

# Reflective documentation in arts education

# Expanding ways of thinking through multimodal, embodied practices

Eeva Anttila

University of the Arts Helsinki eeva.anttila@uniarts.fi

Taneli Tuovinen
University of the Arts Helsinki
taneli.tuovinen@uniarts.fi

Liisa Jaakonaho University of the Arts Helsinki liisa.jaakonaho@uniarts.fi **ABSTRACT** 

The purpose of this article is to describe the development of a pedagogical research approach entitled reflective documentation. The context for this inquiry is an Erasmus+ project entitled Pedagogy of Imaginative Dialogues (PIMDI). The practical examples are drawn from the PIMDI project. For fuller appreciation of the multimodal nature of reflective work and reflective documentation, we have created an exposition on Research Catalogue portal. As the outcome of this artistic pedagogical research project, we propose that reflective documentation can be seen in connection with artistic research and visual ethnography as an open-ended process, without the traditional requirement to show what really happened.

**KEYWORDS** 

reflective documentation; embodied reflection; art pedagogy; artistic-pedagogical research; artistic research

DOI

10.54916/rae.136528

DATE OF PUBLICATION

22/11/2024





#### Introduction

The purpose of this article is to describe the development of a pedagogical research approach entitled reflective documentation in the context of an Erasmus+ project entitled *Pedagogy of Imaginative Dialogues* (PIMDI). We will start by situating our inquiry within the aims and contents of PIMDI and proceed by presenting how the meanings and purposes of reflection and reflective practices in education have diversified over time, as well as how embodied and multimodal practices have expanded these practices. We will complement and contest relevant literature on reflection by recent work on pedagogical documentation (Lenz Taguchi, 2010). We will arrive at a working definition of reflective documentation that extends beyond linguistic processing. Through multimodal, embodied, and artistic practices reflective documentation allows creating new realities, rather than mirroring what already exists. The practical examples are drawn from so-called intensive weeks that were arranged as part of the PIMDI project. For fuller appreciation of the multimodal nature of reflective work and reflective documentation, we have created an exposition on Research Catalogue portal and refer to it where appropriate. The reader can open the exposition alongside this article by following this <u>link</u>. A list of selected practices with links to each of them can be found at the end of the section entitled "Practicing Reflective Documentation" below. We will then connect reflective documentation with artistic research and visual ethnography. The exposition proposes a research insight where reflective documentation can be seen as an open-ended artistic and ethnographic research process that defies the traditional requirement to show "what really happened." The aim of this article is to explore the significance of embodied, multimodal practices in reflective documentation to support thinking, knowing, and learning in the context of arts education, and beyond.

### The PIMDI Project

As noted above, our inquiry on reflective documentation is situated within a strategic partnership project entitled *Pedagogy of Imaginative Dialogues* (PIMDI). The partnership was initiated by the Master of Education in Arts at Hanze University of Applied Sciences in Groningen (in collaboration with Stenden University in Leeuwarden), the Netherlands. The project involves three other partners: The Master of Arts Education at the Iceland Academy of the Arts in Reykjavik, Iceland, The Master of Fine Arts at the University of Agder, Norway, and the Master of Dance Pedagogy at Uniarts Helsinki, Finland. The project has allowed these programs to complement each other's expertise and share pedagogical approaches in exploring the notion of pedagogy of imaginative dialogues, focusing specifically on the theme "the paradox of democratization."

By the paradox of democratization, we refer to a society that becomes more and more diverse and at the same time increasingly polarized. The purpose of this project was to find ways to tackle this paradox through art and in so doing, respond to a more general problem, the waning of shared values. Democratization here refers to the simultaneous presence of widely divergent perspectives in the public sphere. While stimulating diversity, democracy runs the risk of losing a common ground that allows interaction between diverse perspectives.

The starting point for *Pedagogy of Imaginative Dialogues* was to accept the tensions between incompatible differences as possibilities for productive and engaging explorations. The aim was not to overcome or mediate these differences, but to let them co-exist so that the contrast between them could be played out in a fruitful and non-violent manner. During the three-year project the partners have worked together in developing pedagogical approaches for fostering 'imaginative dialogues' that may contribute to re-establishing a shared 'third space' (Bhabha, 1994) of interaction. The aim was to support participants in focusing on the act of valuing as such and exploring unarticulated inconsistencies and contradictions.

#### Intensive Weeks and Intellectual Outputs

The PIMDI project included four intensive weeks, one organized in each of the partner-countries. During these weeks, students and teachers jointly researched how the arts can contribute to a society that embraces diversity and polyphony. In addition to working in universities, exploring imaginative dialogues took place in retirement homes, an art museum, and schools, engaging senior citizens and youngsters.

The collaboration highlighted cultural, professional, and personal differences. Such differences were inspiring sources for arts educational practice. They also ignited discussion about vulnerability, safety, and transgression. The tension between safety and transgression is a pedagogically crucial question on how to suspend immediate reactions related to tensions and frictions caused by differences in educational or artistic practice. The situations we encountered highlighted the contrast between the creative urge to experiment and push differences to the limit and the need for safety and connection. This contrast can be seen to embody the paradox of democratization concretely. Students, for example, indicated that they need more time and space for the joint process in order to discover and appreciate the polyphony of voices. It became evident that dialogical, 'third spaces' (Bhabha, 1994) need to be contained in a pedagogically safe atmosphere, which is created by consistency, clarity, transparency, dialogue, and awareness of power relations. In this understanding, we were informed by the notion of brave space (Arao & Clements, 2013), "a space where we can be in touch with

ourselves as complex human beings" (Jones, 2020, as cited in Haapoja, 2021, p. 10).

As all Erasmus+ projects, the PIMDI project included so-called intellectual outputs. In PIMDI, each partner was responsible for one intellectual output although all of them were developed collaboratively. We – authors of this article - were responsible for an intellectual output entitled Reflective Documentation. The aim was to present and crystallize main insights from reflective work that was facilitated throughout the project. It consisted of utilizing and developing embodied and multimodal methods for reflecting artistic and pedagogical practices. Further, the aim was to support transformative learning in the arts through these methods. Our starting point for developing these approaches was the notion of democracy as social and public practice. In so doing, the aim was to make space for each participant's agency through multiple processes of affecting-being affected, not only through conceptual, but also through imaginative, artistic, and multisensory means. The method for documenting and reflecting upon arts pedagogical practice is also visible in a video compilation that illuminates some moments from the intensive weeks. In this, the expertise of activist artist Riikka Theresa Innanen was invaluable as she has developed an approach to video documentation in Parallax mode which means using several cameras simultaneously without any predetermined camera user or standpoint. Some excerpts of the video documentation/compilation are presented also in our Research Catalogue exposition (see section "Practicing Reflective Documentation" below). In addition, methods of multimodal, embodied reflection have been collected to the PIMDI digital toolkit (see PIMDI, 2024a). Next, we will give a brief overview of how the meanings of reflection and reflective practices in educational contexts have expanded and diversified over time.

### Expanding Pedagogical Meanings of Reflection

During recent decades reflection has become acknowledged as an essential element in the development of professional expertise and as the core of adult learning. Overall, the term refers to a systematic way of thinking by which people learn from their experiences, or to a meaning-making process that moves learners from one experience to the next with a better understanding of their experiences (Sööt & Anttila, 2018).

The notion of reflective practice is rooted in pragmatism, especially in John Dewey's (1859-1952) work. He defined reflection as "active, persistent, and careful consideration of any belief or supposed form of knowledge in light of the grounds that support it and the further conclusions to which it tends" (Dewey, 1933, p. 9). Reflective practice became widely known through the work by another American philosopher Donald Schön (1930-1997) who distinguished reflection-in-action from

reflection-on-action (Schön, 1983; 1987). The latter refers to the process where attention is drawn on the activity after it has been completed. Reflection-in-action, on the other hand, refers to the skills and knowledge that individuals show by their actions but cannot verbalize directly or in detail. The notion of this kind of inner or wordless knowing leans on Michael Polanyi's (1967) theory on tacit knowledge. We will shortly connect this kind of knowledge with embodied, multimodal reflection practices acknowledging that human beings know more than they can tell.

The Dutch-born philosopher Max van Manen (1942–) has presented the notion of thoughtful action that applies especially to teachers' professional practice. For van Manen (1991), teachers' thoughtful action is "thinkingly attentive to what it does without reflectively distancing itself from the situation" (p. 109). This sensitive responsiveness allows a person to perceive and read the other person's actions and presence. Distancing oneself from the moment leads to a different kind of thinking. Van Manen reserves the term "reflection" for this distanced thinking. The modes of thoughtful action, thus, can be seen to range from intuitive thoughtfulness of immediate improvisational acting to a more self-conscious thoughtfulness of mediated improvisational action (1991, p. 113; see also van Manen, 1995; 2015).

Still another American, the sociologist Jack Mezirow (1923-2014) developed the notion of critical reflection which refers to reflection on one's presuppositions and beliefs. This kind of reflection is a key element in transformative learning and widely applied in adult education (see, for example, Mezirow, 1990). Another important scholar in the field of critical reflection is the Brazilian educational reformist Paulo Freire (1921-1997). He coined the notion of praxis, which refers to unity of reflection and action. Praxis leads to conscientization, that is, a critical consciousness that implies action that changes reality (Freire, 1972).

In Finland, the educational scholar Kaisu Mälkki (2011) has taken Mezirow's theory further, claiming that the cognitive and rational dimensions of reflection have been overemphasized. For Mälkki, the very process of reflection is by nature inherently inseparable from emotions (2011). She argues that reflection has often been referred to only as a linguistic mode of understanding that relies mostly on conceptual knowing (Anttila & Löytönen, 2010; Mälkki, 2011). For broadening the meaning of reflection and for developing its pedagogical applications in reflective practices, several scholars have introduced the notion of embodied reflection (Kinsella, 2007; Löytönen, 2008; Sööt, 2018). Embodied reflection draws from literature on bodily, or embodied knowledge, especially from phenomenology (e.g., Merleau-Ponty, 1962). In recent decades, embodied knowledge, as well as the notion of embodied cognition, have gained ground in several scholarly fields, including cognitive science, neuroscience, and linguistics (Damasio, 1999; Lakoff & Johnson, 1999).

The notion of bodily consciousness is closely connected to these traditions. It refers to being attuned to bodily sensations and states that operate largely at the pre-reflective level of consciousness. Facilitating body-mind integrity and developing sensitivity to bodily experiences is possible through different pedagogical approaches, or simply through attending, or listening to the body (see Anttila, 2007). Bodily consciousness is connected to affects, emotions, and feelings as they are largely bodily processes (Damasio, 1999). Facilitating the interplay between different levels of consciousness is the core of embodied reflection.

In her study on emotions in the everyday life of dance teachers Teija Löytönen (2008) together with the participants explored different forms of embodied reflection. Based on this study attuning to the embodied understanding can be understood as the foundation for the collective cultural meaning-making that relies both on the nonverbal and the verbal levels of communication (Löytönen, 2008).

In another study within dance education, Anu Sööt (2018) focused on embodied reflection methods in the context of novice dance teachers. Sööt found that bringing attention to students' body-mind integration may counterbalance the pursuit of the quality of external performance.

Based on Sööt's and Löytönen's studies it can be argued that reflective approaches focusing on body-mind integration should be emphasized more in arts education, and in educating all teachers. These approaches enhance students' own professional development and provide them with means for supporting their future students' learning process. Listening to bodily sensations, expressing them for example in movement, images, sound, or text, and jointly discussing these processes requires both conceptual and practical knowledge on various methods of embodied reflection. The important question is how to provide the time, space, and support for embodied reflection.

Understanding how the meanings and purposes of reflective practices in education have expanded and diversified over time has been important for us in developing reflective documentation as a pedagogical practice. We acknowledge that all these layers and modes of thinking on and about experiences, perceptions, and knowledge are valid and valuable in learning. Multimodal, embodied, and artistic ways of thinking and creating knowledge complement and expand verbal processing in many ways and have great impact on what kinds of language and knowledge emerge in artistic and educational contexts.

Next, we will turn to another area of literature that has been influential for us in developing the notion of reflective documentation: the notion of pedagogical documentation coined by Hillevi Lenz Taguchi (2010). This notion introduces more recent approaches of new materialist views on theorizing learning and education. It enriches our theoretical framework as it emphasizes unexpectedness of what becomes learned, challenges

human-centered approaches to education, and acknowledges multiple, emerging realities.

## Pedagogical Documentation

The notion of pedagogical documentation has been developed in the context of early childhood education. In our view, it has great potential in higher arts education and beyond. For Lenz Taguchi (2010), pedagogical documentation is a material-discursive apparatus. It is not a method, but rather focuses on understanding the complexities of pedagogical practices and accepting the unexpected outcomes of learning. Pedagogical documentation is in itself an active agent in generating discursive knowledge and in constructing meaning. This means that documentation is not a thing, but a doing. It does and performs. Then, what kind of documentation we produce and collect matter, and how we use the apparatuses of observation, matters as well.

According to Lenz Taguchi (2010) "meaning is an ongoing performance in a play or dance of different agentic bodies/matter, trying to make themselves intelligible to one another" (p. 63). She leans on Karen Barad's idea that "we are part of that nature we seek to understand" (Barad 2007, p. 67, cited in Lenz Taguchi 2010, p. 69). In pedagogical documentation the observer and the apparatus used for observation together create a specific constructed cut.<sup>2</sup> This means that there is no inherent distinction between the object and the agencies of observation. The cut, as a piece of documentation, or as a performative agent, will put things in motion by means of its own agentic force and materiality (Lenz Taguchi, 2010).

Moreover, pedagogical documentation may create a temporary territory or space where a constructed cut of the event is actualized and from which further intra-activity emerges, thus "becoming other than itself" (Lenz Taguchi, 2010, p. 66). This is how pedagogical documentation may put in motion processes of learning and new becoming. It is important to note that a constructed cut of an event is not a representation of the world, and that we can produce a multiplicity of differentiated knowledge from a specific event (Lenz Taguchi, 2010).

Pedagogical documentation is closely connected to the notion of intra-action – a concept coined by Karen Barad (2007) – and intra-active pedagogy where the binary between theory and practice, or thinking and doing, is dissolved. Pedagogical documentation and intra-active pedagogy challenge reductive and limited learning strategies as they open new ways of thinking, acting and experiencing (Snellman, 2018).

There are two directions in pedagogical documentation: the circular and the horizontal. They often take place simultaneously but can be

distinguished conceptually. The circular movement is about slowing down the pedagogical or artistic process and happens through either *re-enactment or counter-actualization*. In re-enacting a certain, for example videotaped pedagogical or artistic event it becomes lived again. This means that documentation is not a recording of the event but a re-enactment where new connections may emerge between things. It is also about delaying the space between perception and action, about staying with the experience, so that it can be sensed more intensely. After that new meanings and actions may arise. Counter-actualization refers to opening up new possibilities through pedagogical documentation. It means viewing, interpreting, or exploring the documentation from a new perspective or position, for example taking the role of another person when viewing a videotaped pedagogical or artistic event (Lenz Taguchi, 2010).

The horizontal movement of pedagogical documentation is about accelerating the pedagogical or artistic process. When the flow of events becomes faster, the pedagogical space may transform into a smooth space.<sup>3</sup> This makes it possible to let go of habitual ways of thinking and acting. The horizontal movement can happen at any time, and it may generate so-called lines of flight.<sup>4</sup> Then the learning or creative process becomes detached from normative, habitual frames, allowing new fields of thinking and action to emerge. Here, we see a connection to critical reflection and transformative learning (Mezirow, 1990; Mälkki, 2011). According to Lenz Taguchi (2010), the horizontal movement transforms the pedagogical space so that "it becomes the event of un-thought possibilities that leaps away from immobile over-coded striated spaces ... This is when we extend ourselves in creativity and are transformed as thinking and embodied beings" (p. 99).

We are aware that Lenz Taguchi and many other scholars who align with posthumanist, new materialist thinking are critical of the notion of reflection, stating that it produces sameness, rather than differences. They, leaning on Haraway (1992) and Barad (2007), rather use the notion of diffraction. The overview of theories we have explored above illuminates that the notion of reflection has many definitions and cannot be reduced to mere mirroring reality. For us, embodied and multimodal reflective practices, combined with various methods of documentation, connect human meaning-making with the non-human, material surroundings and forces, and in so doing, reach beyond verbal language and rational thinking. As a practice it has potential to generate differences and open up new views on the world, as we will discuss below.

#### **Practicing Reflective Documentation**

Embodied and multimodal approaches to reflective documentation can take many forms, as discussed in the previous sections. Embodied practices often take the form of bodily action but can also refer to attending to inner bodily sensations and for example, embodied memories (Anttila, 2004; Reiners, 2001) without actual physical movement. The sensory modality in such embodied practices is often referred to as kinesthetic modality, although other systems that rely on sensory information from within the body may also become activated (see, for example, Cohen, 1993). Although all sensory systems are embodied and situated within the body, the term multimodality complements the kinesthetic modality. It refers to visual, auditive, and tactile sensory channels, as well as to the various combinations of these modalities.

Various embodied and multimodal reflective documentation practices were applied in the PIMDI project, and a wealth of material, or constructed cuts, were created and collected during the three-year project. This exploration took place not only during the intensive weeks, but also among the teachers who formed a professional learning community that served as a forum for testing, contesting, sharing, discussing and writing about these practices.

The covid-19 pandemic postponed the first intensive week by six months. Meanwhile, in December 2020 and January 2021, the teachers met online for kick-off meetings over four full days. During these days teachers gave each other tasks and propositions. From the onset, most teachers included some form of reflective practice and multimodal documentation in these tasks. These initial explorations can be already considered as approaches to reflective documentation. Each teacher brought something from their previous practices for sharing with the PIMDI community. Thus, the practices are not entirely "new." Rather, framing them as reflective documentation has transformed the way we understood and employed these practices.

Below, we present a list of examples of reflective documentation practices. We have chosen and compiled these examples from a wide variety of activities. Our aim has been to display how various sensory modalities may be activated and combined with textual, verbal reflections. Another consideration has been ethical. We have chosen not to display any material that might reveal students' identities. Thus, the material is mainly generated by teachers who participated in the project. A more complete compilation of activities and practices can be found on PIMDI project website (see PIMDI, 2024b).

The list only includes the name of the practice or event – what we call a constructed cut. The practices are described in more detail in the Research Catalogue exposition (see Research Catalogue, 2024). Each example includes some form of multimodal documentation and a brief discussion about the activity. We hope that the reader will be able to delve into the following examples of reflective documentation experiments and find resonance between the theoretical premises presented above.

- Listening walk
- 2. Multimodal spiral with a fly
- 3. Collective drawing
- 4. Reflections on string dance
- 5. Proposition for Embodied reflection
- 6. Radical listening
- 7. Wet stones
- 8. Haiku
- 9. Parallax

These examples highlight how reflective documentation can be seen as an artistic, pedagogical, and scholarly practice that aims to connect thinking, feeling, sensing, and action to problematize the question of documentation itself. In drawing from broad theoretical sources delineated above, reflective documentation can take many forms and be applied in various educational, academic, and artistic contexts. The key idea is for participants to simultaneously engage in both reflection and documentation and in so doing, enhance a two-way 'traffic' between these activities. In this manner, reflective practices become documented as they happen, and in turn, the documentation feeds content back to reflective practice, stimulating new cycles of reflective activity. As they become manifest in multimodal and social forms, the contents of reflection become accessible to many interpretations, tangible, and shared. Giving time to sharing the "cuts" and letting new thoughts and ideas - in other words, differences - emerge through this process of sharing is important for transformative learning to occur.

# Connecting Reflective Documentation with Artistic Research and Visual Ethnography

For us, reflective documentation as practice is connected with artistic research, or, more precisely, it could serve as one of its applications, specifically in the field of research documentation. The materials and documentations are not understood as mere representations of reality but artistic propositions or imaginative expressions. Leaning on the notion of *constructed cut* described above, reflective, embodied, and multimodal documentation highlights the more or less consciously chosen aspects and traces of events in space and time. The process of constructing involves aesthetic, intuitive, and imaginative choices and deliberations, in addition to some level of systematism. This means

that reflective documentation can also be seen as a form or a method of artistic research.

Artistic research as a methodological paradigm is rooted in artistic, embodied, experimental, and performative practices of artists and arts educators (e.g. Borgdorff, 2012; Hannula et al., 2014; Varto, 2018). Artistic research can be seen to parallel a broader transformation and call for change in academia, which fosters "non-discursive knowledge forms, unconventional research methods and enhanced means of documentation and presentation, as witnessed by developments in areas such as visual anthropology and cultural studies" (Schwab & Borgdorff, 2014, p. 13). International and networked activities around the Journal for Artistic Research (JAR), the Society for Artistic Research (SAR) and the Artistic Research Catalogue (ARC) project operate across the boundaries of different national frameworks, inside and outside academic institutions, creating new possibilities for the academic publication of artistic research (Schwab & Borgdorff, 2014).

What is particularly interesting in light of our work in PIMDI and the notion of reflective documentation is the ways in which many artistic researchers approach documentation as something that not only captures the practices, but also translates them to other mediums. This translation can be seen as an ongoing experimental and methodological process, which calls for a critical reflection on questions around the contexts, processes, and ethics of artistic (research) practices (see Condit & Jaakonaho, 2017). In the PIMDI project, the practices of documentation rise from the artistic, pedagogic, and reflective practices that take place during the meetings and research work. This entanglement resembles the ways in which artistic researchers incorporate embodied practices, documentation, reflection, and academic publishing as ongoing non-linear processes (see Tuovinen & Mäkikoskela, 2020).

Along with artistic research, contemporary methodological approaches of visual and sensory ethnography resonate with the multimodal reflective documentation practices of PIMDI. Visual ethnography can be described as "the study of visual forms and visual systems in their cultural context" (Kharel 2015, p. 153, cited by Hermans, 2022). According to Pink (2008) visual ethnography makes use of film, photography and other media in the process of research, analysis, and dissemination. Its aim is to provide a detailed and in-depth understanding of a particular culture, society, or community. Photographs are seen as material traces that not only describe or illustrate a social phenomenon but also open up to new interpretations and meanings (see Hermans, 2022).

In line with visual ethnography, the images of the events are not considered representations of an objective world. Instead, they convey and communicate embodied meanings. Visual ethnography engages with audio-visual material throughout the whole research process. It often involves reflexive engagement, "a knowing in practice" (Pink, 2008,

p. 2) that seeks for an embodied understanding of social or cultural phenomena.

Like visual ethnography, sensory ethnography is a critical methodology that understands ethnography as reflexive and experiential processes. The starting point of sensory ethnography is the understanding of experience, perception, knowing, and practice as multisensorial. Sensory ways of experiencing and knowing are seen as integral both to the lives of people who participate in research, and to researchers in their practices (Pink, 2015). Sensory ethnography stems from a broader movement in the social sciences and humanities, described by Howes (2003) as a "sensorial turn," which brings forth the acknowledgement that "sensoriality is fundamental to how we learn about, understand and represent other people's lives" (Pink, 2015, p. 3). Ethnographic work on the senses has developed in close connection with arts practices that pay attention to senses, through collaborative and creative explorations across the fields of art and research (Pink, 2015).

In our view, in relation to artistic research and sensory ethnography, reflective documentation has considerable potential both as a research methodology and pedagogical practice. Reflective documentation as practice can also connect pedagogy and research in various settings and ways. In concluding this article, we acknowledge that developing the notion of reflective documentation has not been simple and that it needs to be experimented and articulated further. Next, we will pose some questions for future developments that we hope to ignite discussions and explorations among artists, arts educators, and researchers.

#### Conclusions

Developing reflective documentation as a multimodal and embodied practice has been an exciting and challenging process for us. We have turned the notion around several times: at times focusing on documenting reflective practice, and then, documenting practices with a reflective approach. Throughout the project, we have circled around the term and at times, felt that we are getting closer to understanding what it might mean in practice. Practice has thus been in the core of this artistic-pedagogical project.

The need to develop reflective documentation derives from the pedagogical research sites in art and education. The purpose of this project has been to develop new insights to the methodology of documentation and reflection through the artistic and art pedagogical research practices. As researchers in the arts and pedagogy we have described how the context of research in the arts could inform us to rethink the possibilities of documenting and reflecting.

Our approach to reflective documentation is a proposition to explore documentation and reflection as artistic pedagogical research. We see them as methodologies for exploring the means and meanings of the documentation itself without the traditional requirement to establish a consensus about what really happened, to go beyond mirroring reality, and to create new ways of meaning-making. As we have explained, this means that the procedures of documentation and reflection are free to extend beyond linguistic processing, towards creating alternative interpretations, constructions, and diffractions.

By stepping out of the traditional way of approaching research documentation many relevant questions arise which deserve further research: Who do we identify as the collaborating agents in artistic/reflective/multimodal documentation processes and why? How do we define and situate the reflective outcomes of artistic research collaborations? How do we discuss authorship/copyright/consent in relation to the role of different participants and agents? How can we demonstrate and share these questions/negotiations with the means of artistic, multimodal, exploratory practices in a way that does justice to the complexity of the process that is being reflected and documented? We will continue researching these questions further both collaboratively and in new contexts, and we hope that this article will encourage artists and arts educators, and many others, to explore it in their work.

#### **Endnotes**

- **1.** According to Innanen, Parallax is both a pedagogical principle and a methodological proposition for the Reflective Documentation in PIMDI partnership. The aim was to facilitate a collective yet personal record of the intensive weeks, without losing the layered complexity of multifaceted experiences and processes. The term parallax is borrowed in this context from astronomy. In astronomy, the parallax of two observation points is used to calculate the distance between celestial bodies.
- **2.** Lenz Taguchi also uses the term "agential cut" coined by Barad (2007). Agential cut emphases the agency of the material. Both notions refer to the inseparability of the observer and the observed. We are using the term constructed cut to emphasize our awareness about our power as human choicemakers when attending to the documented material while we also acknowledge that the material speaks to us in ways beyond our intentions.
- **3.** Smooth space and its counterpart striated space are concepts developed by the French philosophers Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari (1987). Smooth space, or nomos, refers to an open space, metaphorically likened with the ocean, or desert, whereas the striated space, or logos, is a space characterized by reason and order, as a city. Smooth space is inhabited without metrics. Striated space, then, is inhabited by counting or measuring. The terms were originally introduced by the French composer and conductor Pierre Boulez (1925-2016).
- **4.** Line of flight is one of the key concepts in Gilles Deleuze's and Felix Guattari's philosophical work. According to Edward Thornton (2018) it refers to "lines that reach outside of the assemblage, those parts of the assemblage that escape the structure of which they are a part and serve to connect such an assemblage to that which is outside itself" (p. 12).

- **5.** Propositions can be defined as an alternative to tasks, assignments, or instructions. According to Erin Manning (2013) a proposition is immanent to the event, not external or separate from the event, but co-constitutive of it. The notion of propositions in artistic research leans on Alfred N. Whitehead's (1957) work. According to him "it is more important for a proposition to be interesting than it to be true" (p. 259).
- **6.** The notion of imagination, or 'imaginative' is central in developing *Pedagogy of Imaginative Dialogues*. There are several philosophical roots that are related to this concept, including the work of Dewey (1934), Sallis (2000), and Greene (1995). Also, in phenomenological analysis the method of imaginative variation (Giorgi, 2009) may be relevant here. However, this discussion is out of the scope of this article. It has been explored by a colleague who also participated in the PIMDI project (Boven, 2024).

135

#### References

- Anttila, E. (2004). Dance learning as practice of freedom. In L. Rouhiainen, E. Anttila, S. Hämäläinen, & T. Löytönen (Eds.), The same difference? Ethical and political perspectives on dance (pp. 19-62). (Acta Scenica 17). Theatre Academy of the University of the Arts Helsinki.
- Anttila, E. (2007). Mind the body: Unearthing the affiliation between the conscious body and the reflective mind. In L. Rouhiainen, E. Anttila, K. Heimonen, S. Hämäläinen, H. Kauppila, & P. Salosaari (Eds.). Ways of knowing in dance and art (pp. 79–99). (Acta Scenica 19). Theatre Academy of the University of the Arts Helsinki.
- Anttila, E., & Löytönen, T. (2010). Sensuous understanding: Embodied mode of reflection in enhancing wellbeing at work. LLine - Lifelong learning in Europe. XV (2), 85-93.
- Arao, B., & Clemens, K. (2013). From safe spaces to brave spaces: A new way to frame dialogue around diversity and social justice. In L. Landreman (Ed.), The art of effective facilitation: Reflections from social justice educators (pp. 135–150). Stylus Publishing.
- Barad, K. (2007). Meeting the universe halfway: Quantum physics and the entanglement of matter and meaning. Duke University Press.
- Bhabha, H. K. (1994). The location of culture. Routledge.
- Borgdorff, H. (2012). The conflict of the faculties: Perspectives on artistic research. Leiden University Press.
- Boven, M. (2024). Towards a theory of the imaginative dialogue: Four dialogical principles. Studies in Philosophy and Education, 1-20. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s11217-024-09950-7
- Cohen, C. B. (1993). Sensing, feeling and action: The experimental anatomy of body-mind centering. Contact Editions.
- Condit, O., & Jaakonaho, L. (Eds.). (2017). NIVELo8 Poetics of form. Theatre Academy of the University of the Arts Helsinki. Retrieved 14.10.2024, from https://nivel. teak.fi/poetics-of-form/
- Damasio, A. (1999). The feeling of what happens: Body and emotion in the making of consciousness. Harcourt Brace & Company.

- Deleuze, G. & Guattari, F. (1987). A thousand plateaus. (B. Massumi, Trans.). University of Minnesota Press.
- Dewey, J. (1933). How we think. Prometheus Books.
- Dewey, J. (1934). Art as experience. Minton, Balch & Co.
- Freire, P. (1972). Pedagogy of the oppressed (M.B. Merleau-Ponty, M. (1962) The phenomenology of Ramos, Trans.). Penguin Education.
- Giorgi, A. (2009). The descriptive phenomenological method in psychology: A modified Husserlian approach. Duquesne University Press.
- Greene, M. (1995). Releasing the imagination: Essays on education, the arts, and social change. Jossey-Bass.
- Haapoja, T. (2021). On Belonging. AISTIT / coming to our senses. Retrieved 14.10.2024, from https://www. terikehaapoja.net/on-belonging-3/
- Hannula, M., Suoranta, J., & Vadén, T. (2014). Artistic research methodology. Narrative, power and the public. Peter Lang.
- Haraway, D. (1992). The promises of monsters: A regenerative politics for inapproporiate/d others'. In L. Grossberg, C. Nelson, & P A. Treichler (Eds.), Cultural Studies (pp. 295-337). Routledge.
- Hermans, C. (2022). Participatory sense-making in physical play and dance improvisation: drawing meaningful connections between self, others and world. [Doctoral dissertation, Leiden University]. Academy of Creative and Performing Arts (ACPA), Faculty of Humanities, Leiden University.
- Howes, D. (2003). Sensing culture: Engaging the senses in culture and social theory. University of Michigan Press.
- Kinsella, E. (2007). Embodied reflection and the epistemology of reflective practice. Journal of philosophy of education, 41(3), 395-409.
- Lakoff, G., & Johnson, M. (1999). Philosophy in the flesh: The embodied mind and its challenge Sallis, J. (2000). Force of imagination: The sense to Western thought. Basic Books.
- Lenz Taguchi, H. (2010). Going beyond the theory/practice divide in early childhood education: Introducing an intra-active pedagogy. Routledge.

- Löytönen, T. (2008). Emotions in the everyday life of a dance school: Articulating unspoken values. Dance Research Journal, 40(1), 17-30.
- Manning, E. (2013). Always more than one: Individuation's dance. Duke University
- perception. Routledge.
- Mezirow, J. (1990). Fostering critical reflection in adulthood: A guide to transformative and emancipatory learning. Jossey-Bass.
- Mälkki, K. (2011). Theorizing the nature of reflection. (Studies in Educational Sciences 238). [Doctoral dissertation, University of Helsinki]. University of Helsinki, Institute of Behavioural Sciences.
- PIMDI, 2024a. Pedagogy of Imaginative Dialogues. Reflective documentation. https://pimdi.lhi.is/this-digital-toolkit/ embodied-artistic-reflection-method/. Retrieved 14.10.2024.
- PIMDI, 2024b. Pedagogy of Imaginative Dialogues. PIMDI exercises & examples. https://pimdi.lhi.is/this-digital-toolkit/. Retrieved 14.10.2024
- Pink, S. (2008). Mobilising visual ethnography: Making routes, making place and making images. Forum Qualitative Social Research, 9(3), Article 36. https://doi.org/10.17169/ fqs-9.3.1166
- Pink, S. (2015). Doing sensory ethnography. (2nd ed.). Sage.
- Polanyi, M. (1967). The tacit dimension. Routledge.
- Research Catalogue, 2024. Reflective documentation as practice. https://www. researchcatalogue.net/profile/showexposition?exposition=1953407. Retrieved 14.10.2024.
- Reiners, I. (2001). Taiteen muisti: Tutkielma Adornosta ja Shoahista.. Tutkijaliitto.
- of the elemental. Indiana University Press.
- Schwab, M. & Borgdoff, H. (Eds.). (2014). The exposition of artistic research publishing art in academia. Leiden University Press.

- Schön, D. A. (1983). The reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action. Basic Books.
- Schön, D. A. (1987). Educating the reflective practitioner: Towards a new design for teaching and learning in the profession.

  Jossey-Bass.
- Snellman, M. (2018). Kaikuja pimeästähämärästä metsästä: Affekti nykytaiteen oppimisen äärellä ja subjektiviteetin ekologia(ssa). (Doctoral dissertations 181/2018). [Väitöskirja, Aalto-yliopisto]. Aalto-yliopisto.
- Sööt, A. (2018). The procedure of guided core reflection for supporting the professional development of novice dance teachers. (Dissertationes Pedagogicae Universitatis Tartuensis 28). University of Tartu Press.
- Sööt, A., & Anttila, E. (2018). Dimensions of embodiment in novice dance teachers' reflections. *Research in Dance Education*, 19(3), 216–228.
- Thornton, E. (2018). On lines of flight: A study of Deleuze and Guattari's concept. [Doctoral dissertation]. University of London.

  Retrieved 14.10.2024, from https://pure.royalholloway.ac.uk/ws/portalfiles/portal/30911200/2018thorntonephd.pdf
- Tuovinen, T., & Mäkikoskela, R. (2020). Artistic research and conditions of experience. *Research in Arts and Education*, 3(2020), 26–53. https://doi.org/10.54916/ rae.119288
- Van Manen. M. (1991). The tact of teaching: The meaning of pedagogical thoughtfulness. SUNY Press.
- Van Manen, M. (1995). On the epistemology of reflective practice. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 1(1), 33–50.
- Van Manen, M. (2015). Pedagogical tact: Knowing what to do when you don't know what to do. Routledge.
- Varto, J. (2018). *Artistic research*. What is it? Who does it? Why? Aalto ARTS Books.
- Whitehead, A. N. (1957). *Process and reality. An essay in cosmology.* Macmillan.

137