *espèce de ...* is a formula introducing terms of scorn and *fumier*, literally ‘dung-heap’, is used figuratively to represent any despicable person and, therefore, a suitable translation replacement for “skunk”. In contrast, practically all the offensive language has been removed from the Spanish version. This is consistent with the general tendency to elevate the register in Spanish translations of Westerns, which not only purged bad language but also removed colloquialisms and violations of grammar. Thus, in *LBM* the rich linguistic characterisation of Jack Crabb is completely lost for Spanish readers through the use of the standard Spanish register. At the microtextual level, therefore, the initial norm followed by the Spanish translator was to adapt the contents of the work to achieve linguistic acceptability. Nevertheless, as has been shown, subtle semantic shifts were introduced with regard to the French TT, which acted as the intermediate ST; these were achieved through modifications, rather than suppressions or additions, and at the pragmatic level were aimed mainly at further reducing the erotic content of the passage.

5 Conclusion

The Descriptive Translation Study performed on Berger’s *Little Big Man* has served to illustrate the need to move beyond the limits of the textual borders in order to establish the genuine source text of any given translation, especially in a censorship context such as that outlined in this investigation. In our study, the TRACEniO catalogue proved an accurate compass to guide our rejection of the initial results derived from contrasting ST and TT. It has been shown that all the suppressions introduced at the macrotextual level were performed in the French translation before *Little Big Man* arrived in the Spanish culture and was translated into Spanish. This confirms that censorship extended beyond the ideological constraints of the dictatorship, and as Peleg (1993) affirms, that censor-

ship is a global phenomenon present not only in totalitarian regimes like Franco's dictatorship, but also in a democratic and liberal country such as France was in the mid-sixties, when the book was translated into French. The microtextual analysis has revealed a greater number of changes at the formal and semantic level between the ST and the French TT than between this intermediate ST and the Spanish TT. In the latter, the changes introduced at the microtextual level either due to translator self-censorship or editorial policy were aimed at reducing the erotic content of the passage. In this context, Jack's vernacular dialect is translated into standard Castilian Spanish, which meant the loss of the rich linguistic characterisation in his narrative voice. In both French and Spanish translations, the initial norm was inclined towards the pole of acceptability. The study has shown the importance of tracing any given translation beyond the trails of its source text.

References

Research material

Berger, Thomas 1964. *Little Big Man*. New York: Dial Press.

Berger, Thomas 1965a. *Little Big Man*. London: Eyre & Spottiswoode Publishers.

Berger, Thomas 1965b. *Mémoires d'un visage pale*. Paris: Stock. Translated by France-Marie Watkins.

Berger, Thomas 1968. *Memorias de un rostro pálido*. Barcelona: Luis de Caralt. Translated by Ángel Otal Lacambra.

Censorship File Nº. 8571/67. *El piel roja blanco (Memorias de un rostro pálido)*. Archivo General de la Administración, Sección de Inspección de Libros.

Works cited

Abellán, Manuel L. 1980. *Censura y creación literaria en España (1939–1975)*. Barcelona: Ediciones Península.

Camus, Carmen 2009. Traducciones Censuradas de Novelas y Películas del Oeste en la España de Franco. Unpublished Ph.D. thesis. Universidad del País Vasco, Vitoria (Spain)

Camus, Carmen 2010. Censorship in the translations and pseudotranslations of the West. In Daniel Gile, Gyde Hansen & Nike K. Pokorn (eds.) *Why Translation Studies Matters*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 41–56.

Camus, Carmen (forthcoming). Tracing the Voyage of Arthur Penn's *Little Big Man* into the Spanish Culture: Reception of the Film and Censorship Constraints. To appear in Hannu Kemppanen, Leena Kolehmainen, Pekka Kujamäki & Esa Penttilä (eds.) *Beyond Borders – Studies on Translated Literature*. Berlin: Frank & Timme.

Gutiérrez Lanza, Camino 2000. *Traducción y censura de textos cinematográficos en la España de Franco: Doblaje y subtulado inglés-español (1951–1975)*. León: Universidad de León.

Merino Álvarez, Raquel 2005. From Catalogue to Corpus in DTS: Translations Censored under Franco. The TRACE Project. *Revista Canaria de Estudios Ingleses* 51, 85–103.

Merino Álvarez, Raquel & Rabadán, Rosa 2002. Censored translation in Franco's Spain: the TRACE Project – Theatre and Fiction (English-Spanish). *Traduction, Traductologie, Rédaction* XV (2), 125–152.

Peleg, Ilan 1993. Censorship in the Global and Comparative Perspective: An Analytical Framework. In Ilan Peleg (ed.) *Patterns of Censorship around the World*. Boulder: West View Press, 3–15.

Toury, Gideon 1995. *Descriptive Translation Studies and Beyond*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

Tymoczko, Maria 2002. Connecting the Two Infinite Orders: Research Methods in Translation Studies. In Theo Hermans (ed.) *Crosscultural Transgressions*. Manchester, UK: St. Jerome, 7–25.