### Dagnosław Demski and Dominika Czarnecka

## A SITE SHAPED BY DISCONTINUITY: THE PRACTICES OF PLACE-MAKING IN A POST-SOVIET MILITARY BASE IN POLAND

#### **ABSTRACT**

In this paper, the authors focus on the place-making practices which have emerged in the Polish post-Soviet military base—Borne Sulinowo. The new civil town (1993–2018) forms a unique reality, as it employs Polish, German and Russian elements, and interweaves the past threads of civil settlements and garrison life with the present. The authors analyze the process of place-making, drawing on their research in a site shaped by discontinuity. The aim of the article is to present the multilayered nature of the place-making process as well as diverse, sometimes conflicting, often interdependent and interconnected perspectives through which Borne Sulinowo can be understood and experienced.

Keywords: commodification; discontinuity; institutionalization; multi-locality; Poland; post-Soviet base; place-making; practices; symbolization.

#### INTRODUCTION

Research problems that constitute the subject of the present analysis are highly determined by the unique spatial and time-related frame. On the one hand, they concern a place which is, in many respects, unusual—Borne Sulinowo is a former military base that was transformed into a civil town in 1993. On the other hand, the process of its spatial and symbolic reorganization is directly related to the fall of communism, the withdrawal of the Northern Group of Forces from Poland in 1993¹ and the process of sociopolitical transition in the country which has continued for over twenty nine years now.

Borne Sulinowo is an interesting case study. In this post-Soviet base in 1993 the history began 'anew', so to speak, so it differs from the majority of Polish towns with their centuries-old growth. However, the paper does not attempt to offer insights on the detailed history of Borne Sulinowo or extensive comparative analysis but instead explores the differential restructurings of locality. It is an attempt to demonstrate a more nuanced and multifaceted approach to place, place-making and local identity production in Central and Eastern Europe (CEE) than merely the national-municipal dichotomy that has been investigated in most studies (see e.g. Andrusz et al. 1996;

Czaplicka et al. 2009; Mendel 2010; Stanilov 2007). The present article focuses on providing the answers to the following questions: To what extent are place-making practices affected by political developments at the state level? Which characteristics of Borne Sulinowo determine its role in the place-making process? How should the 'non-Polish', military and, subsequently, inconvenient past and its remains be addressed? What is the difference between place-making practices for outsiders and for insiders? Finally, what makes some versions of a locality more visible than others? Drawing on our research in a post-Soviet base in Poland, we analyze a series of locally produced practices. We propose that such a focus can provide new insights about place and understandings of how place is made.

In order to analyze the above research problems we have identified a number of theories of place and place-making as relevant tools (Casey 1996; Feld and Basso 1996). Following Edward Casey's ideas, we see place as an 'event' or process, as something that is constantly being made and remade in accordance with its own proper dynamism. 'Moreover, the eventful potency of places includes their cultural specificity. Time and history, the diachronic media of culture, are also deeply inscribed in places as to be inseparable from them—as inseparable as the bodies that sustain these same places and carry the culture located in them' (Casey 1996: 44). Furthermore, in the process of exploring place-making in its complexity, we draw on Margaret Rodman's idea of multi-locality. Among other things, multi-locality implies 'seeking to understand the construction of place from multiple viewpoints' and considering that 'a single physical landscape can be multilocal in the sense that it shapes and expresses polysemic meanings of place for different users' (Rodman 2003: 212). These multiple, simultaneous and sometimes

interwoven forms of place-making are involved with local politics and power relations and 'can themselves represent shifting and complex power contexts' (Pink 2008; see also Sandberg 2016).

The analytical framework of this paper involves three dimensions of place-making practices: 1. symbolization, 2. institutionalization, 3. commodification (cf. Csurgó and Megyesi 2016). The suggested categorization is purely analytical, however, as, in practical terms, the boundaries between these dimensions keep intersecting.

The article is based on research conducted in Borne Sulinowo in February, May and August 2015, in May 2016 and in August 2018. The case study is based on ethnographic qualitative methods: in-depth interviews, informal conversations, participatory observation (Atkinson and Hammersley 1994; Hammersley and Atkinson 1995), transect walking, analysis of press and source materials collected in the private archives of the manager of the Museum Chamber in Borne Sulinowo and analysis of photographic documentation (Pink 2009). We conducted around twenty in-depth interviews (the 'snowball technique' was used to find new respondents) and numerous informal conversations with local decision-makers, local entrepreneurs, members of local associations, inhabitants of Borne Sulinowo and tourists passing through.

# THE RESEARCH CONTEXT: BORNE SULINOWO

From 2015 to date our research has focused on the development of the cultural and social landscapes in former military bases in CEE, particularly in Poland,<sup>2</sup> studies that have inevitably been concerned with how places are made.

Borne Sulinowo is a town located in the north-western part of Poland, inhabited by a total number of more than 4,900 people (Polska w liczbach n.d.). In contrast to many other postmilitary spaces in the country, Borne Sulinowo has not evolved into a ghost town but it has been successfully revitalized since 1993. Although the time framework of the present analysis covers the twenty-five years during which Borne Sulinowo functioned as a Polish civil town (1993-2018), it is worth mentioning that in the history of Borne Sulinowo four periods are usually distinguished (see Demski and Czarnecka 2015). From the sixteenth century to the 1930s it was the site of a small German fishing village called Linde; between 1933 and 1945 (after the civil settlers were relocated by the Nazis) a German garrison was established; after 1945 Borne Sulinowo was transformed into a Soviet military garrison which lasted until 1992. In 1945 the state border between Poland and Germany was changed.3 The so-called Recovered Territories (the north-western parts of Poland) were included as part of the Polish territories following the Potsdam Conference. Although after World War II Borne Sulinowo officially became part of the Polish state, the Soviet military organized an ex-territorial zone there and, thus, the whole area was excluded from the control and jurisdiction of the Polish administration. Of the thirty-nine military garrisons accepted under the agreement signed in 1957 by the governments of the Polish People's Republic (PPR) and the USSR, Borne Sulinowo was one of the largest and strategically most important.

The fall of the communist system and the fall of the 'Iron Curtain' in Central and Eastern Europe resulted in, among other things, the withdrawal of Russian Federation armed forces from Poland. After the final withdrawal of foreign troops from Borne Sulinowo in 1992,

soldiers of the Polish Army were stationed there for several months and the national authorities considered organizing a Polish garrison there. Although special passes were necessary to enter the former Soviet base during the transitional period, devastation and theft took place on a large scale and, ultimately, Polish authorities made the decision to establish Borne as a civil town. On June 5, 1993, the official ceremony to commemorate the establishment was held. On September 15, 1993 the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Poland granted Borne Sulinowo a municipal charter (Borne Sulinowo n.d.).

Each of the above mentioned periods was related to an extensive exchange of population. In 1992 all the soldiers from the former Soviet Union abandoned Borne Sulinowo, to be gradually replaced by civilians from both the 'Recovered Territories', including towns and villages located in the direct neighborhood of the base, and more remote parts of the country. The diverse origins of the civil settlers were significant in the context of memories of World War II—research conducted in 2009 demonstrated regional diversification (Nijakowski 2010). There were also differences in Poles' perceptions of the Soviet soldiers and foreign army, depending on whether the subjects had lived nearby military bases or had not experienced the direct presence of the Soviet Army and its consequences (see Czarnecka 2017; Demski 2017). On the other hand, the settlers arriving at the beginning of the 1990s from various regions of Poland faced problems which are not present in rooted communities. When Poles took over the control of the base, they had little information about the site and the type of resources handed over to them, not to mention their quantity, quality, and real value. Numerous 'ifs' and all kinds of new discoveries and problems gave rise not only to hope, but also to feelings of insecurity and a sense of threat, meanwhile intensifying the atmosphere of excitement. As a result, such expressions as 'the land of chaos and great opportunity', 'a town of chance' or 'Polish Dodge City' appeared side by side. The town's new inhabitants, who were settling on unknown territory, were faced with the tough challenge of stepping outside simple dichotomies and creating new combinations out of what they themselves had brought and what they found in the new place. Both of these processes are embodied at the level of practice, understood here as a non-ritual action, as 'the expression of intentional states arising from the performing agent' (Whitehouse 2005: 91).

The implication of Casey's ideas is that space, time and history are deeply inscribed in place. In contrast to the majority of towns with their centuries-old growth, the former military base has been a site shaped by discontinuity. As a result, during the four periods mentioned above, this place gathered 'things' that seemed irreconcilable (i.e. German, Soviet and communist past; civilian and military objects)— 'where "things" connote various animate and inanimate entities. Places also gather experiences and histories, even languages and thoughts' (Casey 1996: 24).

The changes in political, economic and social contexts have provided the national, regional and local stakeholders with an opportunity to reinterpret and rewrite the post-Soviet military space. Decision makers used the place's multiple connotations to play up their own values and highlight their own power. Polish political transformation (1989–2018) and opening the country to the outside world marked new opportunities resulting from the fall of socialism and the beginnings of democratization and liberalization processes, including in the sphere of the economy. The whole country witnessed multi-level changes,

manifesting themselves in, among other spheres, the reformulation of the symbolic iconography of the public space, the launch of new initiatives, and a sense of freedom on the part of the citizens. The case of Borne Sulinowo was no exception to the rule in this respect and, thus, it should be discussed within the larger framework of change. Additionally, however, the former post-Soviet base displayed specific characteristics which caused the local variant of transformation to differ from the rest of the country.

The process which began in Borne Sulinowo at the beginning of the 1990s reveals some analogies to what happened in the 'Recovered Territories' after 1945. In reality, however, fundamental differences emerge, which establish the analyzed example as a unique case study. The towns and cities located within the 'Recovered Territories' such as Wrocław, Szczecin and Legnica, as well as Gdańsk (Mendel 2010), changed their national affiliation after World War II along with undergoing an almost complete exchange of inhabitants. Consequently, they count as sites shaped by discontinuity. Nonetheless, transformations within the former military base at the beginning of the 1990s occurred in a totally different geopolitical, economic and social context. As opposed to the towns and cities which remained civil after 1945 and thus in many ways maintained continuity, Borne Sulinowo was transformed into a civil town from a military base, one that was previously absent from maps and distant from major communication routes. In effect, the sense of discontinuity in the case of Borne Sulinowo appears much more complex and multi-level.

## SYMBOLIZATION: FROM PAST TO PRESENT AND THE OTHER Way around

In a place appearing on maps for the first time in decades, place-making begins by taking over and organizing the space in its physical and administrative aspects. In Borne Sulinowo the arrival of the first settlers was preceded by actions undertaken by the local authorities. Even at this initial stage, preparing land for civil settlement (e.g. examining pollution levels) was connected with the process of symbolization which is a central element of place-making. 'Symbols and symbolic meaning of the place contribute and represent the sense of place' (Csurgó and Megyesi 2016: 433). Both material objects and events gain status only when contemporary people assign them significance. The former Soviet military base constitutes a symbol endowed with diverse meanings both for the inhabitants of Borne Sulinowo and those without any personal experience of the town, for whom it therefore has no connotations. In addition, Borne Sulinowo is effectively used as a symbol in various contexts and rival claims (cf. Peil 2006).

On the national level new challenges were offered by the post-Soviet legacies. From the standpoint of state-level decision makers at that time, Borne Sulinowo was perceived as a representation of the 'non-Polish' and inconvenient past of the country and its physical remains. The local authorities supported the process of active forgetting and adapting to the narratives which were dominant during the transformation period on the national level (for more on the topic of politics of memory in Poland during the transformation era see Witeska-Młynarczyk 2014). At the beginning, after the Russian Army left, emphasis was

put on the differences and rather negative aspects of its occupancy. Concurrently, local politicians stressed the importance of the early inhabitants' efforts in laying the foundations for the new town. In his speech to the government delegation visiting the town the mayor of Borne Sulinowo made the following claim:

It appears that during the past three years we have proven, as a local government, that we are able, despite shortages of the financial means, to significantly transform the image of this town: broken, abandoned and, on parting, destroyed. (quoted in Anonymous author 1996: 9)

At the same time, in the eyes of the new settlers the former military base was seen as the 'promised land' while the attitude of the local people towards its German-Soviet past proved to be significantly more diversified than at the state level:

As far as I saw and heard in the stories, Russians had left the town practically untouched. So, if anybody suggested that they looted the town, that is not true. (...) To my mind, everybody had a really positive attitude to it. Everyone had this idea of how the town will thrive and that things will be happening here. Unfortunately, it turned out that things did not work out that well in the end.<sup>4</sup>

Regardless of the communist indoctrination of all sorts, officers were considered intelligentsia. So these stories that were spread around did not always have to be true. These pejorative labels, so negative. We do have this thing inside, to feel more secure about ourselves. Germans feel it

towards Poles and Poles feel it towards Russians. (...) It's this myth, our imagined sense of superiority to Russians.<sup>5</sup>

Generally speaking, these Russians were always kind of funny for us, one could make fun of them. (...) The people who lived together with them had different opinions. Some of them survived thanks to them, you won't find people willing to work here, because they weaned them away from work, they lived on making moonshine or trade. However, some were a bit scared. (...) Well, the Russians were not really missed at the beginning.<sup>6</sup>

The process of taking over and organizing the space in its physical and administrative aspects is closely related to practices of removing the old and adopting the new symbolism. Such activities include among others: practices of (re) naming the streets, the erecting / dismantling of monuments, the design of the new town's coat of arms and promotional logos.

### A. THE PRACTICE OF (RE) Naming the Streets

This reflects the practices of 'an administrative system providing a sense of accepted organization of space and thus control over that space and the people living there' (Peil 2006: 114). Not only do the street names create an image of unity, but they also reflect the dominant ideologies of the time. Reconstructing past topographies, in turn, enables retracing the past. After the Soviet forces' took over the garrison all German street names in Borne Sulinowo were replaced by the Soviet ones: for example, Adolf Hitler's Avenue became Joseph Stalin's Avenue. Even today the walls of some abandoned buildings in the town exhibit traces of Cyrillic

writing. In the early 1990s all Soviet names were replaced with Polish ones by the new local authorities on a top-down basis by virtue of a single resolution.7 A question arises as to the models which governed name-giving in Borne Sulinowo and the significance of the fall of communism in this context. Several models were drawn on: each commemorated and, at the same time, omitted something. The freedom breakthrough was a necessary condition and the direct impulse for changing the ideological format of Polish towns. Additionally, it formed one of the models for renaming places during the period of transformation, emphasizing independence and solidarity. In Borne it was realized by Independence Avenue (former Joseph Stalin's Avenue) and White Eagle Street, but also in naming the local school after Jan Nowak-Jeziorański<sup>8</sup>—a person unrelated to the local tradition, but distinguished in his fight against communism. Other models were based on stressing the affiliations with Slavic lands and the 'Polish spirit'; marking the features characteristic of the local area, and a contemporary model with references to development and the common good. Through renaming all streets the local authorities did not only change the 'ideological vesture'9 of the town but also symbolically took control over the former ex-territorial area and merged it into the national symbolic domain. The new settlers had no influence on the resolutions being undertaken since the streets had been renamed before the majority of them arrived in the youngest Polish town of the time. It is simultaneously worth mentioning that the process of settlement in Borne Sulinowo in the 1990s and after 2000 progressed in stages, with the first wave of immigration being followed by the subsequent ones.

## THE ERECTING / DISMANTLING OF MONUMENTS

Besides renaming the streets, monuments are an important element of the process of symbolization, imposing state-sponsored narratives of power and subjectivity on the space (cf. Wanner 2016: 202). The monuments can be perceived as 'sites for social groups to actively debate the meaning of history and compete for control over the commemorative process' (Dwyer and Alderman 2008: 165-78). One should at the same time emphasize that 'The less memory is experienced from the inside the more it exists only through its exterior scaffolding and outward signs' (Nora 2004: 237). When the Soviet soldiers entered the military base in Borne, they demolished all the German monuments. When in the early 1990s the Russian soldiers were leaving Borne, they took all their monuments with them. It seems probable that such behavior was motivated by the attempt to avoid the repetition of past scenarios. In effect, contrary to the rest of the country, where intense iconoclastic activities were undertaken, in Borne there was nothing to demolish. This difference appears significant as iconoclastic movements play a frequent and sometimes crucial role in the transformation of societies. Monuments, and more generally, images 'are used to express, impose and legitimize a power that the same images are misused in order to challenge, reject and delegitimize it' (Gamboni 1997: 27). In contrast to other Polish towns, Borne Sulinowo did not have the chance to reject its 'past' and delegitimize the communist regime through acts of public monument demolition. However, the opportunity to build their own places of memory presented itself for the newly arrived settlers. The following monuments were erected in Borne: the rock commemorating the

ceremonial opening of the town (1993), the monument commemorating victims of Nazi and Soviet totalitarianism (1998), the rock dedicated to foresters imprisoned and murdered in POW camps during World War II (2004) and the tank-statue of the Polish Army (the tank of the Soviet Army was placed there in the Soviet era). The aforementioned tank was destroyed in August 2015 by one of the inhabitants of Borne Sulinowo, who painted it blue (Borne Sulinowo n.d.). Moreover, two monuments (the so-called Polish and French) commemorating the Polish and French officers who died in Oflag II D and Oflag II B between 1940 and 1945 were erected on the territory of the former POW camps outside the town, which had constituted a part of the military base in the past. The 'Polish' monument (1998) erected by the former Home Army soldiers commemorated only the Polish prisoners of war. In response to the lack of the equivalent commemoration of the French prisoners, the second monument, supported by the French as well as the Association of the Oflags II D-II B-XX IB (Stowarzyszenie Pamięci Oflagów II D-II B-XXIB n.d), was unveiled in 2003.

Monuments form an interesting manifestation of the mutual relationship between the process of remembering and the process of forgetting. The relationship between memorials and forgetting is reciprocal: 'memorials permit only some things to be remembered and, by exclusion, cause others to be forgotten' (Connerton 1989: 29). Monuments erected during the last twenty five years of the town's civil functioning refer to the Polish past, favoring it over the German and Soviet narratives. The new monuments are supposed to testify to the earlier presence of Poles on this territory; the facts of which, as it were, the new settlers would like to remind us. The majority of the objects erected after 1993 commemorate World

War II. At the same time, this lack of older commemorations (German and Soviet) in the town space reinforces the sense of discontinuity.

However, the example that in our opinion adequately illustrates how far place-making practices are affected by political developments at the national level and how to deal with 'non-Polish' and unwanted past and its remains, was the idea of establishing a park of monuments in Borne Sulinowo. Moreover, this example reflects how three dimensions of place-making practices—symbolization, institutionalization, and commodification—intersect and complement each other.

In the parliamentary elections of 2015 the national-conservative Law and Justice party (PiS)—one of the two largest parties in the Polish parliament—managed to win a majority of seats and the party's candidate won Poland's presidency. In 2016 a bill on the de-communization of public space was passed by parliament. The Soviet sites of memory played an important role in this context. In 1989 there were 476 Red Army monuments on Polish territory, excluding the cemeteries, while 130 of them were removed by 1993 (Czarnecka 2015b: 336). In 2016 the estimated number of places of memory of the Red Army amounted to 229 (Urzykowski 2016). According to PiS policy on sites of memory, the monuments have didactic functions and they should affirm national values and heroes, and promote patriotic feelings. The symbolic value of Red Army monuments has been read by PiS as relativizing the deed of the communist rule or even glorifying communist atrocities. Although for more than the last two decades after 1989 PiS fought for the legislative de-communization of public space, for many reasons the Polish memorial landscape was ideologically incoherent—the so-called unfinished transition (Ochman 2017: 480). When the PiS party won the parliamentary

elections of 2015, another stage of the process of de-communization of public space began.

In 2016 the Institute of National Remembrance (IPN) began the process of removing Red Army monuments from Polish towns, at the same time declaring that some of the monuments could be transferred to a selected location, which could then become an educational park. The original idea of the IPN was to provide prospective visitors with the opportunity of viewing the relocated monuments as well as learning about their history and significance. In contrast to the prevailing trends in Poland at the time, the people of Borne Sulinowo expressed their interest in the 'unwanted' monuments and filed an application to the Institute of National Remembrance to establish an open air museum in the town. The authorities of Borne Sulinowo offered the representatives of the IPN two locations: the central town square for smaller monuments while the space nearby the military training ground was suggested for the larger objects for practical reasons. The representatives of the town's authorities claimed that this action occurred only in response to the inhabitants' suggestions:

Q: So, how did you consult them?

A: Well, it was like, there was a meeting with the residents, because there was a problem, I can't even remember what it was exactly. And there was also this proposal on a website. And after the meetings as well, actually on this occasion, we have the Association of Friends of Military History Borne Sulinowo and they were the inspiration to move in that direction.<sup>10</sup>

The same official commented on the Borne Sulinowo inhabitants' attitude towards the initiative in the following way:

It was not in any way formalized like, you know, questions to residents or a civic initiative; there was no such thing. But we were surprised (...) that the response of the residents turned out so positive.<sup>11</sup>

Conversations with residents generally confirmed their positive approach to the future undertaking. One of them expressed it in the following way:

Now there is this idea with the monuments of our past history, connected with the previous system, well, it would be interesting if it worked out, but there are also other ones interested in it, and it would connect with this history really nicely. (...) We need to develop this tourist base and make it more attractive, that's why I stress this thing about the monuments from the past; it's nice, it would correspond with our past, it would be attractive. We shall see, this would also probably boost the economic situation a bit and some lives would improve. 12

Interestingly, the local parson stood out as one of the most vociferous opponents of implementing the project, rejecting everything which could be classified as 'Soviet'. This suggests that opinions concerning the location of the monument park were not homogenous and both at the central as well as at the local level 'multiple understandings and images of the past co-exist and compete for space and legitimacy' (Witeska-Młynarczyk 2014: 11).

In June 2016 the Head of the National Education Office in the IPN, Andrzej Zawistowski, announced the decision on the establishment of a monument park in the former Soviet military base:

We selected Borne Sulinowo not only due to the town's history. Its local authorities have presented a consistent concept of establishing an open air museum of Red Army monuments there. Furthermore, we have encountered a positive reaction from the local MPs. (Sopińska-Jaremczak 2016)

The preliminary construction costs were estimated at two million zlotys (~ 476,200 Euros) by the IPN. The first stage of construction works was expected to end in autumn 2017 and the firsts guests to be invited then. Many inhabitants of Borne Sulinowo approved of the initiative, hoping that the park of the Soviet monuments would not only fit into the historical background of the town but also become an important tourist attraction. In sum, the symbolic 'return' of the Red Army to the former military base was perceived more in terms of new opportunities than problems by the locals. One of the local officials involved in endeavours aimed at building the park of monuments in Borne Sulinowo described this proces in the following way:

And we said that apart from the monuments we also want to show nature, incorporate this element because, as we said, it will be easier to absorb funds then. Generally, we were aiming at education so it would not be limited purely to accumulating those monuments but other benefits could emerge, that we could tell the Polish history from the Polish perspective, from September 17, 1939 until September 17, 1993. The latter date is not commonly recognized in Poland.<sup>13</sup>

Q: I understand that the idea behind it was also to emphasize the local history of Borne Sulinowo?

To incorporate it. And, at the same time, also other histories, because each of these monuments carries some local history. ... It was obvious that some of these monuments would fall apart during disassembly. And the Russian response was positive because we received e-mails that somebody in Poland, some gminas [local administrative units] appeared, which were interested in acquiring these monuments! That was something. (...) Actually, there was a press conference during which it was announced that the monuments were coming to us. We were so happy. We said, our economic conditions will improve, for the whole year, we will develop tourist-oriented infrastructure for education in different age groups (...) we will become a place where one could visit something for the whole year long. (...) We had already started making plans for how to use it and how to make it into something to stimulate the town growth. (...) And then the new authorities came. 14

In the meantime, the management of the Institute of National Remembrance was changed due to political decisions. In March 2017 the Head of IPN's President's Office, Andrzej Arseniuk, announced that the open air museum in Borne Sulinowo would not be established due to lack of funding. At the same time, Arseniuk stated that 'the idea will not be completely abandoned', but rather 'implemented in a different form' (cited in Madejski 2017a), without further details.<sup>15</sup> The mayor of Borne Sulinowo, Renata Pietkiewicz-Chmyłowska, called it a huge disappointment for the town, adding that the new management of the IPN should respect the decisions made by their predecessors. Moreover, Pietkiewicz-Chmyłowska personally believes that the

Institute of National Remembrance was wary of glorifying the monuments and the history they represent (cited in Madejski 2017b). One of the local officials stated the following:

[W]e became associated with being a 'post-Soviet' thing. And mentally, these associations, if we asked people, if we conducted any research like, 'What do you associate this with?' or 'Have you heard anything about this?' then it is always something connected with the Soviet Army. People do not know that Germans built Borne Sulinowo, that, in fact, both of the most powerful totalitarian regimes in world history had something to do with this place.<sup>16</sup>

The unaccomplished initiative revealed the impact of the state authorities' decisions on local activities, at the same time demonstrating the differences in attitude towards the Soviet symbols in the national narrative among the inhabitants and officials of Borne Sulinowo. Significantly, the idea of establishing the institution of the park of (un)wanted monuments was enthusiastically received in the former Soviet military base, primarily due to its promotional and tourism-related potential.

The concept also corresponded with the place's identity strategy, as, since the 1990s, Borne Sulinowo has been promoted on the basis of its unique history and 'untouched' nature. As a social construct a place's identity is something that is attributed to a place by people. It is something that various actors, including inhabitants can construct, shape, and reimagine. This notion plays a key role in the context of place-making practices and, for the purpose of this analysis, it is understood 'as the ideas that exist about the area known by that name' (Huigen and Meijering 2005: 19).

## B. THE NEW TOWN'S COAT OF ARMS AND PROMOTIONAL LOGOS (EMBRACING CIVILIAN AND MILITARY PAST)

In the process of symbolization it was significant to design the new town's coat of arms as well as the promotional logo for the town (tourist training ground) and the design of a logo for military-themed gatherings. The symbolism of the emblems is an attempt to find unifying elements, without which a lack of cohesion dominates. The coat of arms of Borne Sulinowo displays a green linden tree on a golden background; the linden tree refers to the German civil village named Linde, which used to be located there. Its grounds are contained within today's Lipowa Street, a small street situated in the western part of the town.<sup>17</sup> We can observe a combination of the beginnings of the German settlement with the present times: civil elements are retained, while military ones are omitted. The symbols referencing civil settlement were not accidental in the context of establishing Borne Sulinowo as a civil town in 1993 after decades of military presence on its grounds. Within a few years of Borne Sulinowo functioning as a civil town, however, it emerged that the tourist potential of the former military base consists in its natural resources and military past.

On the one hand, the promotional logos allude to the military past of the town, while, on the other, they are directed to the future which the inhabitants connect with the development of tourism. The promotional logo for Borne Sulinowo was selected in a contest organized by the Municipal Office of Borne Sulinowo in 2013 on the twentieth anniversary of its establishment. Among thirteen logotypes designed by participants from the whole country, the jury selected that by Tomasz Krążek

from Borne Sulinowo, which corresponded directly with the slogan 'Borne Sulinowo—Tourist Training Ground' (Borne Sulinowo 2013). The slogan referred to the International Gathering of Military Vehicles, 'Caterpillars and Horseshoes', as the major tourist attractions are situated in the former military training ground. The above example illustrates some specific dynamics in the place-making process which can be explained through a brief overview of the gathering's history.

As early as the 1990s the organizers of the international gathering of military vehicles had designed a separate logo for the event for promotional purposes. Military elements such as caterpillars and horseshoes were used in the logotype. The first unofficial gathering of military vehicles in Borne Sulinowo was organized in the 1990sby a group of local enthusiasts without any participation on the part of the local authorities who did, however, support many other events were organized in the town the same years. In 1994 for the first time Borne celebrated its anniversary as a civil town that year, and the director of the newly created Culture and Leisure Center held May festivities, a Midsummer Night's celebration, a 'Summer of Forest People' and many other events (Łuczak 2001: 20-34). In the course of the first years since its establishment as a civil town, consecutive anniversaries, during which the achievements of the local authorities and settlers were presented, constituted the most important and popular events in Borne. Nowadays, however, the anniversary of the town does not seem to have the same prestige as before. It is not celebrated every year, but on the 'round' anniversaries, by the decision of the town authorities. The event has significance only from the point of view of inhabitants, not tourists. Continuation of this practice springs, in fact, from the initiative of the local authorities, as

a reminder of their own legitimacy and of the founding myth of the community. As opposed to the anniversaries commemorating the establishment of the civil town, however, the popularity of the gathering of military vehicles kept growing—the first official gathering of military vehicles in Borne Sulinowo was organized in 2004. Within a few years it became apparent that it attracts the most tourists, generates the highest profits and provides the best opportunities for the promotion of Borne Sulinowo. One of the main organizers of the gathering described it in the following way:

Yeah, we've been growing incredibly, which means that this gathering is bigger every year, yeah, bigger, well, maybe for two, three years not that much, maybe it has stabilized as we're limited by the space and possibilities to host more people and equipment here but we're trying all the time to make it more attractive (...) So I think that since the second, maybe third gathering, things have changed radically; it is no longer the same event.<sup>18</sup>

In contrast to the local authorities, the organizers of the gathering made use of the town's military past and its material remnants. The scale of the event's success initiated the process of change in the authorities' and local institutions' attitude to the town's military past. Adopting the new promotional logo of the town in 2013—which corresponds with the slogan 'Borne Sulinowo—Tourist Training Ground' reinforced this change in the symbolic sphere at the level of the local authorities. This is, however, not to say that all activities undertaken by the authorities in this sphere matter for the town's inhabitants, something illustrated by the following statement of one of the employees of the local institution:

Yeah, we got this logo of Borne, I guess for the twentieth anniversary, it was the tourist training ground, the slogan was created and it has been around for a while. Visually it's also somewhere on the town's website. Our *gmina* uses this logo for different kinds of gadgets, to promote the training ground among tourists. (...) This logo was created a few years ago though and I think that the inhabitants are not very much aware of its existence, because myself I would not be able to describe it.<sup>19</sup>

Some place-making practices within the process of symbolization have thus been undertaken for outsiders, with little or no involvement by Borne's inhabitants. This fact carries some significance as all practices inform the way people negotiate meanings (Crouch 2008: 212), processes that occur simultaneously at multiple levels; furthermore, actions undertaken by different stakeholders are not always coherent and well-coordinated.

#### INSTITUTIONALIZATION

The organization of events and other activities, the establishment of permanent and temporary organizations and the building of local networks are all included in the institutionalization of place-making. Due to the multiplicity of examples (i.e. over thirty associations are currently operating in the town), we decided to focus on the local museums and the role they play in the place-making process. There are currently three museums operating within the former Soviet military base, which appears significant, taking into consideration the size of the town.

Setting up museums belongs to the category of practices of commemoration. A museum may be established in order to

exhibit what is acknowledged as the local heritage to make the community aware of what it can be proud of. Simultaneously, 'economic arguments ... have a progressive significance in heritage creation' (Peil 2005: 54). It appears that Borne Sulinowo's private museums constitute an interesting illustration of 'heritage from below' (Robertson 2008), a term that refers to ordinary people and their practices. Heritage, even when it is created in order to reconcile present with past, often becomes the object of political interest (Lowenthal 1998; see also Demski 2017). In this context, the former Soviet military base, which represents the 'non-Polish', military and unwanted past and its residue within the Polish national narrative, may serve as an example of designing alternative local trajectories, at the same time problematizing the one-dimensional character of national representations.

The first references to the need to create a museum appeared as early as the second year after the town was established when the idea of founding a Museum of Totalitarianism was mooted. However, the project was not implemented in the end (see Czarnecka 2015a: 31–32). When the resources related to the multicultural past of the place were found valuable by the tourist industry, the first museum in the town appeared, founded by a private owner. The owner arrived in Borne Sulinowo shortly after its opening and purchased one of the post-Soviet firehouses located on White Eagle Street (one of side streets), which had been erected by the Germans in the 1930s as stables. Responding to the demand of the tourist industry, he came up with the idea of opening a private museum chamber in 2000, which became the first place of that kind in Borne Sulinowo. Most post-German military exhibits were retrieved from the neighboring forests and the remains of the Soviet Army collected from the abandoned buildings of the former military base. This

quasi-museum, as it has not been entered into the register of museums and thus cannot be considered professional, displays the remnants of the two great armies (German and Soviet), providing an additional source of income for its owner and a tourist attraction. The owner offers military-style excursions and disseminates his own narratives of the place's past, which do not always adhere to historical facts. We had the chance to experience this while visiting the museum, during a conversation with its owner, who plays the role of a guide. What appears most important in this quasi-museum, however, are the artefacts themselves and how powerfully they affect the visitors, rather than the history ascribed to them. Interestingly, when we asked the town inhabitants for directions to a museum most of them indicated this place. In the imagination of the local community a private quasi-museum constitutes one of the 'key sites' (Pink 2008) in the post-military space.

Only in 2009, so relatively late, and in some kind of response to the private initiative, was the Memorial Hall created under the patronage of the town's authorities. It was placed in the former KGB building, located on Independence Avenue, in the central part of Borne Sulinowo. In accordance with the strategy adopted by the local authorities during the first years of the civil town, the major part of the exhibition is devoted to the German civil village Linde and the stories of Poles in the POW camps during World War II. The German and Soviet military periods take up little exhibition space. The post-1993 history of Borne is confined to a single interactive board, which may be related both to spatial limitations and the relatively short time span which makes it less feasible and attractive to present the last two decades. The interviews and conversations we conducted during our research reveal that the museum is visited predominantly by outside visitors and school youth. The Head

of the Memorial Hall, who is also a member of the Town Council, stresses that the museum as a professional institution should serve educational and promotional purposes: 'We wish to build our town's identity (...) Our dream is to develop the Memorial Hall into the trademark of Borne' (cited in Wełnic 2009).

The youngest institution of this type in Borne Sulinowo is the Museum of Military History, which was entered into the register of museums in 2015. It was established on the private initiative of a local entrepreneur, who is also one of the main organizers of the military vehicles' gathering. A young enthusiast from Borne Sulinowo began with a single amphibian. Gradually he started organizing paid tours in military vehicles and, with the funds acquired, as well as by working in Ireland, he developed his collection of military equipment.

The museum located on Polish Army Street (one of the minor streets at the town's entrance) is an institution established both for the 'usual' tourists and experts / enthusiasts of military hardware and history. The collections of the museum, which is under constant development, include tanks, amphibians, trucks, transporters and other military vehicles. Importantly, this equipment is not simply displayed in one place (although exhibitions are also organized) but actively used during gatherings, military picnics and historical reenactments throughout Poland. The museum rents its military vehicles to other entities. The owners recruit volunteers who look after the equipment, renovate it, and learn to drive the vehicles. The museum organizes military vehicle rides for tourists, as, quoting the organizers' words found on one of the social networks' portals, 'A dynamic museum, not a static one, is what characterizes us' (Muzeum Militarnej Historii n.d.). The Facebook fan page of the museum features increasingly sophisticated video ads (Promo

MMH n.d.) and its owner and volunteers keep actively promoting the place through hundreds of internet pictures and event descriptions. Interested people can ask questions, exchange opinions and comment on the museum owners' initiatives online, leading to the formation of a group of the museum fans. In comparison, the first private museum founded in Borne Sulinowo does not have its own website, even though the interviews we have conducted indicate that the owner advertises his place both on Polish and German websites.<sup>20</sup>

The youngest private museum in the town keeps developing, a trend confirmed by more and more elaborate exhibitions presented during the summer gathering of military vehicles, for example. This event counts as the biggest source of income for the museum because of the growing demand for military vehicle rides. However, our interviews have demonstrated that, excluding the group of volunteers who are actively involved in the activities of this private institution, the local community is not kept informed about its functioning and does not take advantage of its offerings. The inhabitants are very familiar with the owner of the private museum, his military interests and ability to use the post-military space and its material infrastructure, designed to attract tourists and generate income, yet one of the inhabitants of Borne Sulinowo stated:

The local community does not take advantage of it because it is an initiative intended mostly for outsiders who come here to attend events, festivals; it's considered a type of tourist attraction. (...) Yeah, he makes money out of it; the boy is young and resourceful, he probably also reconstructs some things. (...) Maybe he also buys stuff from Polish Army surplus stores and it's simply easier for him because

he registered this museum, he's got access to it. So, for example, when the army wants to liquidate some things then he's got priority and that's why private museums are established.<sup>21</sup>

Each of the abovementioned institutions responds to demands of a specific type of tourists. It is, however, the initiatives of the Museum of Military History that involves a significantly more numerous group of Borne Sulinowo inhabitants (most commonly as volunteers) than the other places. The probable reason for this consists not only in the vision and possibilities of the owners but also the international success of the gathering of military vehicles, through which the museum emerged and with which it remains deeply connected.

The activity of all the three museums belongs to the practices of place-making, comprising not only different narratives about the inconvenient past, but also different experiences of the same urban context; this is directly connected with the third dimension of place-making practices.

## COMMODIFICATION: MAKING ROUTES, MAKING PLACE AND MAKING SENSE OF PLACE

Commodification refers to all the goods and services through which the sense of place can be accessed, both for insiders and outsiders. Commodification, as well as heritagisation, operates within the framework of commemorating and forgetting. What is remembered usually comprises these elements which might interest people from the outside and, therefore, might 'sell' well. This is done at the expense of the elements which inspire lesser interest and, by

the same token, are increasingly relegated to the sphere of forgetting. Usually commodification is linked to the development of tourism. Tourism can be seen as a human practice through which space becomes enlivened and endowed with meanings (Massey 1994).

The landscape and natural environment of the town and municipality of Borne Sulinowo was very quickly recognized as valuable by the new settlers. This was manifested, for example, through opening of the Tourism and Economy Promotion Office of Sulinowo Municipality, as well as in coming up with the idea of 'green schools', which ultimately remained unimplemented. Both the local authorities and a significant part of the town's inhabitants see the town's future in the tourist industry. Attractions constructed with this in mind are mainly initiated with a view to profits for the local community, but apart from that, they also contribute to including Borne into supralocal tourist networks and to creating the local identity. Apart from 'untouched' nature, the tourism industry actively uses the pastnot only the German and Soviet, but also the communist one—to inspire privately organized events in 'the Polish People's Republic style', for example, or May parades<sup>22</sup> in the form of satirical happenings whose main aim is the inauguration of the tourist season. The International Gathering of Military Vehicles combines, in fact, all of the abovementioned themes, as was the case of the museums.

Bearing in mind multiple practices in which both the inhabitants of the former military base and outsiders have been involved, we decided to focus our attention on a selected example which, to our mind, accurately illustrates Margaret Rodman's idea of multi-locality. In the course of field research conducted in the former Soviet military base we realized how important the practice of creating routes and exploring by walking is for the place-making process (Lee and Ingold 2006; Pink 2008; Richardson 2005).

The local authorities charted a 13.5-km-long tourist walking route in 2010 in order to facilitate and enhance the sightseeing process for the visitors. Each tourist can walk the route independently or hire a local tour guide. The route runs through the entire Borne Sulinowo, presenting the most significant locations of the town. The initiators of the project selected twenty-one objects worth seeing.<sup>23</sup> Each is accompanied by an information board describing the object's history in three languages (Polish, German, English)<sup>24</sup> as well as a historical and contemporary photo, which enables the comparison of the past and current condition of the objects or what is left of them. The local authorities consider the selected locations significant for historical or environmental reasons. In 2016 four additional locations were marked on the route (including the one by the tank statue of the Polish Army), while the old information boards were replaced by the new ones with modified informational content. The new boards include the town map with the tourist walking route marked on it and the QR code through which smartphone owners are taken to the website featuring additional information and unique photographs illustrating the objects' history (Borne Sulinowo n.d.). Since the route and the information boards are popular among tourists, the local authorities decided to install similar boards in other locations within the whole gmina (Borniak n.d.). Importantly, the tourist walking route has been promoted on the websites of the local offices and associations as well as by the private entrepreneurs and owners of agritourism farms, who use this way to express their support for the initiative.

We have walked the route a number of times, both on our own and accompanied by visitors and local inhabitants, including representatives of the Municipal Office. One of the inhabitants of Borne Sulinowo described the local landscape and its transformations in the following way:

Well, there are only few elements here which show the authentic places from the past; I mean, the places are authentic but they look totally different. These buildings are different. Well, as we're walking here we can see these pictures, what it looked like under the German occupation, Russian occupation (...) but these objects that used to be here, for example the entry gate, they maybe could have been kept, as they stood for the past, but, well, the decisions were made as they were and there are not many authentic places.<sup>25</sup>

Every time we walked the route our embodied, multisensorial experience of the place grew more complex. Even though diverse narratives developed by those who accompanied us made us aware of the polysemic meanings of place for different users, we also noticed that visual representations in an urban context constitute, at least to some extent, shared experiences about the place. Consequently, in this context what matters is that the walkers' route is not made as a result of everyday actions and choices. Charting a walking route is a form of placemaking involved with local politics—somebody some time ago and for particular reasons decided which places were worth emphasizing and which could be omitted (one needs to remember these were individuals with knowledge of the place and its history). The combination of written texts, contemporary and past photos, and maps along the route provide instruction for tourists which points the way and suggests objects worth seeing—thus determining what to look at and what to ignore—and, finally, explains the meaning of what is seen. As the boards with texts and photos constitute an element of the environment in which the tourist participates (from the phenomenological point of view), and determine, at least to some extent, the way the visitor participates in this environment, according to Sarah Pink (2008), here we are dealing with a 'technology for place-making'.

From the phenomenological perspective, the opportunity for each visitor to experience the place and negotiate meanings enables us to understand the construction of place from multiple viewpoints, for each encounter with the place depends on the person experiencing it. In the case of following a tourist walking route, the place-making process extends beyond the simple visual practice of observing images while walking, including those indicated by the information boards. Visitors are at the same time encouraged to imagine the route and its particular exhibits in a different historical period and context, along with imagining the experience of other people in the past. 'Using visual and written representations it offers a framework for place-making but also requires that the walker participate in making place her or himself' (Pink 2008).

Taking the tourist walking route plays an important role in the place-making process, as it constitutes a practice through which the sense of place can be reached both for insiders and outsiders. Following the route enables walkers to learn and understand the values and meanings the inhabitants of Borne Sulinowo ascribe to the inconvenient, 'non-Polish' past and its artifacts. On the other hand, this practice can become a critical commentary on the transformations observable in the town and

what has been irreversibly damaged and lost. Ultimately, however, it turns out that even for people sharing certain elements of narratives dominant at a given time, and encouraged to view the same material objects or what is left of them in a similar way, place can still be made in different ways and from different perspectives, depending on the experiencing subject and his/her knowledge. 'We may conceptualize not only space as practiced, but also the body surrounded by and practiced in and through space' (Crouch 2008: 210).

#### CONCLUSION

Looking for a key to understand Borne Sulinowo, a site shaped by discontinuity, we have focused on locally produced practices. The discontinuity became a starting point for our analysis. Although discontinuity often results in disintegration or marginalization, it may also produce conditions for growth connected with the need to design new visions and strategies of development and related practices. Following Edward Casey's idea, we examined the former Soviet base as a process, something that is constantly being made and remade in accordance with its own dynamism. We assumed that the town selected for our case study can provide new insights about place and understandings how a place is made, as it differs from the majority of Polish towns with their centuries-old history in many respects. The former military base, which was transformed into a civil town within a few months of Poland's opening to the world, as well as undergoing other multi-layered and multilevel transformations, undoubtedly counts as an example that escapes generalizations.

Having analyzed in detail the placemaking practices developed by the inhabitants of an emerging heterogeneous community, we can state that in the context of settling a new territory, the development of practices proceeded through several stages (it has not finished, as yet). The first stage of entering the new territory was related to taking over, organizing and recognizing the 'alien' space and the resources which it offered, generating reflection on what could be done in the given place. In the initial stage, many of the undertaken changes and transformations were written into the mainstream of political and economic transformation in Poland. With the passage of time came reflection connected to a deeper understanding of the past of the place and gradual familiarization with it; lack of rooting caused the past, even though it was 'non-Polish' and inconvenient, to be employed for the needs of the inhabitants. On the one hand, this past and its material remains stopped being a threat and became a common good; on the other, lack of responsibility for Borne Sulinowo's past enabled the new settlers to act with a focus on the future (the inconvenient past of the place and its residue serving to achieve goals in the present). In effect, it is possible to observe a change in the valuation of placemaking practices, as compared with the early 1990s: some are losing their significance, while others are becoming more salient.

The research we have conducted proves that, even though place-making practices at the local level are affected, at least to some extent, by political developments at the national level, state authorities have not managed to monopolize the commemorative landscape since the fall of communism. This means that democratic transition has included more pluralistic understandings of power relations than only these represented by state actors. As opposed to the state level, at which striving for state-sponsored historical narratives is visible, at the local level the ambiguity and transformability of meanings that have been constructed around

the post-Soviet military base have been seen as an opportunity, not as a threat.

We also found that the place-making process in Borne Sulinowo is not established, centralized and monopolistic but rather developing, mixed and multi-centered. Different aspects of the past (i.e. non-Polish, military, inconvenient) emerge there in numerous configurations, which do not always become organized in a consistent, systematic form. Paradoxically, however, these disconnected forms attract numerous outsiders to the town, thus contributing to Borne Sulinowo's popularity and success in comparison to other post-Soviet military bases. The most recent history of the former military base (since 1993) has not so far been used for tourist and promotional purposes, yet its elements appear in the narratives of the town's inhabitants and during anniversaries of the civil town's establishment (e.g. remembering the pioneers). 'New' monuments have not appeared yet; however, the rock commemorating the ceremonial opening of the town might be viewed as a sign that, in the future, this period of the place's history and people connected with it will become more emphasized in place-making processes.

The dimensions of place-making practices we have listed—symbolization, institutionalization, commodification—do not occur separately but usually complement one another, constituting indispensable components of the majority of practices. Such practices are created by different subjects and for different purposes and can make place in different ways and from different perspectives, even when many of their aspects are common or commonly shared. In this respect, the place-making process includes insiders as well as outsiders which, in turn, offers the possibility of a deeper understanding of the multilayered nature of place-making process as well as the diverse, sometimes conflicting, often

interdependent and interconnected perspectives through which place can be understood and experienced.

#### **NOTES**

- 1 The final withdrawal of the Russian Federation Forces from Poland took place on September 18, 1993. The process of the withdrawal began with the exit of the tactical ballistic missile brigade from Borne Sulinowo on April 8, 1991. To find out more about the process of withdrawal of the Russian Federation Forces from Borne Sulinowo and some of its consequences see Czarnecka 2017.
- 2 One of the most significant results of the research concerning former Soviet military bases in CEE so far has been a special issue of *Folklore*. *Electronic Journal of Folklore* (Seljamaa, Czarnecka and Demski 2017).
- 3 Borne Sulinowo is situated less than 150 kilometers in a straight line from the Polish-German border.
- 4 Interview with J. J., Borne Sulinowo, May 2015. The initials were changed to keep interlocutors anonymous.
- 5 Interview with F. D., Borne Sulinowo, May 2016.
- 6 Interview with B.D., Borne Sulinowo, February 2015.
- 7 Interview with F. D., Borne Sulinowo, May 2016.
- 8 Jan Nowak-Jeziorański (1914–2005)—a Polish journalist, writer, politician and social worker. During World War II he served as a soldier of the Home Army. He is remembered for his work as emissary, 'Courier from Warsaw' shuttling between the commanders of the Home Army and the Polish Government in Exile in London and other Allied governments. After the war he led the Polish section of Radio Free Europe, and later he worked as a security advisor to the US presidents, Roland Reagan and Jimmy Carter.
- 9 'Ideological vesture is a certain form of history interpretation—sometimes radically different from the previous one—and presumes its reading within a particular paradigm. It consists in shaping the social memory and shaping social oblivion towards the symbols considered foreign and hostile' (Zieliński 2007: 11).
- 10 Interview with F. D., Borne Sulinowo, August 2018.
- 11 Ibid.

- 12 Interview with D. A., Borne Sulinowo, May 2016. In the quoted fragment the interlocutor mentioned Czerwony Bór, the location in North-East Poland which competed with Borne Sulinowo in a contest for the location of the park of monuments on its premises.
- 13 The interlocutor meant the date of September 18, 1993, namely the day of the final withdrawal of the Russian Federation Forces from Poland.
- 14 Interview with F. D., Borne Sulinowo, August 2018.
- 15 Currently, the disassembled monuments of the Red Army soldiers are transported to Podborsk near Białogard (zachodniopomorskie voivodship) where the Museum of the Cold War was established in 2016 (Muzeum Oręża Polskiego w Kołobrzegu n.d.). In the socialist period Podborsko was one of the three locations in Poland where Soviet atomic weapons were stored (Czarnecka 2017: 125).
- 16 Interview with F. D., Borne Sulinowo, August 2018.
- 17 The name of the civil settlement Linde and the Lipowa Street are connected. They both originate from the word 'linden' (German: Linde). Lipowa Street was the main street in Linde and is now the oldest (one of side ones) street of Borne Sulinowo.
- 18 Interview with J. J., Borne Sulinowo, May 2016.
- 19 Interview with K. D., Borne Sulinowo, February 2016.
- 20 Interview with M. A., Borne Sulinowo, February 2015.
- 21 Interview with F. D., Borne Sulinowo, August 2018.
- 22 May Day parade—in the countries of the former Eastern Bloc it was a manifestation organized on May 1, considered by the communists as one of the most important public holidays.
- 23 The following twenty one objects were selected:

  1) Municipal Office building, which used to be the garrison's German and then Russian headquarters; b) the square outside the Municipal Office, former ground for military drill and army inspections; 3) former officers' canteen; 4) former military hospital (the largest building in town); 5) entry gate to Borne Sulinowo from Łubowo's direction, demolished after the Soviet Army's withdrawal; 6) rail ramp, the railway track to Borne was disassembled after 1993; 7) former military warehouses; 8) former headquarters of the military firehouse; 9) sports airport,

former military airport; 10) residential district of 'Leningrad' apartment blocks; 11) square between Konopnicka Street and Chopin Street, former drill ground; 12) entry gate to Borne from the Szczecinek direction, disassembled in 1995; 13) Soldier's House, in front of which Lenin's statue on a stately pedestal used to be placed; the building was demolished a few years ago; 14) cultural and educational building, used to house the soldiers' canteen before the war and a small memorial hall in the Soviet era; 15) sports hall; 16) Saint Albert's Church, located in the former German canteen and a Russian-built room, which was used as a movie theatre; 17) former military prison building; 18) Officer's House, used for official events and gatherings in German times and housing the Garrison Officer's House in the Soviet era, including a concert hall, library, movie theatre, dancing parlour and restaurant. In 2010 a fire broke out in the building, which destroyed the concert hall and many other rooms; 19) remnants of general Heinz Guderian's villa; 20) General Wiktor Dubynin's villa; 21) 'Głowa Orla' peninsula, that is the peninsula situated by Pile lake shaped like an eagle's head.

- 24 When we asked one of the representatives of the local authorities why there were no names on the boards translated into Russian, he answered that the municipal authorities considered this option, but in the end it was agreed that it is the English language that counts as it is commonly used and understood. Moreover, the official explained that the presence of Russian inscriptions could generate discussion about the lack of Ukrainian and Belarussian ones.
- 25 Interview with D. A., Borne Sulinowo, May 2016.

### REFERENCES

Andrusz, Gregory, Michael Harloc and Ivan Szelenyi (eds) 1996. Cities after Socialism: Urban and Regional Change and Conflict in Post-socialist Societies. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

Anonymous author 1996. Moreny: Gazeta Krainy Jezior i Lasów ('Moreny: The Paper of the Land of Lakes and Forests') No. 3.

**Atkinson, Paul and Martyn Hammersley** 1994. Ethnography and Participant Observation. In

Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincoln (eds). *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

**Borne Sulinowo** 2013. Protokół z konkursu ('Contest Report'). http://www.bornesulinowo.pl/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/wynik-konkursu-logo.pdf. <accessed 1 February 2019>

Borne Sulinowo n.d. Oficjalna strona Urzędu Miasta w Bornem Sulinowie ('The Official Website of the City Hall in Borne Sulinowo'). http://www.bornesulinowo.pl/?page\_id=88. <accessed 1 February 2019>

**Borniak** n.d. Wirtualny Fanklub Bornego Sulinowa. http://borniak.com/2016/06/30/tablice-na-sciezce-turystyczno-spacerowej-w-bornem-sulinowiegotowe/. <accessed 2 February 2018>

Casey, Edward 1996. How to Get from Space in a Fairly Short Stretch of Time: Phenomenological Prolegomena. In Steven Feld and Keith H. Basso (eds). *Senses of Place*. Santa Fe: School of American Research Press.

**Connerton, Paul** 1989. *How Societies Remember*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

**Crouch, David** 2008. Surrounded by Place: Embodied Encounters. In Simon Coleman and Mike Crang (eds). *Tourism. Between Place and Performance*. New York: Berghahn Books.

Csurgó, Bernadett and Boldizsár Megyesi 2016. The Role of Small Towns in Local Place Making. *European Countryside* 8 (4): 427–443. https://doi.org/10.1515/euco-2016-0029.

Czaplicka, John, Nida M. Gelazis, Blair A. Ruble 2009. Cities After the Fall of Communism: Reshaping Cultural Landscapes and European Identity. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.

**Czarnecka, Dominika** 2015a. Making Sense of the Past: (Re)constructing the Local Memorial Landscape in the Post-Soviet Base in Poland. *Journal of Ethnology and Folkloristics* 9 (2): 21–40.

Czarnecka, Dominika 2015b. 'Pomniki wdzięczności' Armii Czerwonej w Polsce Ludowej i w III Rzeczypospolitej ('Monuments of Gratitude to the Red Army in Polish People's Republic and the Third Republic of Poland'). Warszawa: Wydawnictwo IPN.

**Czarnecka, Dominika** 2017. The 'Degraded' Landscape of a Post-Soviet Military Base in Poland: Outside vs. Inside View. *Folklore: Electronic Journal of Folklore* 70: 121–148.

https://doi.org/10.7592/FEJF2017.70.czarnecka.

**Demski, Dagnosław and Dominika Czarnecka** 2015. Mapping Meanings in the Post-Soviet Landscape of Borne Sulinowo. *Latvijas Vēstures Institūta Žurnāls* 95 (2): 96–120.

**Demski, Dagnosław** 2017. Values, Substantiality, and Passage of Time: Representations and Reinterpretations of Military Heritage. *Folklore: Electronic Journal of Folklore* 70: 171–192.

https://doi.org/10.7592/FEJF2017.70.demski.

**Dwyer, Owen and Derek Alderman** 2008. Memorial Landscapes: Analytic Questions and Metaphors. *GeoJournal* 73: 165–78.

https://doi.org/10.1007/s10708-008-9201-5.

**Feld, Steven and Keith H. Basso** (eds) 1996. *Senses of Place*. Santa Fe: School of American Research Press.

Gamboni, Dario 1997. Iconoclasm and Vandalism since the French Revolution. London: Reaktion Books.

Hammersley, Martyn and Paul Atkinson 1995. Ethnography: Practices and Principles. Second Edition. New York: Routledge.

Huigen, Paulus and Louise Meijering 2005. Making Places: A Story of De Venen. In Gregory Ashworth and Brian Graham (eds). Senses of Place: Senses of Time (Heritage, Culture and Identity). Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Company.

**Lee, Jo and Tim Ingold** 2006. Fieldwork on Foot: Perceiving, Routing, Socializing. In Simon M. Coleman and Peter Collins (eds). *Locating the Field: Space, Place and Context in Anthropology*. Oxford: Berg.

**Lowenthal, David** 1998. *The Heritage Crusade and the Spoils of History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

**Łuczak, Mirosława** 2001. *Jest takie miejsce*.... ('There Is Such a Place...'). Koszalin and Borne Sulinowo: Koszalińska Biblioteka Publiczna.

Madejski, Tobiasz 2017a. Borne Sulinowo bez skansenu radzieckich pomników (Borne Sulinowo

Without a Park of the Soviet Monuments'). Radio Szczecin, 29 March.

http://radioszczecin.pl/1,351747,borne-sulinowobez-skansenu-radzieckich-pomnikow. <accessed 1 February 2019>

Madejski, Tobiasz 2017b. Skansen nie powstanie: Jest komentarz burmistrz Bornego Sulinowa ('A Park of monuments Will not be Founded: Commentary of the Mayor of Borne Sulinowo'). Radio Szczecin, 29 March.

http://radioszczecin.pl/1,351775,skansen-nie-powstanie-jest-komentarz-burmistrz-b. <accessed 1 February 2019>

**Massey, Doreen** 1994. *Space, Place and Gender.* St. Paul: Minnesota University Press.

Mendel, Maria 2010. Tożsamość zbiorowa jako lokalność ('Collective identity as locality'). In Maria Mendel and Alicja Zbierzchowska (eds), *Tożsamość gdańszczan: Budowanie na (nie)pamięci* ('Gdańsk inhabitants' identity: Building on (non)memory'). Gdańsk: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Gdańskiego.

Muzeum Militarnej Historii n.d. Muzeum Militarnej Historii w Bornem Sulinowie. https://www.facebook.com/muzeum.borne. sulinowo/. <1 February 2019>.

Muzeum Oręża Polskiego w Kołobrzegu n.d. Muzeum Zimnej Wojny Podborsko. http://www.muzeum.kolobrzeg.pl/pl/muzeum/muzeum-zimnej-wojny/. <accessed 1 February 2019>

Nijakowski, Lech M. 2010. Regionalne zróżnicowanie pamięci o II wojnie światowej ('Regional Diversification of the Memory About the Second World War'). In Piotr T. Kwiatkowski, Lech M. Nijakowski, Barbara Szacka and Andrzej Szpociński (eds). Między codziennością a wielką historią. Druga wojna światowa w pamięci zbiorowej społeczeństwa polskiego ('Between Everyday Life and World History: The Second World War in the Collective Memory of the Polish Population'). Gdańsk and Warszawa: Scholar.

Nora, Pierre 2004. Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire. In Vanessa R. Schwartz and Jeannene M. Przybylski (eds). *The Nineteenth-Century Visual Culture Reader*. New York: Routledge. **Ochman, Ewa** 2017. Spaces of Nationhood and Contestet Soviet War Monuments in Poland: The Warsaw Monument to the Brotherhood in Arms. In Berber Bevernage and Nico Wouters (eds). *The Palgrave Handbook of State-Sponsored History After* 1945. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillian.

**Peil, Tiina** 2005. Estonian Heritage Connections—People, Past and Place: The Pakri Peninsula. *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 11 (1): 53–65. https://doi.org/10.1080/13527250500037021.

**Peil, Tiina** 2006. 'Maps of Meaning': Landscapes on the map and in the mind—discovering Paldiski, Estonia. *Norsk Geografisk Tidsskrift—Norwegian Journal of Geography* 60 (1): 110–122. https://doi.org/10.1080/00291950500535244.

**Pink, Sarah** 2008. Mobilising Visual Ethnography: Making Routes, Making Place and Making Images. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 9 (3). http://dx.doi.org/10.17169/fqs-9.3.1166.

Pink, Sarah 2009. Etnografia wizualna: Obrazy, media i przedstawienie w badaniach ('Doing Visual Ethnography: Images, Media and Representation in Research'). Kraków: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego.

**Polska w liczbach** n.d. Borne Sulinowo ('Poland in Numbers—Borne Sulinowo'). http://www.polskawliczbach.pl/Borne\_Sulinowo. <accessed 1 February 2019>

**Promo MMH.** Promotional Video of the Museum of Military History.

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DBasMdKB-Qs. <accessed 1 February 2018>

**Richardson, Tanya** 2005. Walking Streets, Talking History: The Making of Odessa. *Ethnology* 44 (1): 13–33. https://doi.org/10.2307/3773957.

**Robertson, Iain** (ed.) 2012. *Heritage from Below*. Farnham and Burlington: Ashgate.

**Rodman, Margaret** 2003. Empowering place: Multivocality and multilocality. In Setha Low and Denise Lawrence-Zuniga (eds). *The Anthropology of Space and Place: Locating culture*. Oxford: Blackwell.

**Sandberg, Marie** 2016. Reconstructing Locality: Practice, Identity and Place-making on the German-Polish Border. *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and* 

Power 23(1): 66–83. https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289X.2015.1016523.

Seljamaa, Elo-Hanna, Dominika Czarnecka and Dagnosław Demski (eds.) 2017. Special Issue: Small Places, Large Issues. *Folklore: Eletronic Journal of Folklore* 70. https://www.folklore.ee/folklore/vol70/. <accessed 1 February 2019>

Sopińska-Jaremczak, Agnieszka 2016. 229 sowieckich pomików powinno znaleźć się w skansenie IPN w Bornem-Sulinowie ('229 Soviet Monuments Should be Removed to the IPN's Park in Borne Sulinowo'). Instiytut Pamięci Narodowej. https://ipn.gov.pl/pl/dla-mediow/komunikaty/33187,229-sowieckich-pomnikow-powinno-znalezc-sie-w-skansenie-IPN-w-Bornem-Sulinowie.html. <accessed 1 February 2019>

**Stanilov, Kiril** (ed.) 2007. The Post-socialist City: Urban Form and Space Transformations in Central and Eastern Europe after Socialism. Dordrecht: Springer.

## **Stowarzyszenie Pamięci Oflagów II D-II B-XXIB** n.d. Website.

http://s225821866.onlinehome.fr/ TEMOIGNAGES\_aujourdhui4\_pl.php. <accessed 1 February>

Urzykowski, Tomasz 2016. IPN i muzeum chcą przejąć pomnik 'czterech śpiących' ('IPN and the Museum Want to Repossess The monument to the Four Sleepers'). *Gazeta Wyborcza*. http://warszawa.wyborcza.pl/warszawa/1,34862,20350998,ipn-i-muzeum-chcaprzejac-pomnik-czterech-spiacychmiasto.html. <accessed 1 February 2019>

Wanner, Catherine 2016. The Return of Czernowitz: Urban Affect, Nostalgia, and the Politics of Placemaking in a European Borderland City. *City & Society* 28 (2): 198–221. https://doi.org/10.1111/ciso.12081.

Wełnic, Rajmund 2009. Muzeum w Bornem Sulinowie już jest. Militarne dzieje na wystawie ('There is a museum in Borne Sulinowo. Military past on display'). GK24.pl. http://www.gk24.pl/wiadomosci/szczecinek/art/4358757,muzeum-w-bornem-sulinowie-juz-jest-militarne-dzieje-na-wystawie,id,t.html. <accessed 1 February 2019>

Whitehouse, Harvey 2005. Emotion, Memory and Religious Rituals: An Assessment of Two Theories.

In Kay Milton and Maruška Svašek (eds). *Mixed Emotions: Anthropological Studies of Feeling*. Oxford: Berg.

Witeska-Młynarczyk, Anna 2014. Evoking Polish Memory: State, Self and the Communist Past in Transition. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.

Zieliński, Florian 2007. Szata ideologiczna miasta—architektura i strój ('Ideological Vesture of a City—Architecture and Costume'). In Marek Krajewski (ed.). Wizualność miasta. Wytwarzanie miejskiej ikonosfery ('Visuality of a City. Creation of Urban Iconosphere'). Poznań: Wydawnictwo Naukowe UAM.

DAGNOSŁAW DEMSKI ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR INSTITUTE OF ARCHAEOLOGY AND ETHNOLOGY, POLISH ACADEMY OF SCIENCES d.demski2@gmail.com

DOMINIKA CZARNECKA INSTITUTE OF ARCHAEOLOGY AND ETHNOLOGY POLISH ACADEMY OF SCIENCES d.czarnecka@hotmail.com