

PENTTI AALTO

ON THE ABSOLUTE INSTRUMENTAL IN SANSKRIT

In some of the texts included in standard university textbooks of Sanskrit (e.g. in those by Stenzler, Thumb, Boehtlingk, Edgerton) we meet cases of an obvious « absolute » instrumental, viz. of a noun in the instrumental construed with a participle in the same case. This construction is not, however, mentioned in the elementary grammars. The medieval Latin grammar by Alexander de Villa Dei already defined an absolute construction, the Latin Ablativus absolutus, as lacking a regular connection with the governing verb of the main clause, and later grammarians in general follow the same pattern. The most usual absolute construction in Sanskrit is the Locativus absolutus, in general well explained in our grammars. The less usual Genetivus absolutus is more rarely accounted for, in spite of the very thorough monograph which Ferd. de Saussure in 1881 devoted to it. In his study<sup>1</sup> he also called attention to certain cases with an obviously « absolute » instrumental, occurring in Sanskrit texts.

The first grammarian to describe this latter construction briefly was J. S. Speijer<sup>2</sup>, who quoted instances from *Rāmāyaṇa*, *Pañcatantra* and *Kathāsaritsāgara*. According to this author the action expressed by the participle of the construction is presented as the cause or motive or means or accompaniment of the main action, « and in this respect it shows a close affinity to the Latin absolute ablative ». In the later edition of his work<sup>3</sup> Speijer quoted some additional instances from *Pañcatantra* and also from *Manu*. The Instr. abs. was also mentioned in the second edition of Whitney's grammar (§ 281g). On the other hand,

---

1. *De l'emploi du génitif absolu en sanscrit* (reprinted in « Recueil des publications scientifiques de Ferdinand de Saussure », Heidelberg, 1922, pp. 269-338), p. 337 fn. 1.

2. J. S. SPEIJER, *Sanskrit Syntax*, Leyden, 1886, p. 290 § 372.

3. J. S. SPEIJER, *Vedische und Sanskrit-Syntax* (« Grundriss der indo-arischen Philologie und Altertumskunde » I:6), Strassburg, 1896, § 213.

Delbrück<sup>4</sup> seems to have paid no attention to the instrumentals of this type in his study on the syntax of the *Vedas* and *Brāhmaṇas*, though later scholars have referred to certain interesting passages in several works of the latter group. Thus Oertel<sup>5</sup> quotes a number of instances from the *Brāhmaṇa* literature which can be regarded as representing at least an intermediary stage between the normal dependent instrumentals and the absolute constructions. In 1928, in a long paper Sen<sup>6</sup> illustrated instances of these kinds in the Vedic prose, and, in the same year, in a second paper<sup>7</sup> quoted several instances from Buddhist Sanskrit works. He also pointed out that the « absolute » instrumental originates from the sociative. However, Sen's explanation of the construction is rather superficial: « What was originally a sociative instrumental, was sometimes used absolutely in Old (as well as in Middle) Indo-Aryan ». He further suggested that « some cases of the ablative absolute in Latin represent an original Indo European instrumental absolute ». In his rich but succinct grammar Renou<sup>8</sup> treated this construction, too. He joined Oertel in considering that in the oldest instances the instrumental is still dependent on the main verb though the bond may be a thin one, while in later narrative literature an undisputable absolute use of the instrumental is met with.

The « absolute » constructions in Indo-European languages in general consist of a noun and a participle, the noun expressing the agent of the action expressed by the participle. This agent is further different from the subject of the main clause. If we use the terminology of transformational grammar, the « deep structure » underlying an « absolute » construction has thus been an independent sentence. On the other hand, in Sanskrit, participial constructions, often consisting only of a demonstrative and a participle were used to repeat a longer or shorter part of the preceding clause in the beginning of the following sentence<sup>9</sup>.

Since the nominal clause was originally the normal type of clause in Indo-European — and in Sanskrit — even a clause with a nominal predicate could be « transformed » into an « absolute » construction. It seems that the Instrumentalis absolutus might originate in cases of this type, in which the instrumental was, as suggested by Sen, a sociative one expressing accompaniment. Bühler explains in this way the passage Pañcat. II verse 42 (p. 9, 8) *mahatāpyarthatāreṇa yo viśvāsaṃ samāgataḥ* as an Instr. abs. *mahatā arthatāreṇa satā*. Even in the Locativus absolutus nominal predicates are possible, cf. e.g. *tvayi rakṣitāri*

- 
4. B. DELBRÜCK, *Altindische Syntax* (« Syntaktische Forschungen » V), Halle, 1888.  
 5. HANNS OERTEL, *The Syntax of Cases in the Narrative and Descriptive Prose of the Brāhmaṇas* (« Indogermanische Bibliothek » I:18), Heidelberg, 1926, p. 89 ff.  
 6. SUKUMAR SEN, *An Outline Syntax of Buddhist Sanskrit*, « Journal of the Dept. of Letters, Univ. of Calc. », 17, 1928 (pp. 1-65), p. 25 f.  
 7. SUKUMAR SEN, *The Use of Cases in Vedic Prose*, ABORI 4, 1928, p. 120 ff.  
 8. LOUIS REYOU, *Grammaire sanscrite*, 2nd ed. Paris, 1961, p. 313 f.  
 9. DELBRÜCK, *op. cit.*, § 215; OERTEL, *op. cit.*, § 70.

quoted by Renou. In a Gen. abs. an adjective can also be used instead of the participle, cf. e.g. MBh Calc. 1, 8166 *akāmasya śatakratoḥ*.

Instances of instrumentals of this type are met with in the *Rig Veda*<sup>10</sup>, e.g. RV 1, 23, 9 *hatā vṛtrām sudānava indreṇa sāhasā yujā* « do slay Vṛtra, ye bounteous, with the powerful Indra as your ally », 2, 23, 18 *indreṇa yujā tāmasā pārivrtaṃ bṛhaspate nīr apām aubjo arṇavām* « with Indra as thy associate thou hast, O Bṛhaspati, released the flood of the waters, dammed up by the darkness », 6, 44, 22 *ayām devāḥ sāhasā jāyamāna indreṇa yujā pañim astabhāyat* « this god, born under exertion, has paralyzed the Pañi with Indra as his ally », 7, 48, 2 *vājo asmān avatu vājasātāv indreṇa yujā taruṣema vṛtrām* « may Vāja favour us in the winning of booty, with Indra as ally we shall overcome Vṛtra », 9, 11, 9 *pāvamāna svvryaṃ rayiṃ soma rirīhi naḥ, indav indreṇa no yujā* « O Soma Pavamāna, grant us abundance of heroes, wealth, O Juice, with Indra as thy associate », 10, 62, 7 *indreṇa yujā nīh sṛjanta vāghāto vrajāṃ gómantam aśvīnam* « with Indra as their associate the sacrificants released the herd consisting of cows and horses », etc. In a corresponding way in Vedic prose, e.g. TS 6, 1, 7 *anumatayaivainayā krīṇāti* « she approving, he buys », Keith « verily he buys with her approved », 7, 5, 8 (4) *ekaikayā stutayā samāyanti* (Keith) « they come up each before one verse has been sung » (p. 626 fn. 11 « Practically an Instr. absol. »), AB 7, 18 *puraetrā vīravanto devarātena gāthināḥ sarve rādhyāḥ stha* « with Devarāta as the leading hero ye heroic Gāthinas shall all prosper », 30, 8 *tvayaiva hotrā vyaṃ svargaṃ lokam eṣyāmaḥ* « with thee as Hotar we will attain the world of heaven » (cf. TS 6, 3, 7 (1) *agninā vai hotrā devā asurān abhyabhavan* « with Agni as Hotar the gods overcame the Asuras », and RV 5, 9, 2 *agnīr hótā* « Agni is the Hotar »), 26, 3, 1 *dhenum upāhvayat tena vatsena yajamānāya sarvān kāmān duhe* « summoned a cow; with it as calf it milked all desires for the sacrificer »; KB 7, 10 *te somena rājñā ebhyo lokebhyo 'surān anudanta* « with Soma as king they drove away the Asuras from these worlds » (cf. PB 24, 18, 12 *te somena rājñā sarvā diśo 'jayan* « with Soma as king they conquered all the quarters »); PB 24, 18, 2 *devā vai vrātyāḥ sattram āsata budhena sthapatinā* « the gods held a sacrificial session, Budha being the Sthapati »; TS 6, 4, 8 *varuṇam devā abruvan tvayāṃśabhuvā somam rājānam hanāmeti* (Keith) « the gods said to Varuṇa "with thee as helper we will slay Soma, the King" », cf. PB 8, 8, 1 *tvayā mukhenedam jayāma* « with thee as leader we will win this »; PB 5, 1, 5 *sakṛd dhim-kṛteṇa śirasā pārācāḥ stuvate* « having uttered *him* once and with the head (being bare) the Pārāca hymns are chanted »; MBh Calc. 3, 12758 *atha kālena mahatā sa matsyaḥ sumahān abhūt*, cf. Pañcat. (Kielhorn p. 40, 2) *atha gacchatā kālena samastadeśaḥ śatrubhir vyāpta*, *ibid.* (Stenzler) *gacchatā kālena saṃtatir abhavat*, (Hertel) *tayor gacchati kāle s.a.*, Mṛcchakaṭ *acireṇaiva kālena*, etc.

10. HEINRICH WENZEL, *Instrumentalis im Rigveda*, Tübingen, 1879, p. 27 ff.

Instances of the Instrumentalis absolutus seem to occur in most branches of Sanskrit literature. Many occurrences have been quoted e.g. from Buddhistic works, including Lalitavistara and Mahāvastu. However, Weller in his study on Lalitavistara regarded all the occurrences in it and in Mahāvastu as results of a confusion in the use of cases in Buddhist Sanskrit<sup>11</sup>. Examples of the Instr. abs. occur even in Pāli<sup>12</sup>. Cf. Saddharmap. p. 428, 7 *imāṃ sahāṃ lokadhātum āgacchati sma prakampadbhiḥ kṣetraiḥ pravaraṣadbhiḥ padmaiḥ pravādyamānais tūryakoṭīnaya-taśatasahasraiḥ, nilotpalapadmanetreṇa vadanena suvarṇavarṇena kāyena* etc. « he arrived to the world with the ground shaking, lotuses being showered, numberless musical instruments sounding, with a face with eyes like blue lotuses, with a golden body, etc. » and Lal. 274, 10 *bodhisattvaḥ prakampyamānaiḥ kṣetrai raśmikoṭīniyutaśatasahasrāṇi niścāryamstūryaśatasahasraiḥ pravādyamānaiḥ mahatā puṣpādhyena pravaraṣatā ambaraśatasahasrair bhrāmyamānaiḥ dundubhiśatasahasraiḥ parāhanyamānaiḥ, garjadbhiḥ pragarjadbhiḥ*, etc., Lal. 123, 19 *aṣṭābhiśca tūryaśatasahasraiḥ praghuṣyamānair mahatā ca puṣpavarṣeṇa abhipravarṣatā... kanyāśatasahasrāṇi sarvālaṃkārabhūṣitāḥ abhuvan*, 190, 7 *bodhisattvo... adrākṣit puruṣaṃ mṛtam... jñātisaṃghaparivṛtaṃ sarvai rudadbhiḥ krandadbhiḥ paridevamānaiḥ prakīrnakeśaiḥ pāṃśvakīrnasirobhir urāṃsi tāḍayadbhir utkrośadbhiḥ pṛṣṭhato 'nugacchadbhiḥ*, cf. MVu II 154, 8 *mṛtako puruṣo kumārasya purato nirmito mañcake samāropito puruṣeḥi nīyate jñātīhi aśrukaṇṭhehi rudanmukhehi prakīrnakeśeḥi uraṃ pīdanteḥi karuṇaṃ pralapanteḥi* (Jones II p. 49): « ... conjured up before the prince a dead man. This dead man was placed on a litter and was borne by his relatives who sobbed, wept, dishevelled their hair, beat their breasts and made piteous lamentation ».

The originally sociative sense of the predicative noun in the instrumental seems to be beyond doubt (cf. the type *tvayā hotrā* above). In the same way the present participle in the corresponding function expresses an action accompanying that of the main verb. In Pāli SN I 226, 16 *Vepacitti... chattena dhāriyamānena... atikkami* « Vepacitti... with the sunshade being held (over him)... went through »: Hendriksen compares DN I 49, 3 *ukkāsu dhāriyamānāsu*; Mil. 112, 21 *aññataro puriso... paggharantena lohitenā taṃ kaṇṭakaṃ nīhareyya* « another man pulls that thorn out with blood flowing out ».

The past participle, again, was originally probably understood as expressing the state or circumstances resulting from the action of the underlying verb, i.e. of the predicate of the presumed deep structure clause. In Manu 4, 181, *etair jitaśca jayati sarvān lokān imān gṛhī* « these being won a householder wins all those worlds » the commentators Nārāyaṇa and Nandana read *etair jitaśca* « allowing himself to be con-

11. FRIEDRICH WELLER, *Zum Lalita Vistara. Ueber die Prosa des L.*, Leipzig, 1915, pp. 24 and 43.

12. HANS HENDRIKSEN, *Syntax of the Infinite Verb-Forms of Pāli*, Copenhagen, 1944, p. 45 f.

quered by these»: in Bühler's opinion « this reading though less well attested than the vulgate, is perhaps preferable »; BhP 4, 11, 15 *bhūtaiḥ pañcabhir ārabdhair yoṣit puruṣaiva hi* « the male and female exist, the five elements having been composed », Nala 4, 12 (MBh crit. ed. vol. IV p. 1054 Appendix I 8, 12) *damayantī vaco 'bravīt samāplutābhyāṃ netrābhyāṃ śokajena vāriṇa* etc.

The absolute sense seems to be especially clear in cases in which the original action of concomitance, inherent in the sociative instrumental, is in fact denied or precluded. TB 2, 7, 9, 4 *udyatā sūryeṇa kāryaḥ, udyantaṃ vā etaṃ sarvāḥ prajāḥ prativandanti* « with the rising sun it should be performed, for all the creatures joyfully greet him rising », cf. KS 37, 1 *yad udati sūrye kriyata*. While the rising sun in a way « accompanies » the action of the main verb the expression *anuditena sūryeṇa* cannot be explained in a corresponding way: KS 8, 3 *naktaṃ vānuditena divoditena* « when the sun has not risen, there is night, when it has risen, there is day »; Rām. 2, 64, 18 *sa coddhṛtena bāṇena sahasā svargam āsthitaḥ* « as soon as the arrow had been drawn out, he mounted to heaven »; Rām. 2, 12, 100 *vinā hi sūryeṇa bhavet pravṛttir, avarṣatā vajradhareṇa vāpi* « there might be some active life even without sun and without Indra giving any rain »; BhG 11, 27 *kecid vilagnā daśanāntareṣu samdṛśyante cūrṇitair uttamāṅgaiḥ* « some caught between the teeth are seen with their heads crushed to powder ». The perfect participle comes thus to denote only past time without any sense of accompaniment of the main action. An absolute construction most closely resembling the Latin Ablativus absolutus has thus come to maturity: Mār̥kP 84, 17 *etabhir hatair jagad upaiti sukham* « when these (foes) have been slain the world attains happiness »; Pañcat. (Kielhorn p. 40, 18) *subhage, samastaiḥ śatrubhir hatair annaṃ pānaṃ cāsvādayiṣyāmi*: Kielhorn in his notes (p. 20) does not at all take into account the sociative sense of the instrumental when stating « In Sanskrit the slaying of the enemies is looked upon as the instrument or means which will make the weaver again taste food; in English the slaying of the enemies and the tasting of food are considered merely as antecedent and sequent in the order of time »; Vetālap. (p. 9, 35) *caturbhir divasair atikrāntair bhūyo 'pi sā preṣitā*, cf. (ibid. 9, 25) *daśāhne samatīkrānte... sā bhūyo 'pi preṣitā*<sup>13</sup>; MVu I 50, 13 *kiṃ nu khalu mayi parinirvṛte imehi ca śrāvakehi parinirvṛtehi imasmiṃ dharmākhyāne ntarhite ito kettakasya nu khalu kālasya buddho bhagavān loke upapadiṣyati* « when I have utterly passed away, when these disciples of mine have passed away, and when the preaching of the Dharma has ceased, after how long a time will an exalted Buddha appear in the world? », I 148, 1 *paripūrṇehi*

---

13. Die *Vetālapañcaviṃśatika* in der Recension des *Çivadāsa* und eines Unge-  
nannten, ed. by H. Uhle, *Abh.KM* 8, 1881, p. 9, 35 = *Jambhaladatta's Version of the*  
*Vetālapañcaviṃśati*, ed. by M. B. Emeneau, « Amer. Or. Ser. 4 », 1934, p. 18, *atha*  
*dinatraye gate sati*.



*ca daśahi māsehi sarve bodhisattvāḥ mātuḥ kukṣau prādurbhavanti dak-  
ṣiṇena pārśvena na ca taṃ pārśvaṃ bhidyate* « with ten months being  
fulfilled all Bodhisattvas emerge from their mother's womb through the  
right side but do not pierce that side », etc.

In some cases a meaning like « after » or « as soon as » seems to fit  
in with the instrumental, e.g. Kathās. 10, 60, 52 *tena ceḥa praviṣṭena  
na śarīraṃ na me vanam* « after he has entered here I cannot call my  
body nor my wood my own », 12, 71, 273 *bhuktais taiḥ śaktubhiśchāgī  
samapadyata sā tadā* « as soon as she had eaten that barley-meal she  
became a she-goat », 12, 101, 30 *adācca divyāsvādāni tānyasmabhyaṃ  
phalāni saḥ, yair bhuktair amṛteneva tṛptā jātā vayaṃ tadā* « and he  
gave us those fruits of heavenly flavour, and as soon as we had eaten  
them we became, as it were, satisfied with nectar », 6, 28, 125 *kaṅṭhala-  
gnena tenaiśa tatkṣaṇaṃ mṛtyum āpsyati* « as soon as it touches his  
neck, he will suffer death ». MVu I 123, 2 *kṛtena buddhadharmaṇa nir-  
vāyanti narottamā iti* « the supremes of men pass away when their  
Buddhahood has been fulfilled », I 257, 7 *tena āgatena vaiśālyānām ama-  
nuṣyavyādhiḥ praśāmyati* « as soon as he comes the demoniac plague  
among the people of Vaiśālī will be allayed », II, 101, 7 *uparuddhena  
kumāreṇa grhaṃ niḥśreyaṃ sanvṛttam* « with the prince being impri-  
soned the household lost its good fortune », III 173, 7 *tena pītena asya  
smṛtir utpadye* « as soon as he had drunk it, the recollection came to  
him ». Divyāv. 113 *tayā grhitayā nāsyā kāye śastraṃ kramiṣyati* « that  
being put on, no missile will hit his body ».

When treating the Genetivus absolutus Pāṇini 2, 3, 38 states *ṣaṣṭhī  
cānādare*. This construction should thus according to him be used only  
with a « psychological value »<sup>14</sup> « when disregard is to be shown ». The  
typical example of this is Nala 7, 8 (MBh crit. ed. 3, 56, 8) *vaidarbhyāḥ  
prekṣamānāyāḥ paṅakālam amanyata* « though the daughter of the  
Vidarbhaking was looking on ». The *anādara* in question depends,  
however, on extra-textual evidence, and we meet comparable cases even  
in connection with other absolute constructions. Cf. e.g. the Instrumen-  
talis absolutus in Manu 9, 87 *yas tu tat kāryen mohāt sa jātyā sthita-  
mānaya* « he who by delusion of mind causes that to be performed by  
another though his wife of equal caste is alive »; MārKP 49, 9 *māsi  
māsyārttvaṃ yat tu na tadāsit tu yoṣitām, tasmāt tadā na suṣuvuḥ  
sevitair api maithunaiḥ* (Pargiter:) « women did not have their courses  
month by month, hence they did not then bring offspring, although they  
engaged in sexual intercourse », 108, 2 *sātitaḥ tejaso bhāgair daśabhiḥ  
pañcabhistathā, atīva kāntimaccāru bhānor āsit tadā vapuḥ* « though  
fifteen parts of his glory had been pared away, the Sun's body was  
exceedingly beautiful and charming then » (Pargiter « when... »); Indi-  
sche Sprüche 3981 (= Śabdak. Padmottarak. 22) *paropakāraḥ kartavyaḥ*

14. JULES BLOCH, *Indo-Aryan from the Vedas to Modern Times*, Paris, 1965, p. 262.

*prāṇaiḥ kaṅṭhagatair*<sup>15</sup> *api* « even though being in utmost danger of life one must help others », cf. Pañcat. (Liebich) *nābhakṣyaṃ bhakṣayet prajñāḥ prāṇaiḥ kaṅṭhagatair api* « the wise should not take improper food though being in utmost danger of life »: in all the instances *api* stresses the concessive nuance. A similar nuance is met with in Aśva-ghoṣa's BC 13, 43 *śārīracittavyasanatāpas tair evaṃvidhaiś ca nīpatya-mānaiḥ naivāsanācchākyamuniś cacāla* translated by Sen (p. 25) « notwithstanding those austerities of body and mind, and inspite of such (followers of Māra the tempter) assailing, the sage of the Śākya race did not move from his seat »; even the Tibetan translation uses here an absolute construction with the instrumental: *phab-pa* (= *nīpatyamāna*) *de dañ* (= *ca*) *de-rnams-kyis* (= *tais*); Weller translates the Tibetan passage « Durch dies und das, das so herniederfiel... » Only Jäschke (§ 41, 7) quotes a concessive translation of the Tibetan Instr. abs. *čes smras mod kyis čes yid čhes par 'gyur* « though you did say so, by what shall I believe it »<sup>16</sup>.

Especially when the predicate of the main clause stands in the future the participle of the absolute instrumental seems to imply a conditional nuance, e.g. Kathās. 6, 29, 55 *sakhi, bhuktaiḥ phalair etair jarā te na bhaviṣyati* « with these fruits eaten (= if you eat these fruits) old age will not reach you », 9, 55, 213 *drṣṭayā vindhyavāsinyā patnī-putrau tvam āpsyasi* « with having seen (= if thou seest) Durgā thou wilt recover thy wife and son »; Ind. Spr. 427 (= Pañcat. ed. Koseg. I 402) *api putraiḥ kalatrair vā prāṇān rakṣeta paṇḍitaiḥ, vidyamānair yatas taiḥ syāt sarvaṃ bhūyo 'pi dehinām* « even at the price of his wife and his son the wise shall save his life, since, if only this remains, men can reach all the other », etc.

Sometimes the context again suggests a causal nuance, e.g. Pañcat. (Bühler II p. 37, 13) *bhadra, na bhetaṅgavyam asmadvīdhair mitrair vidyamānaiḥ* « my dear, thou shalt not be afraid with there being friends like us », Mvu I 198, 15 *yuṣmeḥi vinītehi mahājanakāyo vinayam āgami-*

15. The same expression is met with in a Prakrit verse of the *Vetālap.*, p. 27, 19, ... *vi kaṅṭhaṭṭhio jīvo*, with variants (p. 216) *kuṅṭhatiajjva* and *kaṅṭhathiye jīye*. ALFRED MASTER, *A Grammar of Old Marathi*, Oxford, 1964, p. 141, quotes absolute instrumentals like *uditeṃ raśmi-rājeṃ lopati caṃrādi tejeṃ* « as the lord of light arises the moon and other lights vanish ».

16. FRIEDRICH WELLER, *Das Leben des Buddha von Aśvaghōṣa II*, Leipzig, 1928, p. 132. JÄSCHKE, *Tibetan Grammar*, Berlin and Leipzig, 1929. J. BACOT, *Grammaire du tibétain littéraire I*, Paris, 1946, p. 30, states that the instrumental has a causal sense (cf. II, Paris, 1948, p. 130 ff. with further instances). M. LALOU, *Manuel élémentaire de tibétain classique*, Paris, 1950, p. 27, § 27, 4, translates *ñal-bas* « en dormant » and *'di 'dra-bas* « cela étant ainsi ». Cf. further BC 6, 36 *nāsmi yātuṃ puraṃ śakto dahyamānena cetasā* « I am not able to go into the city with my mind burning », in Tibetan *me yis* (= *agninā*) *chig pa'i* (= *dahyamāna*) *sems kyis* (= *cetasā*) *ni groṅ du 'gro bar nus pa med*.

A Sanskrit temporal instrumental like *kālena* (BC 6, 16) is also translated into Tibetan with an instrumental *dus-kyis*.

*syati* « you having been instructed the mass of the people will attain the Discipline », etc.

While in Sanskrit the three cases, instrumental, ablative and locative represent the original Indo-European system, in Greek the instrumental and locative had already in prehistoric times merged into the dative. In Latin all three merged into one which had the form of the ablative. In all these languages (as well as in others, later attested ones) the use of the bare sociative continued e.g. when speaking of soldiers accompanying their leader, e.g. RV 1, 1, 5 *devó devébhīr ā gamat*, AB 1, 24, 4 *agnir vasubhir ud akrāmad indro rudrair varuṇa ādityaiḥ*, MBh Calc. 3, 2114 *abhijagmus tato bhīmaṃ rājāno... vicitramālyābharaṇair balair*; in Greek Hom. Od. 11, 161 ἐνθάδ' ἰκάνεις νηί τε καὶ ἐτάροισι « art thou come hither with thy ship and thy companions », Thuc. 1, 61 ἐπορεύοντο... τρισχιλίοις μὲν ὀπλίταις... ἵππεῦσι δὲ ἑξακοσίοις « proceeded... with three thousand hoplites... and with six hundred cavalry »; in Latin Caes. Bell. civ. 1, 41 *Caesar omnibus copiis Ilerdam proficiscitur* « C. set out for I. with all his troops ».

In Greek the sociative function of the dative made it possible to use it even in absolute constructions, e.g. Hom. Il. 8, 487 Τρωσὶν μὲν ῥ' ἀέκουσιν ἔδῃ φάος « sorely against the will of the Trojans sank the daylight », Od. 21, 115 οὐ κέ μοι ἀγνυμένῳ τάδε δώματα πότνια μήτηρ λείποι « it will not vex me that my honoured mother should leave this house », Soph. Oed. Tyr. 156 ἢ περιτελλομέναις ὥραις πάλιν ἐξανύσεις χρέος (Storr) « or with the circling years renewest a penance of yore? », to be compared with the gen. abs. Hom. Il. 2, 551 περιτελλομένων ἐνιαυτῶν « as years go round ».

A Finnish classical scholar, Erik J. Tammelin, explained<sup>17</sup> the Latin Ablativus absolutus as originating from sociative ablatives representing the original instrumental case. According to him the development started from constructions with nominal predicates like Plaut. Stich. 602 *me auctore* « with me as instigator », Trin. 1161 *impetrabit te advocato atque arbitro* « with thee as advocate and judge he will win his case ». The earliest constructions with a present participle are also clearly sociative, e.g. Ter. Heaut. 1042 *pudet dicere hac praesente verbum turpe* « I am ashamed to use the disgraceful word with her (= your mother) being present ». The counterpart of *praesens*, viz. *absens*, does not permit any sociative explanation: Plaut. Amph. 827 *te qui absente hic munus fungatur tuom* « who shall perform thy duty during thy absence ». The past participle in Amph. 643 *absit dum modo laude parta domum se recipiat* might still have a sociative sense « he may be absent provided that he will return home with won fame », but in Men. 989 *sed metuo ne sero veniam depugnato proelio* « but I am afraid I am coming too late, the battle having been fought », or in Coelius Antipater frg. *custodibus discessis multi interficiuntur* « many were killed after the watchmen

17. In his dissertation *De participiis priscae Latinitatis*, Helsinki, 1889, p. 126 ff.



had left » no accompaniment exists any more. Tammelin's instance Ter. Andr. 923 *Atticus quidam olim navi fracta ad Andrum eiectus est* « some years ago an Athenian was stranded at Andros, his ship being wrecked » may be compared with Sanskrit MVu III 68, 1 *te dāni tena yānapātreṇa vipannena devadevāṃ namasyanti* « with their vessel broken up, they pray to various gods ».

When discussing Tammelin's theory, Karl Brugmann<sup>18</sup> pointed out that the pronominal form *quī* in Plaut. Bacch. 335 *qui praesente id aurum Theotimo datumst?* is used in Latin only as an instrumental. Tammelin's thoughts were further developed by his compatriot Edwin Flinck<sup>19</sup>. However, none of these scholars used the Sanskrit Instrumentalis absolutus as evidence though it would have given very good support to their theory. In Wackernagel's opinion<sup>20</sup> it was possible that there had already been an absolute construction in Indo-European, but he regarded it as uncertain which case had been used, and in what particular sense. In his dissertation Wenzel already compared the Rigvedic expression *indreṇa yujā* with Latin absolute ablatives, and Sen<sup>21</sup> regarded both constructions as originating in an Indo-European absolute sociative instrumental. This seems thus to be a tempting answer to the question left open by Wackernagel.

18. In his paper *Die mit dem Suffix -to- gebildeten Partizipien*, IF 5, 1895, p. 143.

19. EDWIN FLINCK, *De ablativo absoluto quaestiones*, « Ann. Acad. Scient. Fenn. B:XX:1 », Helsinki, 1929.

20. JACOB WACKERNAGEL, *Vorlesungen über Syntax I*, Basel, 1920, p. 293.

21. SEN, ABORI 9, p. 120. JEAN HAUDRY, *L'emploi des cas en védique*, Lyon, 1977, p. 90, translates Avesta Yašt 10, 80 *wā paiti* « avec toi comme chef », as did e.g. Bartholomae and Wolff, while Lommel renders it « through thee, O Lord ». — I cannot see that there had been any essential difference between Sanskrit *Indreṇa yujā* and Latin *Cicerone consule*, as Haudry l. c. suggests.